

Critical Notice of Published Articles in [Environmental Ethics](#)

Holmes Rolston, III

For the books *Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World*, *Conserving Natural Value*, and *A New Environmental Ethics: The Next Millennium for Life on Earth* see separate files.

Van Rensselaer Potter (Bioscience, University of Wisconsin) in "Evolving Ethical Concepts" favorably cites, reviews, and quotes, "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in *BioScience*, introducing a special issue on the environment, April, 1977, 27:251-253. He also cites "Philosophical Aspects of the Environmental Crisis."

Nicholas Rescher (Philosophy, University of Pittsburgh) cites and quotes as "elegantly formulated" an argument used in "Is There an Ecological Ethic?"--"Why Save Endangered Species?" in *Unpopular Essays on Technological Progress* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1980), pp. 79-92 and p. 112.

William K. Frankena (Philosophy, University of Michigan) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as being "very helpful, perceptive, and stimulating" although he critiques it as being too radical. "Ethics and the Environment" (see next entry). Also in the Chinese translation in *Zhexue Yicong (Philosophy Digest of Translation)*, (Journal of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Institute of Philosophy, Beijing, Issue No. 5 (Sept. 1994):5-10, citations passim.

K. E. Goodpaster (Philosophy, Business, Harvard University) also cites this essay as being helpful, but criticizes it as being not radical enough. "From Egoism to Environmentalism." These two essays (Frankena and Goodpaster) are the opening essays in K. E. Goodpaster and K. M. Sayre, *Ethics and Problems of the 21st Century* (Notre Dame, Ind., University of Notre Dame Press, 1979). Rolston is quoted and/or cited a dozen times in these two discussions.

William K. Frankena (Philosophy, University of Michigan) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as being an "eloquent and perceptive argument." "The Ethics of Respect for Life," in Owsie Temken, William K. Frankena, Sanford H. Kadish, *Respect for Life in Medicine, Philosophy, and the Law* (Baltimore, Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976), p. 62.

Tom Regan (Philosophy, North Carolina State University) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in *All That Dwell Therein: Essays on Animal Rights and Environmental Ethics* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1982), p. 186, p. 236.

Robert Elliot (Philosophy, Brisbane College, Australia) cites and discusses "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Why Preserve Species?" in Don Mannison, Michael McRobbie, Richard Routley, eds., *Environmental Philosophy* (Canberra: Australian National University, Research School of Social Sciences, 1980), p. 22f.

H. J. McCloskey (Philosophy, LaTrobe University, Victoria, Australia) cites and discusses

"Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Ecological Ethics and Its Justification: A Critical Appraisal," in Mannison, et al., *Environmental Philosophy*, p. 69. (See above.)

Stephen R. L. Clark (Philosophy, University of Liverpool) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Morals, Moore, and MacIntyre," in a symposium on Alasdair MacIntyre's *After Virtue*. *Inquiry* 26(1983):425-445, citation on p. 445.

Genevieve Lloyd (Philosophy, Australian National University, Canberra) says that Rolston has "dissected what requirements would have to be met by an ethic that was 'genuinely ecological'...which treats the non-human as in themselves the proper objects of moral concern." She quotes "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" several times in this discussion. "Spinoza's Environmental Ethics," *Inquiry* 23(1980):293-311, citations on p. 301f, 305, p. 308, p. 311.

K. S. Shrader-Frechette (Environmental Studies and Philosophy of Science, University of California, Santa Barbara) quotes and cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in *Environmental Ethics* (Pacific Grove, CA: Boxwood Press, 1981), pp. 18, 24, 27, 43, 44, 56, 98, 99, 153.

Don E. Marietta, Jr. (Philosophy, Florida Atlantic University) summarizes "Is There an Ecological Ethic?", quoting from it, as recognizing the possibility of a new approach to environmental ethics. See "The Interrelationship of Ecological Science and Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 1(1979):195-207, passim.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University College, Cardiff, Wales) cites, critiques, and references "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" several times in *The Ethics of Environmental Concern* (New York: Columbia University Press and Oxford: Basil Blackwell Publishers, 1983), p. 66, 156, 164, 182, 201.

David R. Biggins (School of Science, Griffith University, Nathan, Queensland, Australia) cites an argument from "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Scientific Knowledge and Values: Imperatives in Ecology," *Ethics in Science and Medicine* (Great Britain) 6(1979)49-57, citation on pp. 55, 57.

Ernest Partridge (Center for the Study of Value and Social Policy, University of Colorado) cites a passage from "Values in Nature" as the heading to his article, "Nature as a Moral Resource," *Environmental Ethics* 6(1984):101-130, citation on p. 101. He further cites "Values in Nature," p. 126 as making an "eloquent statement" of how personal egos fade in the ecosystemic point of view. Partridge also cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?", p. 105, p. 127, and, extensively, p. 128.

Bryan G. Norton (Center for Philosophy and Public Policy, University of Maryland) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Can and Ought We To Follow Nature?" in "Environmental Ethics and Weak Anthropocentrism," *Environmental Ethics* 6(1984):131-148, citations on p. 132, 135. Also in Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler, eds., *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1993), pp. 286-289, citation on p. 288.

Eugene C. Hargrove (Philosophy, University of Georgia) cites and quotes "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" essay in "The Historical Foundations of American Environmental Attitudes," *Environmental Ethics* 1(1979):211.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites and quotes "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Elements of an Environmental Ethic: Moral Considerability of the Biotic Community," *Environmental Ethics*, 1(1979):72. Also in *In Defense of the Land*

Ethic (Buffalo: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. 278.

Tom L. Beauchamp (Philosophy, Georgetown University) and Norman E. Bowie (Philosophy, University of Delaware) reference "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as a selected reading on "Environmental Responsibility" in *Ethical Theory and Business* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1979), p. 581.

William T. Blackstone (Philosophy, University of Georgia) cites Rolston's position in "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as an advanced environmental ethic (which he does not fully share) in "The Search for an Environmental Ethic" in Tom Regan, ed., *Matters of Life and Death, New Introductory Essays in Moral Philosophy* (New York: Random House, 1980), p. 329, 334.

Edward Johnson (Philosophy, University of New Orleans) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Treating the Dirt," in Tom Regan, ed., *Earthbound: New Introductory Essays in Environmental Ethics* (New York: Random House, 1984), p. 353, p. 362.

William Aiken (Philosophy, Chatham College) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as "an interesting, influential discussion" of an "eco-holism" and quotes from "Can and Ought We To Follow Nature?" as an example of a view of nature that "commands nature by obeying her." "Ethical Issues in Agriculture," in Tom Regan, ed., *Earthbound: New Introductory Essays in Environmental Ethics* (New York: Random House, 1984), p. 268, 270, 271, 287.

James S. Bowman (Political Science, University of Wyoming) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as proposing a new environmental ethic, and finds considerable support for such an ethic in surveys of recent public opinion, especially among young adults. "Public Opinion and the Environment," in *Environment and Behavior* 9(1977):385-416, citations on p. 397, 416.

Dieter Birnbacher (Philosophy, University of Essen, Germany) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "A Priority Rule for Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 4(1982):3-16, citations on p. 10, p. 16, employing the distinction between primary and secondary environmental ethics.

Peter Suedfeld (Department of Psychology, University of British Columbia) quotes and discusses "Lake Solitude: The Individual in Wildness" in analysis of the psychological benefits of solitude in *Restricted Environmental Stimulation* (New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1980), p. 211, p. 479. (Wiley Series on Personality Processes)

Paul W. Taylor (Philosophy, Brooklyn College, City University of New York) quotes and cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in his discussion of William Frankena's criticism of Rolston's position in "Frankena on Environmental Ethics," *Monist* 64(1981):313-324, citations on p. 321.

Peter Miller (Philosophy, University of Winnipeg, Canada) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in "Value as Richness: Toward a Value Theory for an Expanded Naturalism in Environmental Ethics," in *Environmental Ethics* 4(1982):101-114, citation on p. 103.

Peter Miller in the above article also says, "The writings of Holmes Rolston, III are particularly illuminating on psychological and spiritual values in nature," citing "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" and "Values in Nature," p. 112.

Donald Scherer (Philosophy, University of Bowling Green, Ohio) cites "Is There an

Ecological Ethic?" as a "crystalizing article" in formulating subsequent discussion of the nature and possibility of an environmental ethic, in "Anthropocentrism, Atomism, and Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 4(1982):115-123, citation on p. 115.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) says, "In a seminal discussion, Holmes Rolston, III provided a clear statement of the *fact/value* problem as it applies to environmental ethics and explored a conceptual framework for its solution, . . . and he has developed this approach more fully in two subsequent articles." He cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?", "Values in Nature," and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in "Hume's *Is/Ought* Dichotomy and the Relation of Ecology to Leopold's Land Ethic," *Environmental Ethics* 4(1982):163-174, citation on p. 163. Also in *In Defense of the Land Ethic* (Buffalo: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. 118, p. 286.

Manuel G. Velasquez (Philosophy, University of Santa Clara, California) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in Chapter 5, "Ethics and the Environment," *Business Ethics: Concepts and Cases* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, Inc., 1982), p. 189. (2nd edition, 1988), p. 237.

Karen J. Warren (Philosophy, St. Olaf College, Northfield, MN) says in reviewing the anthology by Scherer and Attig, eds., *Ethics and the Environment*, "The inclusion of Holmes Rolston's essay, 'Is There an Ecological Ethic?' and J. Baird Callicott's, 'Animal Liberation: A Triangular Affair,' both well-known and excellent defenses of Leopoldian holistic ethics, seems almost mandated by the topic," making the collection a "first-rate anthology." Review in *Environmental Ethics* 6(1984):277-282, citation on p. 280f.

Harold W. Steinhoff (Colorado Extension Service) cites "Values in Nature" and compares the categories of value there with eleven other attempts to classify values associated with nature in "An Analysis of Major Conceptual Systems for Understanding and Measuring Wildlife Values," in William W. Shaw and Ervin H. Zube, eds., *Wildlife Values* (Fort Collins, CO: Rocky Mountain Forest and Range Experiment Station, Center for Assessment of Noncommodity Natural Resource Values, Report No. 1, November 1980), pp. 11-21, citations p. 13, p. 114.

Charles Y. DeKnatel (Regional Planning, University of Nebraska) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Questions About Environmental Ethics--Toward a Research Agenda with a Focus on Public Policy" in *Environmental Ethics* 2(1980):353-362, citation on p. 357, as raising several major issues and questions involving the content of environmental ethics.

Ian G. Barbour (Physics, Theology at Carleton College) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic" in his chapter on "Environmental Values" in *Technology, Environment, and Human Values* (New York: Praeger Publishers, 1980), p. 105.

William Godfrey-Smith (Philosophy, Australian National University, Canberra) cites and discusses "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "The Rights of Non-Humans and Intrinsic Values," in Don Mannison, Michael McRobbie, Richard Routley, eds., *Environmental Philosophy* (Canberra: Australian National University, Research School of Social Sciences, 1980), p. 32, p. 45f.

John Lemons (Environmental Studies, New England College) quotes and cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Cooperation and Stability as a Basis for Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 3(1981):219-230, on p. 219f.

Van Rensselaer Potter (Biology, University of Wisconsin) cites and quotes from "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and from "Philosophical Aspects of the Environment" in "Bioethics and the Human Prospect," in D. H. Brock, ed., *Studies in Science and Culture, Volume 1*,

The Culture of BioMedicine, citations on p. 131, 132, 133, 134, 137.

Kent D. Shifford (History, Northland College, Wisconsin) and Frank N. Egerton (History, University of Wisconsin--Parkside) assess "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" as "a profound examination of the cliché, 'Nature should be our guide.'... This essay is helpful in helping students see how philosophers think about complex questions in environmental ethics and in sorting out basic starting positions." In *Environmental Review*, Bibliographic Supplement III, 1979-80, p. 8.

P. Aarne Vesilind (Duke University Environmental Center) offers critical comment on this essay in *Environmental Ethics* 1(1979):379.

Leonard E. Reed appraises the article on "The Pasqueflower" as "a masterpiece of nature writing" in *Seeds of Progress* (Irvington-on-Hudson, New York: Foundation for Economic Freedom, Inc., 1980), p. 56.

Dolores LaChapelle, (Fort Lewis College, Durango, CO) cites and quotes extensively from "Hewn and Cleft from this Rock" in *Earth Wisdom* (Los Angeles: Guild of Tutors Press, 1978), p. 30.

"The Pasqueflower" is cited in *Current Advances in Plant Science*, vol. 11, No. 11, Nov. 1979, p. 1907, No 135496.

Pamela Olsen (Psychology, University of Pittsburgh) cites Rolston's work as that of a philosopher who has "contributed much to our understanding of the meaning and value of wilderness." *Wilderness Psychology Newsletter*, vol. 6, no. 3, October 1982, p. 6.

William Aiken (Philosophy, Chatham College) says of "The River of Life: Past, Present, and Future" in Ernest Partridge, *Responsibilities to Future Generations*, "Of the original essays in this volume, I find Holmes Rolston's exploration of metaphor in 'The River of Life: Past, Present, and Future' to be rich and stimulating." Review in *Teaching Philosophy* 5(1982):360-363, citation on p. 361. This anthology is in use at about 35 colleges and universities.

Robert Elliot (Philosophy, Brisbane College, Australia) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" noting how "Holmes Rolston has discussed at length the way in which an understanding and appreciation of ecology generates new values. He does not claim that ecology reveals values previously unnoticed, but rather that the understanding of the complexity, diversity, and integration of the natural world which ecology affords us, opens up a new area of valuation. As the facts are uncovered, the values are generated. What the remarks of . . . Rolston highlight is the judgmental factor which is present in environmental appraisal." "Faking Nature," *Inquiry* 25(1982):81-93, citation on p. 91. Also in Robert Elliot, ed., *Environmental Ethics* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), p. 87.

Donald Scherer and Thomas Attig include "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in their anthology, *Ethics and the Environment* (Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice Hall, 1983), pp. 41-54. "Can and Ought We To Follow Nature?" is cited in their selected bibliography, p. 236, and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" is cited by Scherer in a discussion, p. 74, on defining an environmental ethic.

Eric Katz and Susan Barbash cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Can and Ought We To Follow Nature?" in "Environmental Ethics and Consumer Choice," *Humboldt Journal of Social Relations* 8(1982):142-160, citations on p. 155, pp. 157-58.

William Godfrey Smith (Philosophy, Australian National University, Canberra) says of

"Values in Nature," "Rolston provides a valuable and readable account of the ways in which we recognize values in nature. . . . One significant and under-stressed 'scientific' value which he includes arises from the fact that natural areas may be repositories of traces of important historical fact, the presence of which we may not yet have developed the skills to discern (at the molecular, or whatever, level at which the information is stored). Destruction or drastic modification of natural areas may thus be likened in some ways to the destruction of a library whose contents are in a language which we cannot yet read." Smith also cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" Review of Robert C. Schultz and J. Donald Hughes, eds. *Ecological Consciousness: Essays from the Earthday X Colloquium in Environmental Ethics* 5(1983):355-359, citations on p. 359.

George Sessions (Philosophy, Sierra College) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as "an influential paper," together with "Can and Ought We To Follow Nature?" in a review of recent trends in environmental ethics. See "Shallow and Deep Ecology: A Review of the Literature," in Robert C. Schultz and J. Donald Hughes, eds., *Ecological Consciousness: Essays from the Earthday X Colloquium*, pp. 391-462, citations on p. 411, 452.

Janna L. Thompson (Philosophy, La Trobe University, Melbourne) cites and quotes "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Preservation of Wilderness and the Good Life" in Robert Elliot and Arran Gare, eds., *Environmental Philosophy* (St. Lucia and London, University of Queensland Press and University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1983), pp. 85-105, citations on p. 87, p. 97f, p. 103f.

Robert Elliot (Philosophy, Brisbane College, Brisbane, Australia) and Aaron Gare (Philosophy, University of Queensland, Australia) cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in a select bibliography of articles on environmental ethics, Elliot and Gare, eds., *Environmental Philosophy*, p. 303. (See above.)

Allen Carlson (Philosophy, University of Alberta) analyzes "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Can and Ought We To Follow Nature?" repeatedly in "Nature and Positive Aesthetics," *Environmental Ethics* 6(1984):5-34. Rolston is quoted or cited appreciatively a half dozen times in his discussion. Reprinted in Allen Carlson and Sheila Lintott, eds., *Nature, Aesthetics, and Environmentalism: From Beauty to Duty* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2008), pp. 211-237.

Donald H. Regan (Law, University of Michigan Law School) cites "Values in Nature" in "Duties of Preservation," Working Paper PS-1, Center for Philosophy and Public Policy, January 1983, also in Bryan G. Norton, ed., *The Preservation of Species* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1986).

James D. Heffernan (Philosophy, University of the Pacific, Stockton, CA) cites, "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as "an important contribution" to environmental ethics. "The Land Ethic: A Critical Appraisal," *Environmental Ethics* 4(1982):235-247, citation on p. 236. Also in Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler, eds., *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1993), pp. 398-405, citation on p. 398.

Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler cite "In Defense of Ecosystems" as "a nontechnical introduction to ecosystems and the human basis of valuing them, and to ecocentric ethics. In Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler, eds., *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1993), p. 428.

Don E. Marietta, Jr. (Philosophy, Florida Atlantic University) cites and quotes, "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as a new approach to environmental ethics, deriving insight from the science of ecology. "Knowledge and Obligation in Environmental Ethics: A

Phenomenological Approach," *Environmental Ethics* 4(1982):153-162, citation on p.153.

Lloyd Reinhart (Philosophy, Sydney University, Australia) says of "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" that Rolston's "main line of argument is plausible, namely that when the facts are in, in sciences such as biology and ecology, the gap between fact and values seems much narrower and may tend to disappear completely." Review of Elliot and Gare, *Environmental Philosophy* in *Australasian Journal of Philosophy* 62(1984):426-429, citation on p. 428.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University College, Cardiff, Wales) says of "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" that Rolston "has elaborated a principle which could form a subordinate part of a defensible ethical system," and offers further critical comments on Rolston's position. Attfield also cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" In "Value in the Wilderness," *Metaphilosophy* 15(1984):289-304, discussion on p. 297-300.

Martin Wachs (Urban Planning, University of California, Los Angeles) includes "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in an anthology on urban planning, *Ethics in Planning* (New Brunswick, NJ: Center for Urban Policy Research, Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey, 1985), pp. 299-317.

Jeff Cox (Editorial Staff, *Organic Gardening*) quotes "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in an editorial, "In the Know," in *Organic Gardening* 31, no. 8 (August 1984): 70-71.

Richard A. Wasserstrom (Philosophy, University of California, Santa Cruz) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in a select short bibliography on humans and the nonhuman environment in *Today's Moral Problems*, 3rd ed. (New York: Macmillan, 1985), p. 563.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) says, "A clear and original statement of the centrality of the conceptual problem of a non-anthropocentric axiology for environmental ethics may be found in Holmes Rolston, III, "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" "Non-Anthropocentric Value Theory and Environmental Ethics," *American Philosophical Quarterly* 21(1984):299-309, citation on p. 306.

Charles M. Haynes (Chief, Aquatic Nongame Research, Colorado Division of Wildlife) quotes several times from "Duties to Endangered Species" in "Further Reflections on Nongame Wildlife," *Colorado Outdoors* (Colorado Department of Natural Resources) 34, no. 4 (July-August 1985): 1-4.

Ernest Partridge (Philosophy, Center for the Study of Values and Social Policy, University of Colorado) uses "Holmes Rolston's felicitous term 'alugens'" from "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in a discussion of Tom Regan on environmental ethics, "Three Wrong Leads in a Search for an Environmental Ethic: Tom Regan on Animal Rights, Inherent Values, and Deep Ecology," *Ethics and Animals* 5(1984):61-74, citation on p. 73.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) undertakes an extensive analysis of the value theory in "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" finding that "Rolston, in my judgment, put virtually all the pieces in place for a constructive value theory consistent with the new metaphysical foundations forced upon scientific naturalism by quantum theory." "Intrinsic Value, Quantum Theory, and Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 7(1985):257-275, discussion and citations on pp. 265-271. Callicott also cites and quotes from "Values in Nature," pp. 265f. Also in *In Defense of the Land Ethic* (Buffalo: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. 164, pp. 166-168, p. 299.

G. E. Varner (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin) cites "Can and Ought We To Follow Nature?" in "The Schopenhauerian Challenge in Environmental Ethics," *Environmental*

Ethics 7(1985):209-229, citation on p. 221.

Eric Katz (Philosophy, Barnard College) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" and "Values Gone Wild," in "Organism, Community, and the 'Substitution Problem'," in *Environmental Ethics* 7(1985):241-256, citations on p. 242, 250. Also in Katz, *Nature as Subject* (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 1997), p. 34, p. 48, p. 50.

Donald VanDeVeer and Christine Peters (Philosophy, North Carolina State University) cite "Values Gone Wild" and "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in a short selected bibliography on environmental ethics. In *People, Penguins, and Plastic Trees* (Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Publishing Co., 1986, p. 265.

Stephen P. Kellert and Joyce K. Berry (School of Forestry and Environmental Studies, Yale University) cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic," "Values in Nature," and "Values Gone Wild" in *A Bibliography of Human Animal Relations* (New York: University Press of America, 1985), items 2972-75.

Anthony Weston (Philosophy, State University of New York, Stony Brook) discusses "Values Gone Wild" at some length as a "striking essay" that makes a "promising start" in formulating a "new language for values in nature." The arguments are "genuinely perceptive" and "capture the values at stake much more freshly and directly than ... the more standard philosophical arguments." "Beyond Intrinsic Value: Pragmatism in Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 7(1985):321-339, citations on pp. 328, 331, 336-7.

Anthony Weston (see above) also cites "Valuing Wildlands," and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" p. 328, p. 331.

Andrew McLaughlin (Philosophy, Lehman College, City University of New York) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" as a "valuable start on formulating some of the key questions of metaethics based on ecological considerations." "Images and Ethics of Nature," *Environmental Ethics* 7(1985):293-319, citation on p. 300.

Michael E. Soulé (School of Natural Resources, University of Michigan) cites "Duties to Endangered Species" in "What is Conservation Biology?" *BioScience* 35(1985):727-734, citations on p. 731, p. 734.

The Office of Technology Assessment, Congress of the United States, cites "Values in Nature" in *Grassroots Conservation of Biological Diversity in the United States* (Washington: U. S. Government Printing Office, 1986), p. 3, p. 66.

Stephen R. Kellert (School of Forestry and Environmental Studies, Yale University) cites, "Values in Nature," in "Social and Perceptual Factors in Preservation of Animal Species," in Bryan G. Norton, ed., *The Preservation of Species* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1986), p. 52, p. 71.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in "On the Intrinsic Value of Nonhuman Species," in Norton, ed., *The Preservation of Species* (see above), p. 141, p. 166. Also in *In Defense of the Land Ethic* (Buffalo: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. 132, p. 291. Also in Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler, eds., *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1993), p. 66, p. 70.

Donald H. Regan (Law, University of Michigan) cites "Values in Nature" in "Duties of

Preservation," in Norton, ed., *The Preservation of Species* (see above), p. 219.

Jay McDaniel (Philosophy and Religion, Hendrix College, Arkansas) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in "Christian Spirituality as Openness to Fellow Creatures," *Environmental Ethics* 8(1986):33-46, citation on p. 42. Also in Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler, eds., *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1993), pp. 502-515, citation on p. 508.

Eric R. Pianka (Zoology, University of Texas), John Patrick Jordan (U. S. Department of Agriculture), and W. Ted Hinds comment favorably on "Duties to Endangered Species" in remarks published in *BioScience* 36(1986):140-41. It is an "outstanding essay" (Pianka), an "excellent philosophical article" (Jordan) and a "thoughtful article and illuminating discussion" (Hinds).

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites "Duties to Endangered Species," and also generally the environmentalist philosophy advocated by Rolston in "The Search for an Environmental Ethic," chapter 10, in Tom Regan, ed., *Matters of Life and Death: New Introductory Essays in Moral Philosophy*, 2nd ed. (New York: Random House, 1986), p. 400, p. 415, p. 424.

Paul W. Taylor (Philosophy, Brooklyn College, City University of New York) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as being a "philosophically sophisticated statement" of a holistic environmental ethic. *Respect for Nature* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986), p. 51, also p. 285, p. 320. He further cites "Just Environmental Business" and "Valuing Wildlands," p. 320.

Bryan G. Norton (Philosophy, Center for Philosophy and Public Policy, University of Maryland) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Valuing Wildlands" in "Conservation and Preservation: A Conceptual Rehabilitation," *Environmental Ethics* 8(1986):195-220, citations on p. 196, p. 203.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites and quotes from "Lake Solitude: The Individual in Wildness," illustrating the relational self as implied by ecology. "The Metaphysical Implications of Ecology," *Environmental Ethics* 8(1986):301-316, citation on pp. 314-315. Also in *In Defense of the Land Ethic* (Buffalo: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. 112, p. 285.

Perry J. Brown and Michael J. Manfredo (both in Natural Resources, Oregon State University) cite and use as the basis of their argument "Valuing Wildlands" and "Values Gone Wild," in "Social Values Defined," in Daniel J. Decker and Gary R. Goff, eds., *Valuing Wildlife: Economic and Social Perspectives* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1987), pp. 12-23, citations on pp. 13-15, 22.

Harold W. Steinhoff (Wildlife Biology, Four Corners Research Institute, Durango, CO), Richard G. Walsh (Economics, Colorado State University), Tony J. Peterle (Zoology, Ohio State University) and Joseph M. Petulla (Environmental Management, University of San Francisco) cite and discuss "Values in Nature" in "Evolution of the Valuation of Wildlife," in Decker and Goff, eds., *Valuing Wildlife: Economic and Social Perspectives* (see above), pp. 34-48, citations on pp. 41, 47.

Stephen R. Kellert (Forestry, Yale University) finds "Beauty and the Beast: Aesthetic Appreciation of Wildlife," to be "an outstanding and provocative discussion" that "provides us with some understanding of the unique and irreplaceable role of living animals in natural settings as aesthetic and cultural symbols." "Wildlife and the Quality of Life," in Decker and Goff, eds., *Valuing Wildlife: Social and Economic Perspectives* (see above), introduction, p.

Kellert (see above) also cites "Values in Nature," in "The Contributions of Wildlife to Human Quality of Life," in Decker and Goff, *ibid.*, pp. 222-229, citations on pp. 222, 229.

John C. Hendee (Dean, College of Forestry, Wildlife and Range Sciences, University of Idaho) finds "Beauty and the Beast: Aesthetic Experience of Wildlife," to be "an outstanding essay on how natural wildlife is perceived and used and on how it enriches human life aesthetically. This unusual essay is especially rich in wildlife examples." "Where Do We Go from Here?" in Decker and Goff, *ibid.*, pp. 318-333, discussion on pp. 325-326.

Frank B. Golley (Ecology, University of Georgia) favorably cites and discusses "Values in Nature," "Valuing Wildlands," and "Duties to Ecosystems" in an analysis of intrinsic value in nature. "Deep Ecology from the Perspective of Ecological Science," *Environmental Ethics* 9(1987):45-55, citations on pp. 52-53.

Steven E. Edwards (Economics, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution) analyzes at length Rolston's "insightful discussion" (p. 74) of contingent valuations used in valuing nature, maintaining that a partial but limited place can be found for contingent valuation of nature. "In Defense of Environmental Economics," *Environmental Ethics* 9(1987):73-85, citations and discussion on pp. 73, 74, 77, 78, 79, 80, 81, 82, 84. "Valuing Wildlands" is "a thoughtful paper" (p. 82). Also in Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler, eds., *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1993), pp. 231-237, citations on p. 234, p. 235, p. 236.

Martin LaBar (Zoology, Central Wesleyan College) uses Rolston's taxonomy of natural values from "Values in Nature" as an analytical framework in a study of religious values in nature. "A Biblical Perspective on Nonhuman Organisms: Values, Moral Considerability, and Moral Agency," in Eugene C. Hargrove, ed., *Religion and Environmental Crisis* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1986), pp. 76-93, with citations *passim*.

Eugene C. Hargrove (Philosophy, University of Georgia) cites *Philosophy Gone Wild* in a select bibliography on environmental ethics. Hargrove, ed., *Religion and Environmental Crisis* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1986), p. 217.

Alan R. Drengson (Philosophy, University of Victoria) cites "Values in Nature" as a useful discussion of paradigms of nature in "Developing Concepts of Environmental Relationships," *Philosophical Inquiry* 8(1986):50-65, citation on p. 64.

Andrew A. Brennan (Philosophy, University of Stirling, Scotland) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Ecological Theory and Value in Nature," *Philosophical Inquiry* 8(1986):66-95, citation on p. 90, p. 94.

Ernest Partridge (Philosophy, California State University, San Bernardino) devotes a critical article to Rolston's (and Tom Regan's) value theory. He analyzes in particular "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" and "Values Gone Wild." He also cites *Philosophy Gone Wild*. Partridge writes that Rolston's is "a splendid account of the 'ecology' and 'natural history' of natural evaluation. ... In my judgment, the best contemporary work in this field of environmental axiology is by Holmes Rolston, notwithstanding my disagreements with Rolston. (p. 100, and references throughout) "Values in Nature: Is Anybody There?" *Philosophical Inquiry* 8(1986):96-110.

H. J. McCloskey (Philosophy, LaTrobe University, Victoria, Australia) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in discussion and in a select bibliography, *Ecological Ethics and Politics* (Totowa, NJ: Rowman and Littlefield, 1983), p. 30, p. 163.

Donald Scherer (Philosophy, Bowling Green State University) says, in a summary of the rise of concern during the last two decades for applying philosophy to real world issues, "Holmes Rolston showed the relevance of an environmental appreciation to fundamental matters of ethical theory." "The Human Quest for the Good Life," *International Journal of Applied Philosophy* 2(1984):97-107, citation on p. 97.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as a "seminal and ground-breaking essay." "Conceptual Resources for Environmental Ethics in Asian Traditions of Thought: A Propaedeutic," *Philosophy East and West* 37(1987):115-130, citation on p. 128.

Jim Cheney (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin Center-Waukesha County) twice cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" He also extensively cites "The Human Standing in Nature: Storied Fitness in the Moral Observer." "In a lyrical and insightful paper, Holmes Rolston, III, emphasizes the importance of narrative or storytelling in ethical discourse." "Eco-Feminism and Deep Ecology," *Environmental Ethics* 9(1987):115-145, citations and discussion on p. 127, pp. 144-45.

Anthony Weston (Philosophy, S. U. N. Y. at Stony Brook) cites "Values Gone Wild" as an article that is sensitive to "some of the most distinctive values in nature, such as the alienness, the *non*-humanness, of much natural beauty." "Toward an Inclusive Ethics," in Wayne Sumner, Donald Callen and Thomas Attig, eds., *Values and Moral Standing*, Bowling Green Studies in Applied Philosophy, vol. 8 (Bowling Green, Ohio: Applied Philosophy Program, Bowling Green State University, 1986), pp. 36-44, citation on p. 37, p. 43.

B. L. Driver (Forestry, Rocky Mountain Forest and Range Experiment Station), Roderick Nash (History, University of California, Santa Barbara), and Glenn Haas (Forestry, Colorado State University) cite "Values in Nature," "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" "Duties to Endangered Species," and *Philosophy Gone Wild* in "Wilderness Benefits: A State-of-Knowledge Review," in Robert C. Lucas, ed., *Proceedings--National Wilderness Research Conference: Issues, State-of-Knowledge, Future Directions* (Ogden, UT: USDA Intermountain Research Station, General Technical Report INT-220, 1987), pp. 294-319, *passim*.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites "Duties to Endangered Species," in "The Conceptual Foundations of the Land Ethic," in Callicott, ed., *Companion to a Sand County Almanac* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987), pp. 204, 217. Also in *In Defense of the Land Ethic* (Buffalo: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. 91, p. 281. Also in Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler, eds., *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1993), pp. 386-397, citations on p. 393, p. 397.

Edwin P. Pister (Fishery Biology, California Department of Fish and Game) cites "Duties to Endangered Species" in "A Pilgrim's Progress from Group A to Group B," in Callicott, ed., *Companion to a Sand County Almanac* (see above), pp. 224, 232.

Eric Katz (Philosophy and Environmental Studies, Barnard College) analyzes Rolston's value theory at some length as that of a "prominent environmental philosopher" in which intrinsic value in nature "plays a complicated and subtle role in the development of an environmental ethic." He cites and quotes "Values Gone Wild," "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" "Valuing Wildlands," "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" In "Searching for Intrinsic Value: Pragmatism and Despair in Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 9(1987):231-241, citations *passim*. Also in Katz, *Nature as Subject* (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 1997), pp. 65-77.

Yrjö Sepänmaa (Aesthetics, University of Helsinki, Finland) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" "Values in Nature," "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" and "Values Gone Wild" in a bibliography on environmental aesthetics. *The Beauty of Environment: A General Model for Environmental Aesthetics* (Helsinki: Suomalainen Tiedekatemia, Finnish Academy of Sciences, 1986), p. 174.

Bryan G. Norton (Philosophy, University of South Florida) cites "Valuing Wildlands" as "an excellent essay," and says, in a chapter on amenity values, "The present form of this chapter owes much to Rolston's paper." He continues to develop Rolston's criticisms of contingent valuation methods for valuing wildlands. (pp. 99-103) In other discussions of Rolston's views, he cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?", "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" "Values Gone Wild," "Duties to Endangered Species," and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" (pp. 17-18, p. 222) *Why Preserve Natural Variety?* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988).

Jacqueline Cramer (Department of Science Dynamics, University of Amsterdam) and Wolfgang van den Daele (Forschungs-schwerpunkt Wissenschaftsforschung [Central Station for Scientific Research], Universität Bielefeld, West Germany) cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" twice in "Is Ecology an 'Alternative' Natural Science?" *Synthese* 65(1985):347-375, citations on pp. 361, 374.

Daniel H. Henning (IUCN Commission on Education and Political Science, Eastern Montana College) cites "Valuing Wildlands" in "Wilderness Politics: Public Participation and Values," *Environmental Management* 11(1987):282-293, citations on pp. 285, 293.

Stephen R. Kellert (School of Forestry and Environmental Studies, Yale University) cites "Values in Nature" in "Social and Perceptual Factors in Endangered Species Management," *Journal of Wildlife Management* 49(1985):528-536, citation on pp. 529, 536.

Alan Randall (Economics, Ohio State University) cites "Valuing Wildlands" in "Benefit Cost Analysis of Environmental Program Alternatives: Economics, Political Philosophy and the Policy Process" *The Science of the Total Environment* 56(1986):69-75, citations on pp. 73, 74, 75. (Special Issue on "Man's Role in Changing the Global Environment," International Conference, Venice, Italy, October 1985).

Roger T. Ames (Philosophy, University of Hawaii at Manoa) cites, "Can and Ought We To Follow Nature?" in "Taoism and the Nature of Nature," *Environmental Ethics* 8(1986):317-350, citation on p. 338.

Bryan G. Norton (Resources for the Future, Washington, DC) cites, "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Valuing Wildlands," in "Conservation and Preservation: A Conceptual Rehabilitation," *Environmental Ethics* 8(1986):195-220, citations on pp. 196, 203.

Norman D. Levine (University of Illinois, College of Veterinary Medicine) cites "Duties to Endangered Species" in "Preservation Versus Elimination," *BioScience* 36(1986)308-309, citation on p. 309.

Alan R. Drengson (Philosophy, University of Victoria) says of "In Behalf of Bioexuberance," "It is the values inherent in plant and species life that Rolston helps us to understand more deeply, and such an understanding has the potential to alter the quality of our relationships and experience." "Reflections on Ecophilosophy," *The Trumpeter* (Canadian Ecophilosophy Network) 5, no. 1 (Winter 1988):1-2.

Ian A. Worley (Botany and Environmental Studies, University of Vermont) cites "Values in Nature" in "Axiological and Ethical Factors in Peatland Preservation and Use in the United

States," using Rolston's categories of values in nature to interpret values in peatlands. *Proceedings: 7th International Peat Congress, Dublin, Ireland*. Vol. 2, pp. 49-61. Dublin, Ireland: Irish National Peat Committee, and Helsinki, Finland: International Peat Society, 1984. He similarly uses "Values in Nature" in "Consideration of the Values of Peatlands Leading to Protection and Preservation," paper presented at a conference: "Protection of the Ecological Value of Maine's Peatlands," University of Maine, Orono, January 1983.

Charles Haynes (Colorado Division of Wildlife and U. S. Fish and Wildlife Service) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" with other references to Rolston's analysis of wildlife values in "What is the Value of Wildlife?" Article in *The Denver Post*, Wednesday, March 16, 1988, p. 7B.

Peter Singer (Philosophy, Monash University, Australia) includes an extract from "Duties to Endangered Species" in an anthology, Peter Singer, ed., *Animal Rights and Human Obligations*, 2nd ed. (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1988).

Donald G. Crosby (Philosophy, Colorado State University) cites and endorses Rolston's analysis of intrinsic, instrumental, and intrinsic value in natural systems, with particular reference to duties toward endangered species. He cites "Duties to Endangered Species", "Duties to Ecosystems," and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" In *The Specter of the Absurd* (Buffalo, NY: State University of New York Press, 1988), pp. 320-321, 398, 433.

Frank De Roose (Philosophy, University of Ghent, Belgium) cites Rolston's "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Duties to Endangered Species" in a discussion of the rise of environmental ethics and an analysis of natural value theory. In "Towards a Non-Axiological Holist Ethic," *Philosophica* 39(1987):77-100, citations on p. 96, 97, also see p. 8.

Heinz Tschachler (Institut für Anglistic und Amerikanistik, Universität für Bildungswissenschaften, Klagenfurt, Austria) says, Rolston has "disentangled the theoretical muddle by setting off an ethic which is simply *about* the environment (i.e. one which is, ultimately, anthropocentric since it involves a limits-to-growth policy for a maximizing of human values or human survival) from an ethic based on values which are supposedly inherent in nature (i.e. one which recognizes a coincidence of the 'interests' of the Earth with the interests of human beings)." "Despotic Reason in Arcadia? Ernest Callenbach's Ecological Utopias," *Science-Fiction Studies* (Montreal, Quebec) 11(1984):304-317, on p. 304, 314.

Alan R. Drengson (Philosophy, University of Victoria, BC) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in "Mastery and Masters," *Philosophy Today* 27(1983):230-246, on p. 246.

Kristin Shrader-Frechette (Philosophy, University of South Florida, Tampa) says of "The Preservation of Natural Value in the Solar System" in Hargrove, ed., *Beyond Spaceship Earth*, that "this collection represents a scholarly landmark," and that "The Rolston contribution is one of the best in the volume; clear, sensitive, and well referenced, it criticizes 'Earth chauvinism,' warns about ethical pitfalls, and offer six rules that 'probe toward an exploration ethic' for space." Review in *Environmental Ethics* 10(1988):187-189, citations on p. 187.

Susan Quimby Foster (Aquatic Ecologist, Jamestown, CO) cites "Values in Nature" and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in "Wetland Values," in J. T. Windell et al, *An Ecological Characterization of Rocky Mountain Montane and Subalpine Wetlands*, U. S. Fish and Wildlife Service Biological Report 86(11), 1986, pp. 177-214, citations on pp. 178,

179, 207, 263.

Bryan G. Norton (Philosophy, University of South Florida, Sarasota) cites "Duties to Ecosystems" in "The Constancy of Leopold's Land Ethic," *Conservation Biology* 2(1988):93-102, citations on p. 94, 102.

L. I. Vasilenko (Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Sciences, Moscow), in an article in Russian, quotes and cites extensively from "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" He analyzes Rolston's effort to show the connections between ecology and ethics, *is* and *ought*, fact and value. He also cites and quotes from "The River of Life." In "The Search for a Foundation and Sources of Ecological Ethics," in *Voprosy Filosofii* (2)(1986):145-152, citations on pp. 145, 146, 147, 148, 149, 152.

Patrick K. Dooley (Philosophy, Saint Bonaventure University) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Can and Ought We To Follow Nature?" in "The Ambiguity of Environmental Ethics: Duty or Heroism," *Philosophy Today* 30(1986):48-57, citations on p. 56, p. 57.

Sara Ebenreck (Philosophy, Saint Mary's College of Maryland, and American Land Reform, American Forestry Association) says that "Duties to Ecosystems" is "a valuable and essential contribution" to understanding "the theoretical logic and implications of Leopold's land ethic." Review of Callicott, *Companion to a Sand County Almanac*, in *Environmental Review* 12, no. 1 (1988):68-70.

Les Brown (Philosophy and Education, University of New South Wales, Australia) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in *Conservation and Practical Morality: Challenges to Education and Reform* (New York: St. Martins Press, 1988), p. 190.

Bernard E. Rollin (Philosophy, Colorado State University) cites *Philosophy Gone Wild*, especially "Duties to Endangered Species," in "Environmental Ethics and International Justice," in Steven Luper-Foy, ed., *Problems of International Justice*, Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1988, pp. 124-143, on pp. 125, 142. Reprinted in James P. Sterba, ed., *Earth Ethics: Environmental Ethics, Animal Rights, and Practical Applications* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1995), pp. 114-128, citations on p. 119, p. 127.

Carolyn Merchant (History, Philosophy, University of California, Berkeley) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in *The Death of Nature* (New York: Harper and Row, 1980, 1982), p. 96, p. 252, p. 306, p. 330.

Harley Cahen (Natural Resources, Cornell University) analyzes, quotes and cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Valuing Wildlands." In "Against the Moral Considerability of Ecosystems," *Environmental Ethics* 10(1988):195-216, citations on pp. 197-198.

Eugene C. Hargrove (Philosophy, University of Georgia) cites and quotes "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Valuing Wildlands," discussing the *is/ought* fallacy and conceptual difficulties involved in the economic valuation of wildlands. In *Foundations of Environmental Ethics* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1989), pp. 27-79, p. 104, p. 211, p. 215.

Deborah A. Simmons (Outdoor Education, Northern Illinois University) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" "Valuing Wildlands," and "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in *Environmental Ethics: A Selected Bibliography for the Environmental Professional*, CLP Bibliography Series # 213, Chicago: Council of Planning Librarians, March 1988, p. 10, p. 13, p. 14.

Lawrence E. Johnson (Philosopher, Flinders University, Bedford Park, South Australia) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in a discussion of value in nature. He also cites *Philosophy Gone Wild* and *Environmental Ethics* as containing "much valuable material." In *A Morally Deep World* (Canberra: Department of Philosophy: Research School of Social Sciences, Discussion Papers in Environmental Philosophy, 1987) p. 196, p. 199.

Tim Clark W. Clark and Ann H. Harvey (Biologists, Northern Rockies Conservation Cooperative) quote and cite, "In Defense of Ecosystems," in their introduction to *Management of The Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem: An Annotated Bibliography* (Jackson, WY: Northern Rockies Conservation Cooperative, 1988), p. 18, p. 24.

Roderick F. Nash (History and Environmental Studies, University of California, Santa Barbara) cites and evaluates Rolston's work repeatedly in his history of environmental ethics. He begins his history with an epigraph taken from "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" (pp. 3-4). He traces Rolston's role in defending values in nature. "Rolston understood that in widening the definition of community the ecological sciences created a new, expanded meaning for ethics. Wilderness for Rolston was a focal point of the effort to implement this radical new philosophy" (p 149, p. 255, citing essays in *Philosophy Gone Wild*).

Nash traces Rolston's expansion of ethics to include species and ecosystems. Rolston "was not only prepared to recognize 'the intrinsic value of every ecobiotic component' but proposed that nature be looked upon as a 'commonwealth' whose rights trumped those of its living components. This view led Rolston to formulate 'duties to species' and 'duties to ecosystems' with higher ethical authority than to individual organisms," although he was "well aware of the opposition to the concept among his colleagues" (pp. 154-155, p. 256, citing "Is There an Ecological Ethic?," "Duties to Endangered Species," "Duties to Ecosystems," and *Environmental Ethics*). Nash cites "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?" (p. 245) Further citations on wilderness (p. 171, p. 260), on endangered species, (p. 172, p. 261).

Nash continues tracing Rolston's connection of creativity in nature with value, and the possibility of a global environmental ethics (p. 158, p. 258, citing *Environmental Ethics* and "The Preservation of Natural Value in the Solar System." He cites *Philosophy Gone Wild* and *Environmental Ethics* as "essential for gaining an understanding of the farthest horizons of the field." Rolston is "a major architect of holistic ethics," "a major contributor to contemporary nature-oriented moral philosophy" (p. 275. also p. 278). All in *The Rights of Nature: A History of Environmental Ethics* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1989).

Michael McCloskey (Chairman, Sierra Club, Washington, D. C.) cites "Valuing Wildlands" for its arguments about the limits of economic valuation of wildlands. In "Understanding the Demand for More Wilderness," in Helen R. Freilich, comp., *Wilderness Benchmark 1988: Proceedings of the National Wilderness Colloquium January 13-14, 1988, Tampa, Florida*. General Technical Report SE-51, Asheville, NC: U. S. Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Southeastern Forest Experiment Station, pp. 38-44, citations on p. 39, p. 44.

Daniel R. Williams (Department of Recreation, Utah State University), Lois M. Haggard (Department of Psychology, University of Utah), and Richard Schreyer (Department of Forestry, Utah State University) cite "Beyond Recreational Value: the Greater Outdoors" for its arguments about the sense of insight and perspective that forms character, which transcends outdoor recreation. In "The Role of Wilderness in Human Development," in Helen R. Freilich, comp., *Wilderness Benchmark 1988: Proceedings of the National Wilderness Colloquium January 13-14, 1988, Tampa, Florida*. General Technical Report SE-51, Asheville, NC: U. S. Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Southeastern Forest Experiment Station, pp. 169-180, citations on p. 173, p. 180.

Peter Reed (Council of Environmental Studies, Oslo, Norway) cites "Values in Nature," "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" and "Beyond Recreational Value: The Greater Outdoors," in "Man Apart: An Alternative to the Self-Realization Approach," *Environmental Ethics* 11(1989):53-69, citations on p. 60.

George Bradford (Editor, *The Fifth Estate*, Detroit) cites and quotes extensively from "Duties to Ecosystems," in "Return of the Son of Deep Ecology: The Ethics of Permanent Crisis and the Permanent Crisis in Ethics," *The Fifth Estate*, vol. 24, no. 1 (Spring 1989), p. 11, p. 13 p. 28, p. 29.

Eugene C. Hargrove (Philosophy, University of Georgia) cites, "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature," as a "preemptive strike" that sets an agenda for discussion in the area of Eastern thought as a resource for environmental ethics. In J. Baird Callicott and Roger T. Ames, eds., *Nature in Asian Traditions of Thought* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. xvii-xviii.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin Stevens Point) cites, "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature," as "posing the critical question" in this area. He cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as a "seminal paper" in founding the field of environmental ethics. He also cites and quotes from "Lake Solitude: The Individual in Wilderness" as an example of a relational theory of the self in environmental thought. In J. Baird Callicott and Roger T. Ames, eds., *Nature in Asian Traditions of Thought* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. 1, p. 16, p. 62, p. 291, p. 293, p. 298.

Roger T. Ames (Philosophy, University of Hawaii) cites, "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" in "Putting the *Te* Back into Taoism." In J. Baird Callicott and Roger T. Ames, eds., *Nature in Asian Traditions of Thought* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. 132, p. 307.

B. L. Driver (Forestry, Rocky Mountain Forest and Range Experiment Station) cites "Values in Nature" and "Beyond Recreational Value: The Greater Outdoors" in "Benefits of River and Trail Recreation: The Limited State of Knowledge and Why It is Limited," in *Proceedings of the 1st International Congress on Trail and River Recreation, 1986* (Asheville, N. C.: Regional Recreationists Conference, 1986), pp. 44-58, citations on pp. 50, 54, 57.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites *Philosophy Gone Wild* and "Duties to Ecosystems" as "a notable example of ecocentrism." In *In Defense of the Land Ethic* (Buffalo: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. 4, p. 267.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites "Beauty and the Beast: Aesthetic Experience of Wildlife." In "Animal Liberation and Environmental Ethics: Back Together Again," in *Between the Species* 4(1988):163-169, citation on pp. 168-169. Also in *In Defense of the Land Ethic* (Buffalo: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. 57, p. 277. Also in James P. Sterba, ed., *Earth Ethics: Environmental Ethics, Animal Rights, and Practical Applications* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1995), pp. 190-198, citation on p. 198.

Jim Cheney (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin-Wakesha) cites and quotes "The Human Standing in Nature: Storied Fitness in the Moral Observer," and critically develops Rolston's concept of "storied residence," using it to develop his central theme of bioregional narrative. "Postmodern Environmental Ethics: Ethics as Bioregional Narrative," *Environmental Ethics* 11 (1989):117-143, citation on pp. 124-125, and discussion pp. 125ff. Also in Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler, eds., *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1993), pp. 86-96, citations on p. 86, p. 87, p. 94. Also in Max

Oelschlaeger, ed., *Postmodern Environmental Ethics* (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1995), p. 29, p. 41.

Bryan G. Norton (Philosophy, New College of the University of South Florida) cites "Biology without Conservation: An Environmental Misfit and Contradiction in Terms" in "The Cultural Approach to Conservation Biology." In David Western and Mary C. Pearl, eds., *Conservation for the Twenty-first Century* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1989), pp. 241-246, citation on p. 242.

Eric Katz (Philosophy and Environmental Studies, Barnard College) cites "Duties to Ecosystems," among the articles anthologized in Callicott, ed., *Companion to A Sand County Almanac*, and says that among the articles there, it is one "of chief philosophical interest" because it "presents a detailed analysis of the reasons why environmental systems can be the objects of moral concern." In "Environmental Ethics: A Select Annotated Bibliography, 1983-1987," *Research in Philosophy & Technology* 9(1989):251-285, citation on p. 259.

Eric Katz also cites "The Preservation of Natural Value in the Solar System," anthologized in Hargrove, ed., *Beyond Spaceship Earth: Environmental Ethics and the Solar System*, and says that it is one of the three articles therein "of the greatest philosophical interest" because "Rolston ... continues his development of a non-anthropocentric system of natural value." In "Environmental Ethics: A Select Annotated Bibliography, 1983-1987," *Research in Philosophy & Technology* 9(1989):251-285, citation on p. 261.

Eric Katz says of "Duties to Endangered Species," that it is "an excellent paper by one of the leading theorists in environmental ethics. Rolston reviews the inadequacy of current ethical theories based on individual rights, sentience, or personhood, to insure species preservation. He then argues that species ought to be protected as 'dynamic life forms preserved in historical lines.' The species line is more important than individuals." In "Environmental Ethics: A Select Annotated Bibliography, 1983-1987," *Research in Philosophy & Technology* 9(1989):251-285, citation on p. 272.

Eric Katz also cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" "The Human Standing in Nature: Fitness in the Moral Overseer," "Values Gone Wild," and "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?" In "Environmental Ethics: A Select Annotated Bibliography, 1983-1987," *Research in Philosophy & Technology* 9(1989):251-285, citations on pp. 260, 266, 277, 285.

Eric Katz says of "Valuing Wildlands," that it is "an important discussion of 'a taxonomy of value' for wilderness, with a critique of cost-benefit reductions of these values to economic terms," with "serious proposals for 'decision rules' regarding the preservation and use of wilderness." In "Environmental Ethics: A Select Annotated Bibliography, 1983-1987," *Research in Philosophy & Technology* 9(1989):251-285, citation on p. 278.

Arturo Tarak (Director of National Conservation, Argentina) cites "Values in Nature" in "A National Perspective" (Conservation Strategy in Argentina). In "The Cultural Approach to Conservation Biology." In David Western and Mary C. Pearl, eds., *Conservation for the Twenty-first Century* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1989), pp. 254-260, citation on p. 257.

Kristin Shrader-Frechette (Philosophy, University of Florida) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" using in her argument Rolston's distinction between primary and secondary environmental ethics. She also cites "Duties to Ecosystems." "Four Land Ethics: An Overview," *The Environmental Professional* 9(1987):121-132, citations on p. 125, p. 128, p. 132.

Sylvia Doughty Fries (Chief Historian, National Aeronautics and Space Administration, Washington, D. C.) says that Rolston's "Preservation of Natural Value in the Solar System" is "the most impressive effort to identify a universal (as distinct from terrestrial) rationale for an ethical consciousness as we travel through space." Review of *Beyond Spaceship Earth: Environmental Ethics and the Solar System* in *Science, Technology, and Human Values* 12(1987):150.

Robert Elliot (Philosophy, University of New England, Australia) cites "Values Gone Wild" as containing good examples of arguments for intrinsic values in nature. In "Environmental Degradation, Vandalism and the Aesthetic Object Argument," *Australasian Journal of Philosophy* 67(1989):191-204, citation on p. 200.

J. M. Bowker (Nova Scotia Agricultural College, Nova Scotia) and John R. Stoll (Department of Agricultural Economics, Texas A&M University) cite "Valuing Wildlands" in "Use of Dichotomous Choice Nonmarket Methods to Value the Whooping Crane Resource," *American Journal of Agricultural Economics* 70(1988):373-381, citation on p. 373, p. 381.

Renate Hof (Professor, Amerika-Institut, Universitat Munchen) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "'But what if the object began to speak?'- Einige Gedanken uber den Zusammenhang von Feminismus und Okologie" (article in German). In *Amerikastudien* 32(1987):327-337, citation on p. 335.

Lisa Strong-Aufhauser (National Park Service, Yosemite National Park) cites and quotes from "Duties to Endangered Species," in "Biological Diversity in Yosemite," *Yosemite Guide*, vol. 18, no. 3 (June-September 1989), p. 9.

Alan R. Drengson (Philosophy, University of Victoria, Canada) cites "Hewn and Cleft from this Rock," "Can and Ought we to Follow Nature?" "The Pasqueflower," and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in a bibliography on environmental ethics, also recommended for a discussion of intrinsic value in nature. In *Beyond Environmental Crisis: From Technocrat to Planetary Person* (New York: Peter Lang Publishing Co., 1989), on p. 204, p. 230.

Ann M. Hooker (Yale University School of Forestry) summarizes "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World," in "Ecology-Economics-Ethics: The Broken Circle," in *Yale Forest School News* vol. 76, no. 1 (Summer, 1989), pp. 6-7, on p. 7.

Tim W. Clark (Department of Conservation Biology, Chicago Zoological Society) cites "Philosophical Aspects of the Environment," "Is There an Ecological Ethic? "Values in Nature," and "Values Gone Wild," in *Conservation Biology of the Black-Footed Ferret, Mustela nigripes* (Philadelphia: Wildlife Preservation Trust International, Special Scientific Report No. 3, 1989), p. 171.

Jay B. McDaniel (Religious Studies, Henrix College, Conway AK) cites "Values in Nature" and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in *God and Pelicans: A Theology of Reverence for Life* (Philadelphia: Westminster / John Knox Press, 1989), pp. 56-57.

Jim Cheney (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin-Waukesha) cites "The Human Standing in Nature: Storied Fitness in the Moral Observer," in "The Neo-Stoicism of Radical Environmentalism," *Environmental Ethics* 11(1989):293-325, citation on p. 325.

"Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?" is cited in a select research bibliography for Asian Studies, *Asian Religious Studies Information*, no. 3, January 1988, Institute for Advanced Studies of World Religions, State University of New York at Stonybook, p. 179.

David R. Biggins (School of Science, Griffith University, Nathan, Queensland, Australia) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Scientific Knowledge and Values: Imperatives in Ecology," *Ethics in Science and Medicine* 6(1979):49-57, citations on pp. 55, 57.

Peter Miller (Philosophy, University of Winnipeg) says that "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" is one of "three landmark papers in environmental philosophy," along with Richard Routley's "Is There a Need for a New, an Environmental Ethic?" and Arne Naess's "The Shallow and the Deep, Long-Range Ecology Movement." "Descartes' Legacy and Deep Ecology," *Dialogue* 28(1989):183-202, citation on p. 184.

Thomas H. Birch cites "Values Gone Wild" as "a sound discussion of wilderness as the source of resources, and not a resource itself." "The Incarceration of Wilderness: Wilderness Areas as Prisons," *Environmental Ethics* 12(1990):3-26, citation on p. 9.

Carolyn Merchant (Department of Conservation and Resource Studies, University of California, Berkeley) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" for its discussion of the complex problems interrelating ecology and values. "Environmental Ethics and Political Conflict: A View from California," *Environmental Ethics* 12(1990):45-68, citation on p. 67. Also reprinted in Lawrence M. Hinman, *Contemporary Moral Issues: Diversity and Consensus* (Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1996), p. 530, p. 536.

Deborah Frazier (Staff writer, Rocky Mountain News) quotes Rolston on values in wilderness experience, in a series of stories on changing perceptions of values in nature. In "Colorado an Oasis on Wilderness Road," *Rocky Mountain News*, Sunday Magazine, Sept. 10, 1989, pp. 8-M, 9-M.

Ted Williams (Contributing Editor, *Audubon*) quotes Rolston from "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone," in an analysis of conservation issues in Yellowstone National Park, especially those raised by Alston Chase, a philosopher, who has been critical of park policies regarding wildlife and wildfires. Rolston's analysis of what is "natural" is used to correct Chase's confusions. In "Sifting Ashes in Yellowstone," *Audubon* 91, no. 6 (November 1989): 30-43, citation on p. 42.

"Valuing Wildlands" is reprinted as required text assignment in the prepared course materials for "Wilderness Management by Correspondence Study--An Interagency Project" in which employees of the Bureau of Land Management, the U. S. Fish and Wildlife Service, the National Park Service, and the U. S. Forest Service take a correspondence course accredited by Colorado State University. David E. Porter, Project Coordinator, Wilderness Management, USDI Bureau of Land Management, Washington, D. C.

Donald E. Davis cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic" in *Ecophilosophy: A Field Guide to the Literature* (San Pedro, CA: R. & E. Miles, 1989), p. xxi.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites Rolston's theoretical work in environmental ethics as a principal figure in the field as it has developed in the last fifteen years. Review of Roderick Frazier Nash, *The Rights of Nature*, in *Ethics* 100(1989-90):462-463.

The Bureau of Land Management (BLM) of the U. S. Department of the Interior cites and reprints "In Defense of Ecosystems" and "Valuing Wildlands" in course text materials for a correspondence course for university credit on "Wilderness Management," for employees of the BLM, the Fish and Wildlife Service, the National Park Service, and the Forest Service. David Porter, Project Coordinator, Wilderness Management, USDI Bureau of Land Management, Washington, DC.

Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as "a notable seventies-generation paper," one of the earliest calls for an environmental ethic, which launched a subsequent debate in the philosophical literature. In "The Case Against Moral Pluralism," *Environmental Ethics* 12(1990):99-124, discussion and citation on pp. 99-101.

Janna Thompson (Philosophy, La Trobe University, Bundoora, Victoria, Australia) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in "A Refutation of Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 12(1990):147-160, citations on p. 148.

Andrew Dobson (Politics, University of Keele, England) cites and assesses, "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in "Deep Ecology," *Cogito* (Bristol, England) 3, no. 1 (Spring 1989):41-46, citation and discussion on pp. 42ff.

Arne Naess (Philosophy, University of Oslo, Norway) cites "Valuing Wildlands" in a discussion of economics and nature conservation in *Ecology, Community and Lifestyle* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), p. 124, p. 216.

Dieter T. Hessel (Lecturer, McCormick Theological Seminary) in a review of recent publications on religion and ecology cites as "a jewel" in the literature Rolston's "Wildlife and Wildlands: A Christian Perspective." In "Oppressed Nature and Human Responsibility," *Presbyterian Outlook*, vol. 172, no. 38 (November 5, 1990), pp. 10-11.

Eric T. Freyfogle (Law, University of Illinois) cites "Duties to Ecosystems" in an analysis of whether law and morals can focus on the ecosystem level. In "The Land Ethic and Pilgrim Leopold," *University of Colorado Law Review* 61(1990):217-256, citation on p. 246.

Tom Wolf (Forestry, Nature Conservancy and Trust for Public Land) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as a philosophical basis for forestry's developing a land ethic. In "The Los Utes Case: Forestry Seeks Its Soul," *American Forests* 96 (nos. 10 & 11, November/December 1990): 27-32, 66-68, citation on p. 32.

Gerald F. Gaus (Philosophy, University of Minnesota) cites and discusses "Values in Nature" and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in an analysis of value theory and of anthropocentrism and values, *Value and Justification: The Foundations of Liberal Theory* (Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press, 1990), citations on p. 171, pp. 249-250.

Dieter Birnbacher (Philosophy, University of Essen, Germany) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in *Okologie und Ethik* (Stuttgart: Philipp Reclam, 1980, 1986, 1988) in a select list of bibliographic materials, p. 253.

Hiram W. Li (Oregon Fishery Research Unit, Oregon State University, Corvallis, and Newsletter Editor) cites and quotes from "Wildlife and Wildlands: A Christian Perspective," in an editorial in the *Newsletter of the Oregon Chapter, American Fisheries Society*, vol. 10, no. 3, October 1990, p. 2.

Faith Campbell (Plant Conservation, Natural Resources Defense Council) quotes and cites "Property Rights and Endangered Species" in *Our Plants, Our Lands*, a Natural Resources Defense Council pamphlet on endangered species and plant conservation on Bureau of Land Management Lands. Issued Spring 1991.

John Lemons (Life Sciences, University of New England) cites "Engineers, Butterflies, Worldviews" as an analysis revealing how "questions of environmental values and ethics are at the root of most environmental problems." In "The Need to Integrate Values into

Environmental Curricula," *Environmental Management* 13(1989):133-147.

J. Mittelstrass (Zentrum Philosophie und Wissenschaft Theorie, University of Constance, Germany) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Umwelt und Gesundheit: Von der Schwierigkeit, sich mit Umwelt- und Gesundheitsstandards in einer Kulture-Natur zurechtzufinden [Ethics of Environment and Health: On the Difficulty of Determining Environmental and Health Standards in a Cultural Nature]," in *Wiener Klinische Wochenschrift* 101 (no 17, 1989): 563-571, citation on p. 563.

Susan Armstrong-Buck (Philosophy, Humboldt State University, Arcata, CA) analyzes Rolston's value theory extensively, citing "Treating Animals Naturally," in "What Process Philosophy Can Contribute to the Land Ethic and Deep Ecology," *The Trumpeter* 8 (no. 1, 1991):29-34, citations passim.

Robert H. Haynes (Biology, York University, Toronto) cites "The Preservation of Natural Value in the Solar System" in "Ecce ecopoiesis: Playing God on Mars." Pages 161-183 in Don MacNiven, ed., *Moral Expertise: Studies in Practical and Professional Ethics* (London: Routledge, 1990), citations on pp. 177, 182.

The Haynes article is also published in German translation as "Etablierung von Leben auf dem Mars durch gerichtete Panspermie: Technische und ethische Probleme der Ökopoese" ("Ecce Ecopoiesis: Playing God on Mars"). In *Biologisches Zentralblatt (An International Journal of Cell Biology, Genetics, Evolution, and Theoretical Biology)* (Leipzig) 109(1990):193-205, citations on p. 202, p. 205.

Kenneth A. Barrick (Geography, University of Alaska) and Ronald I. Beazley (Geography, Southern Illinois University) cite "Valuing Wildlands" in "Magnitude and Distribution of Option Value for the Washakie Wilderness, Northwest Wyoming, USA," in *Environmental Management* 14(1990):367-380, citations on p. 378, p. 380.

R. P. Peerenboom (Philosophy, University of Hawaii at Manoa, Honolulu) cites and discusses, "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?" and "Can and Ought We To Follow Nature?" He elaborates how "Rolston is keenly aware that the central ideas of Eastern thought which are most commonly put forth as potential conceptual resources for Western environmental ethics often underdetermine real-life decisions. He illustrates this most clearly." In "Beyond Naturalism: A Reconstruction of Daoist Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 13(1991):3-22, citations on pp. 3, 8, 10, 11.

Pete A. Y. Gunter (Philosophy, University of North Texas) calls attention to how Rolston defends nonanthropocentrism in "Biology Without Conservation: An Environmental Misfit and Contradiction in Terms," against other authors with anthropocentric views, finding the arguments "richly detailed" in a book that "deserves to be widely read by every concerned and reflective biologist, by every philosopher seriously interested in environmental questions, and by every U. S. Senator and Congressman and their staffs." Review of David Western and Mary Pearl, eds., *Conservation for the Twenty-first Century*, in *Environmental Ethics* 13(1991):95-96.

Bruce K. Omundson (Philosophy, Lansing Community College) cites "Values Gone Wild" as illustrating how a land ethic can flourish by being adequately grounded in human valued experiences and practices. In "Pluralism and Prospects for a Land Ethics," *Michigan Academician* 23(1991):191-200, citation on p. 196.

George H. Kehm (Theology, Pittsburgh Theological Seminary) cites "In Defense of Bioexuberance" for its "wonderful expression" of the flourishing of life, that ought to be conserved alike by humans on Earth. In *Who's World Is It?* (Louisville, KY: Presbyterian

Church (U.S.A.), 1991), p. 14, p. 41.

John Lemons (Biology, University of New England) uses the analysis, categories, and maxims of "Valuing Wildlands" as the basis of an analysis of values in national park management. In "United States' National Park Management: Values, Policy, and Possible Hints for Others," in *Environmental Conservation* 14(1987):329-340, 328, citations passim.

Freya Mathews (Philosophy, LaTrobe University, Victoria, Australia) cites *Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?* as a seminal discussion of intrinsic value in nature. In *The Ecological Self* (Savage, MD:: Barnes and Noble, 1991), pp. 178-179, p. 187.

Yu Mouchang (Institute of Philosophy, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Beijing) anthologizes "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in Qiu Renzong, ed., *Guowai Ziranhexue Zhexuewenji 1990 (International Philosophical Problems in Natural Science 1990)* (Beijing: Social Science Press, 1991), pp. 146-157. As section editor, he introduces Rolston's environmental ethics in, "Current Focus of the Study of the Relationship between Human Beings and Nature," the section introduction, pp. 99-104.

Richard Sylvan (Philosophy, Research School of Social Sciences, Australian National University, Canberra) cites Rolston's work, involving "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" defending him against a criticism of Janna Thompson, "but Rolston is well able to look out after himself." In *In Defense of Deep Environmental Ethics* (Canberra: Research School of Social Sciences, Discussion Papers in Environmental Philosophy, No. 18, 1990), p. 96, p. 101, p. 110.

Ye Ping (Philosophy, Social Science Department, Northeast Forestry University, Harbin, China), cites Rolston and Coufal's analysis of the need for a land ethic in forestry. In "Man and Nature: A Review of Western Ecological Ethics" (in Chinese), *Tzu-Jan Pien-Cheng-Fa Yen-Chiu (Studies in Dialectics of Nature)* 7(no. 11, 1991):4-13, 46, citation on p. 46.

Ye Ping (Philosophy, Social Science Department, Northeast Forestry University, Harbin, China) cites Rolston and Coufal's call for a land ethic in forestry from "A Forest Ethic and Multivalued Forest Management." In "Ecological Ethics Applied to Forestry Management," *Lin-Yeh Yüeh Pao (Forestry Monthly)* (in Chinese), November, no. 11, 1991, p. 20.

W. L. Minckley (Zoology, Arizona State University) and Michael E. Douglas (Zoology, Arizona State University) cite "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility," in "Discovery and Extinction of Western Fishes: A Blink of the Eye in Geologic Time." Further citations are in "Western Fishes and the Real World: The Enigma of 'Endangered Species' Revisited." Pages 7-17 and pages 405-413 in W. L. Minckley and James E. Deacon, eds., *Battle Against Extinction: Native Fish Management in the American West* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1991), p. 13, p. 405, p. 413.

Edwin P. Pister (California Department of Fish and Game) cites "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility," as a "discussion in depth" of philosophical issues in fishes conservation. In "The Desert Fishes Council: Catalyst for Change." Pages 55-68 in W. L. Minckley and James E. Deacon, eds., *Battle Against Extinction: Native Fish Management in the American West* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1991), p. 68.

Cynthia Deacon Williams (U. S. Forest Service, National Fisheries Program) and James E. Deacon (Biological Sciences, University of Nevada, Las Vegas) cite "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility." In "Ethics, Federal Legislation, and Litigation in the Battle Against Extinction." Pages 108-121 in W. L. Minckley and James E. Deacon, eds., *Battle Against Extinction: Native Fish Management in the American West* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1991), p. 113, p. 121.

John N. Rinne (U. S. Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Forest and Range Station) and Paul R. Turner (Wildlife and Fisheries, New Mexico State University) cite "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility." In "Reclamation and Alteration as Management Techniques, and a Review of Methodology in Stream Remediation." Pages 219-244 in W. L. Minckley and James E. Deacon, eds., *Battle Against Extinction: Native Fish Management in the American West* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1991), p. 235.

Frederick R. Anderson (Law, American University), Daniel R. Mandelker (Law, Washington University) and A. Dan Tarlock (Law, ITT Chicago-Kent College of Law) cite "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" and "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as formative articles in environmental ethics as this shapes environmental policy. In *Environmental Protection: Law and Policy*, 2nd ed. (Boston: Little, Brown and Co., 1990), pp. 14-15.

Peter B. Moyle and Joseph J. Cech, Jr. (Fisheries Biology, California State University, Davis) cite "Duties to Endangered Species" as a primary reference in conservation biology. In *Fishes: An Introduction to Ichthyology* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1988, 2nd edition), p. 494, p. 535.

Nicolás M. Sosa (Philosophy, Universidad de Salamanca, Spain) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" In *Ética Ecológica* (Madrid: Universidad Libertarias/Prodhufi, S.A, 1990), p. 97, p. 146.

Daniel J. Kevles (Staff Writer, *New York Review of Books*) says of "Environmental Ethics: Duties to and Values in the Natural World": "In a strongly argued essay on environmental ethics in Bormann and Kellert's volume, the philosopher Holmes Rolston, III, a member of the Colorado State University faculty, rejects the simplistic biocentrism that attributes equal rights to all life on the planet or the sentimental anthropomorphism that refuses to do injury to any animal because we know that animals suffer and feel as we do. Rolston sensibly contends that such judgments are 'insufficiently discriminating,' because they reduce human beings to animals and unnaturally elevate animals to a human level--in short because they are "blind to the real differences between species." In "Some Like It Hot," *New York Review of Books*, March 26, 1992, pp. 31-39, citation on p. 34.

Lester W. Milbrath (Political Science, Sociology, State University of New York, Buffalo), cites "Duties to Endangered Species" as an argument that "poignantly makes the case for our moral obligation to endangered species." In *Envisioning a Sustainable Society* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1989), citations on p. 166, p. 390.

David W. Orr (Political Science, Oberlin College) cites "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" and "Values in Nature" in a bibliography of required reading for ecological literacy in undergraduate education. In *Ecological Literacy: Education and the Transition to a Postmodern World* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1992), p. 115.

Leonard W. Doob calls *Ecology, Economics, Ethics: The Broken Circle*, containing "Environmental Ethics: Duties to and Values in the Natural World," "a superb collection of 13 essays ... that concern themselves with sustaining life in all phases on this planet." Phi Beta Kappa, *The Key Reporter*, Spring 1992, p. 15.

Don E. Marietta, Jr. (Philosophy, Florida Atlantic University) analyzes Rolston's position in "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" He finds that Rolston reveals that intrinsic value "is a significant category of value because there are some clear examples, such as those cited by Holmes Rolston, III, of functional values which have independent value." Marietta continues, "I agree with Holmes Rolston, III, that it is arbitrary to hold, as though it were obviously the case, that there can be no value which is independent of human

ascription of value." In "Thoughts on the Taxonomy and Semantics of Value Terms," *Journal of Value Inquiry* 25(1)(1991):43-53, citations on p. 45, p. 48, and passim.

Walter B. Gulick (Philosophy and Religious Studies, Eastern Montana College) cites "Wildlife and Wildlands: A Christian Perspective" in "The Bible and Ecological Spirituality," *Theology Today* 42(2)(1991):182-194.

Willem A. Landman (Philosophy, University of the Western Cape, South Africa) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as a prominent example of moral holism (which he rejects) in "On Excluding Something from Our Gathering: The Lack of Moral Standing of Non-sentient Entities," *South African Journal of Philosophy* 10(1)(1991):7-19, citation on pp. 18-19.

Jay B. McDaniel (Religious Studies, Henrix College, Conway AK) cites "Values in Nature" and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" and discusses Rolston's position on intrinsic and instrumental value in nature. He finds in it a careful balance between intrinsic and instrumental value, one that can be a resource for both process philosophy and Christian theology. In "Land Ethics, Animal Rights, and Process Theology," *Process Studies* 17(no. 3, 1988):88-102, citations on pp. 90-91.

Rogene A. Buchholz (College of Business Administration, Loyola University of New Orleans), cites "Just Environmental Business" in his analysis of leading positions in naturalistic ethics of which business persons must take cognizance. In *Principles of Environmental Management: The Greening of Business* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1993), citations on pp. 48-49, p. 60, p. 62, p. 73, p. 74, p. 76.

Robert C. Fuller (Philosophy, Bradley University, Peoria, IL) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in "American Pragmatism Reconsidered: William James' Ecological Ethic" in *Environmental Ethics* 14(1992):159-176, citation on p. 165.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Cardiff, Wales) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic," naming Rolston as one of a significant group of philosophers protesting moral atomism in favor of ethical holism. In "Methods of Ecological Ethics," *Metaphilosophy* 14 (Nos. 3 & 4, July/October 1983):195-208, citation on p. 201.

Frederick Ferré (Philosophy, University of Georgia) cites "Values in Nature" in reference to the principal discussions of values in nature in the contemporary philosophical literature. In "Personalism and the Dignity of Nature," *The Personalist Forum* 2(1986):1-28, citation on p. 27.

Anthony Weston (Philosophy, State University of New York, Stony Brook) cites "The Human Standing in Nature: Storied Fitness in the Moral Observer" as the best defense of the human place in natural history. This results from Rolston's use of argument combined with narrative. In *Toward Better Problems: New Perspectives on Abortion, Animal Rights, the Environment, and Justice* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press), citations on pp. 115-117, p. 200.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites "Values in Nature" for its defense of objective properties in nature that carry value. In "Aldo Leopold's Metaphor," pages 42-56 in Robert Costanza, Bryan G. Norton, and Benjamin D. Haskell, eds., *Ecosystem Health: New Goals for Environmental Management*, citation on p. 43, p. 56.

Eric Katz (Philosophy, Department of Humanities, New Jersey Institute of Technology) cites "On Behalf of Bioexuberance," "In Defense of Ecosystems," "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone," "Biology without Conservation: An Environmental Misfit and Contradiction in

Terms," "Human Values in Natural Systems, "Respect for Life: Can Zen Buddhism Help?" and "Values Deep in the Woods" in "Environmental Ethics: A Select Annotated Bibliography II, 1987-1990," in *Research in Philosophy and Technology* 12(1992):287-234, citations on pp. 308-309. "Human Values and Natural Systems" is "an elegant descriptive taxonomy of value, with an argument that values in nature are neither subjective nor objective, nature "carries" value. "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone" is "a clear expression of Rolston's environmental philosophy, set against a discussion of park management policy."

Mark S. Boyce (Zoology, University of Wyoming) cites "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone" in a discussion of the ethics of ecosystem management and restoration. In "Natural Regulation or the Control of Nature?" Pages 183-208 in Robert B. Keiter and Mark S. Boyce, eds., *The Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem: Redefining America's Wilderness Heritage* (New Haven: Yale University Press), citation on p. 202, p. 207.

Liu Gocheng, Chao Liancheng, Zhang Zhonglun and Ye Ping (Philosophy and Forestry, Northeast Forestry University, Harbin, China) cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" In *Biosphere and Human Society* (in Chinese) (Beijing: People's Press, 1992), citation on p. 293.

Anthony Weston (Philosophy, State University of New York, Stony Brook) cites "The Human Standing in Nature: Storied Fitness in the Moral Observer" in *Toward Better Problems: New Perspectives on Abortion, Animal Rights, the Environment, and Justice* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1992), p. 116, p. 117, p. 119, p. 200.

Robert Elliot (Philosophy, University of New England, Australia) cites, "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in "Intrinsic Value, Environmental Obligation, and Naturalness," *The Monist* 75(1992):138-160, citations on p. 143, p. 157.

C. Mark Colwell (Geography and Planning, Memphis State University) cites and quotes from "Can and Ought We To Follow Nature?" in "Ecological Restoration and Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 15(1993):19-32, citation on p. 28.

Sean Smith and John Haldane (Philosophy, University of St. Andrews, Scotland and Director, Centre for Philosophy and Public Affairs, University of St. Andrews) cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Values in Nature" as the two key articles historically and conceptually in developing an environmental ethic. As a result, "environmental ethics and philosophical aspects of nature conservation are now subjects of study in their own right. They cannot any longer view viewed simply as topics of interest within general philosophy or even mere branches of the philosophy of value." Following the discussion launched by Rolston's key article, the field has developed and "the relevant literature is very extensive and much of it is advanced" (p. ii, p. 1). They also cite "Can and Ought We To Follow Nature?" (p. 6), "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" (p. 8), "Values Gone Wild" (p. 8), "Duties to Ecosystems," (p. 14), "The Human Standing in Nature: Storied Fitness in the Moral Observer" (p. 8), "Just Environmental Business" (p. 32), "Valuing Wildlands" (p. 32), "Nature and Human Emotions" (p. 52). In *Environmental Philosophy: A Bibliography* (St. Andrews, Scotland: Center for Philosophy and Public Affairs, and the United Kingdom Nature Conservancy Council, 1990).

George Bradford (Editor, *The Fifth Estate*, Detroit) cites and quotes from "Duties to Ecosystems," following the "insight" in "Rolston's argument" about intrinsic, instrumental, and systemic value. In "Toward a Deep Social Ecology," in Michael E. Zimmerman, J. Baird Callicott, George Sessions, Karen J. Warren, and John Clark, eds., *Environmental Philosophy: From Animal Rights to Radical Ecology* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1993, pp. 418-437, citations on p. 427, p. 431, p. 432, p. 435, p. 436.

Robert Paehlke and Douglas Torgerson (both, Political Science, Trent University, Peterborough, Ontario) cite "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" and "A Forest Ethic and Multivalue Forest Management" in "Environmental Politics and the Administrative State." In Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler, eds., *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1993), pp. 265-274, citation on p. 274.

Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler (Humboldt State University, California) cite "Wildlife and Wildlands: A Christian Perspective," in Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler, eds., *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1993), p. 514.

Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler cite "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature," and "Respect for Life: Can Zen Buddhism Help in Forming an Environmental Ethic?" in Susan Armstrong and Richard Botzler, eds., *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1993), p. 563.

The Journal of Forestry uses Rolston's position on values in forests as one of the reference positions on a spectrum from left through center and right in a survey of forester's positions on values. In "The JOF Land Ethic Political Test," *Journal of Forestry* 89(no. 5, May, 1991):38.

Liu Gocheng, Chao Liancheng, Zhang Zonglun and Ye Ping cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" "Holmes Rolston has made an important and detailed study showing how to combine ecological law with social ethics so that ecological law can be transferred to morality" (translated from Chinese). In *Biosphere and Human Society* (translated from Chinese title), (Beijing: People's Press, 1992), citation on p. 292-293.

Andrew Brennan (Philosophy, University of Western Australia) cites "Valuing Wildlands" as "well-informed criticism of cost-benefit analysis. In "Environmental Decision-Making", pp. 1-19 in R. J. Berry, ed., *Environmental Dilemmas: Ethics and Decisions* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1993). Citation on p. 13.

E. Phil Pister (California Fish and Wildlife and Desert Fishes Council) cites "Duties to Ecosystems" and "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility" in "Ethical Considerations in Conservation of Biodiversity." Pages 355-364 in *Transactions of the 57th North American Wildlife and Natural Resources Conference* (Washington, DC: Wildlife Management Institute, 1992), citations on p. 362, p. 364.

Ian Barbour (Physics, Theology, Carleton College) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in *Ethics in an Age of Technology: The Gifford Lectures*, vol. II (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1993), citation on p. 62, p. 273.

Marek M. Bonenburg (Philosophy, Jagellonian University of Cracow), in the first book on environmental ethics published in Poland cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?", "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World," "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?", "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?", "Values Gone Wild," and "Valuing Wildlands." In *Etyka Srodowiskowa: Zalozenia i Kierunki* (= *Environmental Ethics: Assumptions and Trends*) (Cracow: Jagellonian University, Institute of Philosophy, 1992). Citations on pp. 13, 89, 90, 146.

Steven J. Bissell (Director, Wildlife Interpretation, Colorado Division of Wildlife) cites "Disvalues in Nature" as introducing a relevant category of disvalue, which he uses in the formulation of wildlife policy in state wildlife and natural resource agencies. In *Ethical Issues in State Wildlife Policy: A Qualitative Analysis*, a Ph.D. dissertation in the Graduate School of Public Affairs, University of Denver, Spring 1993. Citations on p. 74, p. 198.

Tom Settle (Philosophy, University of Guelph, Ontario) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" "I endorse the protest of Holmes Rolston, III (1982) against that way of reading biology's contribution to knowledge [that all nonhuman nature is without value]." In "Fitness and Altruism": Traps for the Unwary, Bystander and Biologist Alike," *Biology and Philosophy* 8(1993):61-83, citation on p. 62, p. 82.

Kristin Shrader-Frechette (Philosophy, University of South Florida) cites Rolston on cost benefit analysis of natural and wild resources. In *Risk and Rationality: Philosophical Foundations for Populist Reforms* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1991), p. 178.

Lynton Keith Caldwell (Political Science, University of Indiana) and Kristin Shrader-Frechette (Philosophy, University of South Florida) cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Duties to Ecosystems." In *Policy for Land: Law and Ethics* (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 1993). Citations on p. 50, p. 57, p. 211, p. 269, p. 217, p. 271, p. 299, p. 300, p. 301.

Max Kaplan (Leisure Research, Senoia, Georgia) cites "Beyond Recreational Value: The Greater Outdoors." "Holmes Rolston, III comments in an unusually penetrating way on the leisure experience of being in nature." He has "set the standard for similarly sensitive analyses of other leisure prototypes." In "Apostles of Accuracy: Exploration, Significance: Generational Differences Among Leisure Scholars," *Loisir et société/ Society and Leisure* 15(1992):645-656, citation on pp. 649-650, 653.

Geoffrey B. Frasz (Philosophy, Community College of Southern Nevada, Las Vegas) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?", "Values Gone Wild," and "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility," quoting extensively from the latter as importantly challenging an environmental virtue ethics. In "Environmental Virtue Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 15(1993):259-274, citations on pp. 270-171.

L. I. Vasilenko and V. E. Ermolaeva (Institute of Philosophy, Russian Academy of Sciences) translate "Is There an Ecological Ethics?" as a critical article illustrating changing perceptions in global problems and human values. In L. I. Vasilenko and V. E. Ermolaeva, eds., *Globalniye Problemy i Obshchechelovecheskiye Tsennosti (Global Problems and Human Values)* (Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1990), pp. 258-288.

Stephen R. Kellert (Forestry and Environmental Studies, Yale University) cites "Beauty and the Beast: Aesthetic Experience of Wildlife" for Rolston's analysis of the aesthetic experience of wildlife as "spontaneity in motion." In "The Biological Basis for Human Values of Nature." Pages 42-69 in Stephen R. Kellert and Edward O. Wilson, eds., *The Biophilia Hypothesis* (Washington: Island Press, 1993), citation on p. 50, p. 69.

Richard B. Primack (Biology, Boston University) cites "Values in Nature," "Valuing Wildlands," "Duties to Endangered Species (*BioScience*)," "On Behalf of Bioexuberance," "In Defense of Ecosystems," "Biology without Conservation: An Environmental Misfit and a Contradiction in Terms," and "Duties to Endangered Species (*Encyclopedia of Environmental Biology*)" as primary sources where "a leading environmental philosopher lays out the ethical arguments for preserving biological diversity." In *Essentials of Conservation Biology* (Sunderland, MA: Sinauer Associates, 1993), p. 222, p. 240, p. 241, p. 539, p. 540. See also *Essentials of Conservation Biology*, 2nd ed. (Sunderland, MA: Sinauer Associates, Publishers, 1998), similarly.

Frederick Ferré (Philosophy, University of Georgia) analyses Rolston's account of the differences between nature and culture, as having "many strengths," though needing more affirmation of the unique values of human personhood. Rolston's position and that of J.

Baird Callicott are "two prominent positions," "the main contenders for environmental ethics." He cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed." In "Persons in Nature: Toward an Applicable and Unified Environmental Ethics," *Zygon* 28(1993):441-453, citations p. 441, p. 442, p. 448, p. 449, p. 453. Also in *Ethics and the Environment* 1(1996):15-25, citations passim.

Per Ariansen (Philosophy, University of Oslo) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective," as presenting one of the leading theories of natural value. In *Miljøfilosofi: En Innføring (Environmental Philosophy: An Introduction)*. (Oslo: Universitetsforlaget, 1992), citations on pp. 113-114, p. 240 The is also in the Swedish translation, Per Ariansen, *Miljöfilosofi: En Introduktion* (Nora: Bokförlaget Nya Doxa, 1993) (translated by Per Lennart Mansson), pp. 109-110, p. 235.

Douglas E. Booth (Natural Resource Economics, Marquette University) cites "Values in Nature" and "Valuing Wildlands." In *Valuing Nature: The Decline and Preservation of Old-Growth Forests* (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 1993), citations p. 257.

Elizabeth J. Farnsworth (Botany, University of Vermont) and Judy Rosovsky (Entomology Research Laboratory, University of Vermont) cite Rolston's ethical analysis in "Duties to Endangered Species" and "Values in Nature." In "The Ethics of Ecological Field Experimentation," *Conservation Biology* 7(1993):463-472, citations on p. 464, p. 465, p. 472.

Carl F. Koch (Science, Riverside-Brookfield High School, Riverside, Illinois) uses "Ethical Responsibilities toward Wildlife" as the basis for a unit, "Ethics and Wild Animals," for high school students on the conservation of wildlife. Lesson # 21 in *Aldo Leopold's Sand County Almanac: Bridging Science and the Humanities with Ethics* (Riverside, IL: Riverside-Brookfield High School, 1993).

Steven J. Bissell (Director, Environmental Interpretation, Colorado Division of Wildlife) says of "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" (in Borman and Kellert volume): "Among environmental philosophers Holmes Rolston III justifiably deserves a permanent chair. Rolston ... has developed one of the so-called 'land ethics,' after the seminal thoughts of Leopold. Rolston's theory of value has become one of the strongest arguments for a unified view of human relationships with and in nature. He has distilled this argument into a single essay for this volume. ... You will not be disappointed with this view of ethical relations with nature." In "Together Again for the Very First Time," *Conservation Biology* 6(1992):608-610, citation on p. 609.

Stephen R. Kellert (Forestry & Environmental Studies, Yale University) cites "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" for its analysis of the biodiversity crisis. In "Values and Perceptions of Invertebrates," *Conservation Biology* 7(1993):845-855, citation on p. 845, pp. 854-855.

Kristin Shrader-Frechette (Philosophy, University of South Florida) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and its discussion of the balance of nature. In "Ecological Theories and Ethical Imperatives: Can Ecology Provide a Scientific Justification for the Ethics of Environmental Protection?" Pages 73-104 in William R. Shea and Beat Sitter, eds., *Scientists and their Responsibilities* (Canton, MA: Watson Publishing International, 1989), citations on p. 90, p. 91, p. 92, p. 96.

Beat Sitter (Secretary General of the Swiss Academy of Humanities and Swiss Academy of Sciences) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" In "In Defence of Nonanthropocentrism in Environmental Ethics." Pages 105-145 in William R. Shea and Beat Sitter, eds., *Scientists and their Responsibilities* (Canton, MA: Watson Publishing International, 1989), citations on

p. 134, p. 136, p. 143.

Peter List (Philosophy, Oregon State University) cites Rolston on the metaphysical, past the utilitarian, issues that foresters face in the conservation and preservation of old-growth forests. "The Old Growth Forest Debate," *Reflections* (Newsletter of the Program for Ethics, Science, and the Environment, Oregon State University), vol. 1, no. 1 (January, 1994):1-2, citation on p. 1.

Karl Hess (Range Management, Las Cruces, NM) cites Rolston's analysis of what, philosophically, "playing God" might and might not mean in natural parks management, from "Yellowstone: We Must Allow It to Change" and "Philosophy and Biology in Yellowstone." In *Rocky Times in Rocky Mountain National Park* (Niwot, CO: University Press of Colorado, 1993) citations on p. 81, p. 82, p. 99, p. 148, p. 152.

Lori Gruen and Dale Jamieson, in an anthology on environmental philosophy, say, "By bringing the writings of such leading environmental philosophers as Holmes Rolston III and Paul Taylor together with texts by such prominent moral philosophers as Jonathan Glover and Bernard Williams, we have tried to illuminate some of the connections between environmental philosophy and the philosophical tradition. They reprint two articles, "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World," and "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed." In Lori Gruen and Dale Jamieson, eds., *Reflecting on Nature: Readings in Environmental Philosophy* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994) pp. 65--84, pp. 265-278, citation on p. xi.

Robin Attfield (University of Wales, Cardiff) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as "a seminal paper" in *Environmental Philosophy: Principles and Prospects* (Aldershot, Hants: Avebury, 1994), citation on p. 96, p. 104, pp. 127-128, p. 131, p. 132, p. 133, p. 148, p. 252. He also cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," p. 240, p. 242, p. 252.

John O'Neill (Philosophy, Lancaster University, UK) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in *Ecology, Policy and Politics: Human Well-Being and the Natural World* (London: Routledge, 1993), citations on p. 150, p. 184, p. 201, p. 217.

Nancy Diaz (Ecologist, Mt. Hood and Gifford Pinchot National Forests) and Dean Apostol (Landscape architect, Mt. Hood National Forest) cite "Values Deep in the Woods" in *Forest Landscape Analysis and Design* (U. S. Forest Service, Pacific Northwest Region, R6 Eco-TP-043-92, USGPO 1993-583-588, 1993), citation in sec. 2.14.

David Gosling (Clare Hall, University of Cambridge) finds that "Holmes Rolston, III, a philosopher from Colorado State University, has some trenchant comments to make about the Judaeo-Christian tradition" in "God and Endangered Species." Review of Lawrence S. Hamilton, ed., *Ethics, Religion and Biodiversity* in *Environmental Values* 3(1994):89-90.

Robert Elliot (Philosophy, University of New England, Armidale, Australia) uses Rolston's analysis of the differences between nature and culture from "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" to analyze the concept of wildland restoration and the kinds of values at stake in such restoration. In "Extinction, Restoration, Naturalness," *Environmental Ethics* 16(1994):135-144, citation on p. 143.

John M. Gowdy (Economics, Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute) and Peg R. Olsen (Director, Eastern New York Chapter, The Nature Conservancy) cite Rolston's principle that one ought to make explicit the latent value judgments in quantitative economic analysis of environmental issues, showing these latent values present in neoclassical environmental

economics, resulting in inadequate valuation of natural resources. In "Further Problems with Neoclassical Environmental Economics," *Environmental Ethics* 16(1994):161-171, citation on p. 161.

Konrad Ott (Philosophy, University of Frankfurt, University of Tübingen) analyzes Rolston's position in "Is There an Ecological Ethic" in *Ökologie und Ethik: Ein Versuch praktischer Philosophie (Ecology and Ethics: An Attempt at Practical Philosophy)* (Tübingen: Attempto Verlag, 1993). Citations and analysis on p. 17, p. 137, pp. 152-153, pp. 159-161, p. 187.

Raymond E. Grizzle (Biology, Campbell University, North Carolina) cites "Rights and Responsibilities on the Home Planet" in "Environmentalism Should Include Human Ecological Needs," *BioScience* 44(1994):263-268, citation on p. 264, p. 268.

Eero Paloheimo (Finnish philosopher and member of the Finnish Parliament) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in *Maan Tie (The Way of the Earth)* (Helsinki: Werner Söderström Osakeyhtiö, 1989), p. 248.

Avner de-Shalit (Political Science, Hebrew University, Jerusalem) cites "The River of Life: Past, Present, and Future" and "Respect for Life: Can Zen Buddhism Help in Forming an Environmental Ethic?" In *Why Posterity Matters* (London: Routledge, 1994), citation on p. 215.

Alastair S. Gunn (Philosophy, University of Waikato, New Zealand) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" In "Can Environmental Ethics Save the World?" Pages 195-216 in Frederick Ferré and Peter Hartel, eds., *Ethics and Environmental Policy: Theory Meets Practice* (Athens, University of Georgia Press, 1994), citation on p. 207, p. 216.

Robert Elliot (Philosophy, University of New England, Armidale, NSW, Australia) cites and discusses Rolston's value theory in "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value." In "Ecology and the Ethics of Environmental Restoration," pages 31-43 in Robin Attfield and Andrew Belsey, eds., *Philosophy and the Natural Environment* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), citations on pp. 32-33.

Frederick Ferré (Philosophy, University of Georgia) cites Rolston's "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value" in "Highlights and Connections," pages 227-232 in Robin Attfield and Andrew Belsey, eds., *Philosophy and the Natural Environment* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), citations passim.

Robert Elliot (Philosophy, University of New England, Armidale, NSW, Australia) cites and discusses "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" for its analysis of the differences between nature and culture. In "Ecology and the Ethics of Environmental Restoration," pages 31-43 in Robin Attfield and Andrew Belsey, eds., *Philosophy and the Natural Environment* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), citations on pp. 41-42.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Cardiff, Wales) cites and analyzes "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed." "Rolston ably defends the concept of wilderness" (p. 51). J. Baird Callicott's alternative concepts "are trenchantly criticized by Rolston, as are his [Callicott's] attempts to represent human activities in general as natural" (p. 56). Attfield also cites Rolston's *Environmental Ethics* for its fuller discussion of metaphysical value theory (p. 57). In "Rehabilitating Nature and Making Nature Habitable," pages 45-57 in Robin Attfield and Andrew Belsey, eds., *Philosophy and the Natural Environment* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), citations passim.

Keekok Lee (Philosophy, University of Manchester) cites "The Preservation of Natural Value in the Solar System" in "Awe and Humility: Intrinsic Value in Nature," pages 89-101 in

Robin Attfield and Andrew Belsey, eds., *Philosophy and the Natural Environment* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), citations on p. 90. p. 97.

Nigel Hawkes cites "The Preservation of Natural Value in the Solar System" in "Greening the Red Planet," in *Geographical Magazine*, February 1993, pp. 20-23.

Vincente Medina (Philosophy, Seton Hall University, New Jersey) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" In "The Nature of Environmental Values." Pages 61-71 in John Martin Gilroy, ed., *Environmental Risk, Environmental Values, and Political Choices* (Boulder, Co: Westview Press, 1993), citation on p. 67, p. 71.

Tim Hayward (Philosophy, University of Glamorgan, Wales) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Ecology and Human Emancipation," *Radical Philosophy* (Caterbury, Kent, UK) 62 (Autumn, 1992):3-13, citation on p. 13.

Nancey Murphey (Philosophy, Fuller Theological Seminary) cites and quotes from "Does Nature Need to Be Redeemed?" as "a marvelous paper." In "Before the Beginning: Comments from a Philosopher," *CTNS Bulletin: The Center for Theology and the Natural Sciences* 14 (no. 2, spring 1994):15-17, citation on p. 17.

Karen Warren (Philosophy, Macalaster College) and Jim Cheney (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Waukesha) cite and quote from Rolston's review of Andren Brennan, *Thinking about Nature*, on the importance of separating atomic and ecological levels when understanding natural systems. In "Ecosystem Ecology and Metaphysical Ecology: A Case Study," *Environmental Ethics* 15(1993):99-116, citation on p. 109.

C. Mark Cowell (Geography, Memphis State University) cites and quote from "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" for its discussion differing sense of following nature, particularly the axiological and the artifactual senses. In "Ecological Restoration and Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 15(1993):19-32, citations on p. 28.

David Loy (Faculty of International Studies, Bunkyo University, Kyoto, Japan) cites "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?" for its analysis of the ecological ramifications of the cosmological metaphor of Indra's net in Buddhism. In "Indra's Postmodern Net," *Philosophy East and West* 43 (no. 3, 1993):481-510, citation on p. 483, p. 509.

Mark I. Wallace (Religion, Swarthmore College) cites "Wildlife and Wildlands: A Christian Perspective" for its analysis of nonhuman values in nature as understood by Biblical authors. In "The Wild Bird Who Heals: Recovering the Spirit in Nature," *Theology Today* 50 (no. 1, 1993):13-28, citation on p. 23.

Kristin Shrader-Frechette (Philosophy, University of South Florida) cites "Duties to Endangered Species," for its replies to charges that holism in environmental ethics invites environmental fascism. Pages 57-78 in "Sustainability and Environmental Ethics," in Gunnar Skirbekk, ed., *The Notion of Sustainability and its Normative Implications* (Stockholm: Scandanavian University Press, 1994), citation on p. 66, p. 76.

R. Edward Grumbine (Sierra Institute, University of California Extension, Santa Cruz) cites "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone" and "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" for the discussion of value in wilderness. In "Wildness, Wise Use, and Sustainable Development," *Environmental Ethics* 16(1994):227-249, citations on pp. 227-228, p. 235.

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, College of Charleston) cites "Treating Animals Naturally" in "Valuing Predation in Rolston's Environmental Ethics: Bambi Lovers versus Tree Huggers," *Environmental Ethics* 16(1994):3-20, citation on p. 3.

Douglas E. Booth (Economics, Marquette University) cites "Values in Nature" as a leading example of a theory of objective, intrinsic value in nature, a theory that cannot be handled by cost-benefit analyses in economics. In "Ethics and the Limits of Environmental Economics," *Ecological Economics* 9(1994):241-252, citation on p. 242, p. 252.

Hampicke, Ulrich (Economics, Gesamthochschule/Universität Kassel, Germany) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" as an example of an important paper defending intrinsic value in nature "very demanding intellectually and morally." In "Ethics and Economics of Conservation," *Biological Conservation* 67(1994):219-231, citation on p. 220, p. 231.

Edwin P. Pister (California Department of Fish and Game) cites "Duties to Endangered Species" for its argument that we have direct duties to species. In "Desert Fishes: An Interdisciplinary Approach to Endangered Species Conservation in North America," *Journal of Fish Biology* (UK) 37(1990): Supplement A: 183-187, citation on p. 187.

Douglas H. Erbeck (Veterinary Medicine, Hopkinsville, KY) comments on Rolston's claim in "Ethical Responsibilities toward Wildlife" that compassion may be misplaced toward wildlife, finding compassion often appropriate. In "Opinions on Responsibility toward Wildlife," *Journal of the American Veterinary Medical Association* 200 (no. 10, May 15, 1992):1447-1450.

D. Philip Sponenberg (Veterinary Medicine, Blacksburg, VA) comments on Rolston's claim in "Ethical Responsibilities toward Wildlife" that feral animals ought to be removed from wildlands, arguing that in some cases the conservation of their gene pools can be appropriate. In "Opinions on Responsibility toward Wildlife," *Journal of the American Veterinary Medical Association* 200 (no. 10, May 15, 1992):1447-1450.

Duffus, David A., and Philip Dearden (Geography, University of Victoria, British Columbia) cite "Valuing Wildlands" for its analysis of the limits of economic valuation of wildland and wildlife resources. In "Recreational Use, Valuation, and Management of Killer Whales (*Orcinus orca*) on Canada's Pacific Coast," *Environmental Conservation* 20 (no. 2, Summer):149-156, citation on p. 151, p. 156.

Malcom L. Hunter, Jr. (Forest Resources, University of Maine) cites "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" for its analysis of following nature as this bears on wildfires and timber management. In "Natural Fire Regimes as Spatial Models for Managing Boreal Forests," *Biological Conservation* 65(1993):115-120, citation on p. 120.

Michael E. Douglas (Zoology, Arizona State University) cites "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility," for its analysis of reasons for saving the humpback chub, an endangered fish. In "Analysis of Sexual Dimorphism in an Endangered Cyprinid Fish (*Gila cypha* Miller) Using Video Image Technology," *Copeia* (American Society of Ichthyologists and Herpetologists) 1993 (no. 2):334-343, citation on p. 334, p. 342.

J. M. Bowker (U.S. Forest Service, Athens, GA) and H. F. MacDonald (Agricultural and Applied Economics, University of Georgia) cite "Valuing Wildlands" for its analysis of how willingness-to-pay surveys understate conservation values. In "An Economic Analysis of Localized Pollution: Rendering Emissions in a Residential Setting," *Canadian Journal of Agricultural Economics / Revue canadienne d'économie rurale* 41 (no. 1, March 1993):45-59, citation on p. 47, 57.

James N. Butler (Division of Applied Sciences, Harvard University), James Burnett-Herkes (Secretary, Bermuda Ministry of the Environment), John A. Barnes (Director, Agriculture, Fisheries, and Parks, Bermuda), and Jack Ward (Agriculture, Fisheries, and Parks,

Bermuda) cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" for its critique of Garrett Hardin's tragedy of the commons. In "The Bermuda Fisheries: A Tragedy of the Commons Averted?", *Environment* 35(no. 1, 1993):6-15, 25-33, citation on p. 15, p. 33.

Robert G. Wagner (Ontario Forest Research Institute, Sault Ste. Marie, Ontario) cites "A Forest Ethic and Multivalued Forest Management" as a principal example of recent literature "more clearly defining what forest managers must sustain" by a "re-examination of their forest ethic ... central to the debate over forest values." In "Research Directions to Advance Forest Vegetation Management in North America," *Canadian Journal of Forest Research / Revue canadienne de recherche forestière* 23 (no. 10, 1993):2317-2327, citation on p. 2217, p. 2326.

James G. Sikarskie (Veterinary Medicine, Veterinary Medical College, Michigan State University) cites "Ethical Responsibilities toward Wildlife" for its analysis of whether humans ought to help injured and diseased wildlife. In "The Role of Veterinary Medicine in Wildlife Rehabilitation," *Journal of Zoo and Wildlife Medicine* (American Association of Zoo Veterinarians) 23 (no. 4, 1992):397-400, citations passim.

David Lowenthal (Geography, University College, London) cites "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature," for its analysis of the characteristics in nature that humans might or might not be said to follow. In "Environmental Conflict," *Research and Exploration* (National Geographic) 7(no. 3, Summer, 1991):266-275, citation on p. 268, 275.

Alyson C. Flournoy (Law, University of Florida) cites "A Forest Ethic and Multivalued Forest Management" as an important sign in the evolution of U. S. Forest Service values toward the recognition of land ethic and noneconomic values in forests. She also cites "Property Rights and Endangered Species" for its arguments that "deeper thinking about the ESA's [Endangered Species Act's] ethic may advance our understanding of the relationship between law and ethics in this area." In "Beyond the 'Spotted Owl Problem': Learning from the Old-Growth Controversy," *Harvard Environmental Law Review* 17(no. 2, 1993):261-332, citations on p. 303, p. 327.

Viriato Soromenho-Marques (Philosophy, Universidade de Lisboa) cites "Rights and Responsibilities on the Home Planet." In *Regressar à Terra: Consciência Ecológica e Política de Ambiente (Return to the Earth: Ecological Conscience and the Politics of the Environment)* (Lisbon: Fim de Século, 1994), citation on p. 75, p. 78.

Gus diZerega (Institute of Government Studies, University of California, Berkeley) calls Rolston "one of the most astute environmental philosophers," citing Rolston's portrayal of the blending of both competition and cooperation in the natural world, tracing relationships that are "extremely subtle." He quotes extensively from "Duties to Ecosystems," also elaborating on Rolston's arguments about how spontaneous order arises in both ecosystems and in certain social systems, such as markets and language. In "Social Ecology, Deep Ecology, and Liberalism," *Critical Review* 6 (nos. 2-3, 1992):305-370, citations on p. 325, p. 327, pp. 328-329, p. 335, p. 345, p. 364, p. 365, p. 366, p. 368.

Clive Seligman (Psychology, University of Western Ontario) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" for its arguments that deepening personal values often coincide with a person's becoming more ethical environmentally. In "Environmental Ethics," *Journal of Social Issues* 45 (no. 1, 1989):169-184, citations on p. 175, pp. 176-177, p. 184.

Christopher H. Schroeder (Law, Duke University) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as an important article illustrating the way "the field of environmental ethics ... has expanded tremendously" in the environmental era. In "Rights Against Risks," *Columbia Law Review* 86(1986):495-562, citation on pp. 504-505.

Roger Bolton (Economics and Environmental Studies, Williams College, Maine) cites "Values in Nature," and "Just Environmental Business" for the "interesting discussions of 'humanistic' versus 'naturalistic' values," and finds convincing the argument that nature is a "carrier" of values, though he remains unconvinced that there are intrinsic natural values. In "Integrating Economic and Environmental Models: Some Preliminary Considerations," *Socio-Economic Planning Sciences* 23 (nos. 1-2, 1989):25-37, citations on p. 32, p. 37.

Richard J. Lazarus (Law, Washington University) cites "Property Rights and Endangered Species" for its "discussion of the ongoing evolutionary process in property law in the context of ... the ownership of wildlife." In "Debunking Environmental Feudalism: Promoting the Individual Through the Collective Pursuit of Environmental Quality," *Iowa Law Review* 77(1992):1739-1774, citation on p. 1755.

Zhi Xu (Forest Resource Policy and Economics, the University of Minnesota) cites "Valuing Wildlands" for its challenging of the traditional uses of forests in favor of emphases on sustainability and biodiversity conservation. In "Assessing Distributional Impacts of Forest Policies and Projects," *Evaluation Review* 18 (no. 3, 1994):281-311, citation on pp. 285-286, p. 310.

Strachan Donnelley, Charles R. McCarthy, and Rivers Singleton, Jr. (Hastings Center for Bioethics) cite "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural Environment," for its discussion of intrinsic value in nature. In "The Brave New World of Animal Technology," *Hastings Center Report* 24, no. 1 (1994), special supplement, pages S1-S31, citations on p. S20, S23, S31.

Brent S. Steel (Political Science, Washington State University, Vancouver), Peter List (Philosophy, Oregon State University), and Bruce Shindler (Forest Resources, Oregon State University) cite "A Forest Ethic and Multivalue Forest Management" as representative of literature that applies a newly emerging, biocentric value system to forestry. In "Conflicting Values About Federal Forests: A Comparison of National and Oregon Politics," *Society and Natural Resources* 7(1994):137-153, citation on p. 139, p. 153.

P. G. Fairweather (Graduate School of the Environment, Macquarie University, NSW, Australia) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" repeatedly as an example of a philosopher intelligently linking ethics with ecology. He also cites "Valuing Wildlands" for its argument that economic measures do not capture all of the values associated with wildlands. In "Links between Ecology and Ecophilosophy, Ethics and the Requirements of Environmental Management," *Australian Journal of Ecology* 18(1993):3-19, citations on p. 4, p. 6, p. 7, p. 8, p. 19.

Adam Cole-King (Department of Maritime Studies and International Transport, University of Wales, Cardiff) cites "Valuing Wildlands" for its challenging the adequacy of the economic valuing of wildlands. In "Marine Conservation: A New Policy Area," *Marine Policy* 17 (no. 3, May, 1993):171-185, citation on p. 178.

Freya Matthews (Philosophy, LaTrobe University, Australia) cites "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" for its arguments about the gift of life in nature. In "Relating to Nature: Deep Ecology or Ecofeminism?" *The Trumpeter* 11 (no. 4, Fall 1994):159-166, citation on p. 161, p. 166.

Gregory Robin, Sara Lichtenstein, and Paul Slovic (all with Decision Research, Eugene, Oregon) cite "Values in Nature" for its philosophical analysis of a broad spectrum of diverse values that persons find in nature, of which economists find it difficult to take account with contingent valuation methods. In "Valuing Environmental Resources: A Constructive

Approach," *Journal of Risk and Uncertainty* 7(1993):177-197, citation on pp. 183-184, p. 196.

Glenn Parton (South Fork Mountain Defense, Weaverville, CA) dislikes Rolston's separation of nature and culture in "Wilderness Reaffirmed," arguing that humans find their fullest lives in a return to wilderness. In "The Rise of Primitivism and the Fall of Civilization: A Reply to J. B. Callicott and Holmes Rolston, III, on Wilderness," *The Environmental Professional* 16(1994):366-373, citations passim.

Iiris Lappalainen (Staff, Suomen Luonnonsuojeluliitto, Finnish Association for Nature Conservation) cites Rolston's work in environmental aesthetics. Pages 18-21 in "Kohtaamisia maisemassa" in *Suomen Luonto (Nature in Finland)* no. 10, 1994, citation on p. 21.

Franz M. Wuketits (Institut für Wissenschaftstheorie, Universität Wien, Austria) cites "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone" as a "quite interesting discussion" of values in nature. In "Moral Systems as Evolutionary Systems: Taking Evolutionary Ethics Seriously," *Journal of Social and Evolutionary Systems* 16(3):251-271, citation on p. 257, p. 268, p. 270.

Jeffrey C. Dobbins (Law, Rutgers University) analyzes Rolston's criticisms of contingent valuation of nature and natural resources in "Valuing Wildlands." Rolston argues that "attempting to fit nonuse values into a system of economic valuation cheapens the values and the resources from which they derive by forcing them into the very anthropocentric structure that intrinsic existence values are attempting to escape" (p. 936), one of the most effective philosophical criticisms that shows why the intrinsic value of nature cannot be reduced to human sense of loss expressed in monetary terms. In "The Pain and Suffering of Environmental Loss: Using Contingent Valuation to Estimate Nonuse Damages," *Duke Law Journal* 43(1994):879-946, citations on p. 896, p. 903, p. 909, p. 928, p. 936, p. 943.

John B. Cobb, Jr. (School of Theology at Claremont) cites "Respect for Life: Christians, Creation, and Environmental Ethics" (*CTNS Bulletin*) in a bibliography of the main relevant literature. In *Is It Too Late? A Theology of Ecology*, revised edition, (Denton, TX: Environmental Ethics Books, 1995), citation on p. 105.

James M. Gustafson (Theology, Emory University) says that "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" (in the Bormann-Kellert anthology) is "an excellent chapter on ecological ethics" (p. 20). Again, lamenting the failure of other authors and editors to incorporate Rolston's perspective in works from other disciplines (p. 125). In *A Sense of the Divine: The Natural Environment from a Theocentric Perspective* (Cleveland: OH: The Pilgrim Press, 1994).

J. M. Howarth (Philosophy, Lancaster University, U.K.) cites "Challenges in Environmental Ethics" for its concept of systemic value in nature. In "The Crisis of Ecology: A Phenomenological Perspective," *Environmental Values* 4(1995):17-30, citation on p. 18, p. 29, p. 30.

R. Edward Grumbine (Sierra Institute, University of California, San Diego) cites "Dutes to Ecosystems" for its concept of species as having their value in ecosystems. In "Three Bear Stories: Toward a Sustainable Resource Management Future." Pages 367-380 in Richard L. Knight and Sarah F. Bates, eds., *A New Century for Natural Resources Management* (Washington, DC: Island Press, 1995), citations on p. 370, p. 380.

Ke Chung Kim (Center for Biodiversity Research, Pennsylvania State University) and Robert D. Weaver (Agricultural Economics and Rural Sociology, Pennsylvania State

University) cite "Creation: God and Endangered Species," In "Biodiversity and Humanity: Paradox and Challenge," in Kim and Weaver, eds., *Biodiversity and Landscapes: A Paradox of Humanity* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994), pages 3-27, citation on p. 9, p. 25.

John O'Neill (Philosophy, Lancaster University, U.K) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" for its account of human relatedness to nature. In "Humanism and Nature," *Radical Philosophy* 66 (Spring 1994):21-30, citation on p. 26, p. 30.

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, College of Charleston) cites "Property Rights and Endangered Species" for its argument that landowners do not own the wildlife on their lands, nor the species of animals or plants. He also cites "Wildlife and Wildlands: A Christian Perspective" in a similar connection. In "Patenting Life: Biotechnology, Intellectual Property, and Environmental Ethics," *Boston College Environmental Affairs Law Review* 22(1995):267-305, citations on p. 287.

Judith N. Scoville (Ethics, Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Genes, Genesis and God in Natural History." In "Value Theory and Ecology in Environmental Ethics: A Comparison of Rolston and Niebuhr," *Environmental Ethics* 17(1995):115-133, citations passim.

Richard Primack (Biology, Boston University) cites "Duties to Endangered Species" for its analysis of duties at the level of species in conservation biology. In *A Primer of Conservation Biology* (Sunderland, MA: Sinauer Associates, 1995), citation on p. 48.

James E. Coufal and Charles M. Spuches (Environmental Sciences and Forestry, SUNY, Syracuse, NY) cite: "A Forest Ethic and Multivalued Forest Management," "Property Rights and Endangered Species," "Whose Woods These Are: Are Genetic Resources Private Property or Global Commons?," "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value," and "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed." In *Environmental Ethics in Practice: Developing a Personal Ethic* (Syracuse, NY: SUNY College of Environmental Science and Forestry, 1995), p. 91, p. 100, Appendix D3, D12.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Intrinsic Value in Nature: A Metaethical Analysis," *EJAP, The Electronic Journal of Analytic Philosophy*, Issue on *Justifying Value in Nature*, Issue 3 (Spring 1995).

Lynn E. Dwyer, Dennis D. Murphy, and Paul R. Ehrlich (Center for Conservation Biology, Stanford University) cite "Life in Jeopardy on Private Property" In "Property Rights Case Law and the Challenge to the Endangered Species Act," *Conservation Biology* 9(1995):725-741, citations on p. 730, p. 734, p. 741.

R. Edward Grumbine (Sierra Institute, University of California Extension, Santa Cruz) cites "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone" for its discussion of meanings of the word "natural." He cites "Duties to Ecosystems" for its discussion of how endangered species can and ought only be preserved in their ecosystems. He cites "Property Rights and Endangered Species" for its discussion of In *Ghost Bears: Exploring the Biodiversity Crisis* (Washington, DC: Island Press, 1992) citations on p. 208, p. 238, p. 239, p. 270, p. 273.

Michael E. Zimmerman (Philosophy, Tulane University) cites "Challenges in Environmental Ethics" for its account of how natural values are mixed with natural facts. He also cites "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?" for its critique of whether Eastern religions can be helpful in Western environmental decisionmaking. He also cites "Duties to

Ecosystems" for its analysis of the mixture of order and disorder in ecosystems. He also cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" for its critique of J. Baird Callicott's "The Wilderness Idea Revisited." In *Contesting Earth's Future: Radical Ecology and Postmodernity* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994), p. 123, p. 135, pp. 332-333, p. 400, p. 405, p. 430.

Stephen R. Kellert (Forestry and Environmental Studies, Yale University) cites "Respect for Life: Can Zen Buddhism Help in Forming an Environmental Ethic" for its account of differences between Western and Eastern visions of nature. In "Concepts of Nature East and West," pages 103-121 in Michael E. Soulé and Gary Lease, eds., *Reinventing Nature: Responses to Postmodern Deconstruction* (Washington, DC: Island Press, 1995), citation on p. 104, p. 120.

Alfred Borgmann (Philosophy, University of Montana) cites Rolston in the *Monist* special issue on "Intrinsic Value in Nature." In "The Nature of Reality and the Reality of Nature," pages 31-45 in Michael E. Soulé and Gary Lease, eds., *Reinventing Nature: Responses to Postmodern Deconstruction* (Washington, DC: Island Press, 1995), citation on p. 44.

Ann Margaret Flood cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic," "Duties to Ecosystems," "Duties to Endangered Species," "Values in Nature," "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective," and "Beyond Recreational Value: The Greater Outdoors," as key articles developing the philosophical foundations of environmental ethics. In *Eco-morality: The Extension of Moral Development Theory to an Environmental/Ecological Context and the Development of the Flood Relative Presence Scoring Method to Assess Gender-biased Differences in Moral Orientation* (Ph.D. dissertation, The Fielding Institute, 1992), citations on pp. 69, 70, 199.

Almut Beringer cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic," "Values in Nature," and "Science-based versus Traditional Ethics," in *The Moral Ideas of Care and Respect: A Hermeneutic Inquiry into Adolescents' Environmental Ethics and Moral Functioning* (Ph.D. dissertation in Natural Resources at the University of Michigan, 1992), citations on p. 5, p. 8, pp. 229-229.

Susan Quimby Foster (Aquatic Ecologist, Jamestown, CO) cites "Values in Nature" and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in "Wetland Values," Chapter 5, pages 177-214 in John T. Windell, Beatrice E. Willard, David J. Cooper, Susan Q. Foster, Christopher F. Knud-Hansen, Lauranne P. Rink, and George N. Kiladis, *An Ecological Characterization of Rocky Mountain Montane and Subalpine Wetlands* (Washington, DC: U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, National Ecology Center, 1986), citations on p. 178, p. 179, p. 207, p. 263.

David Rothenberg (Philosophy, New Jersey Institute of Technology) analyzes Rolston's position on wilderness values in "Wilderness Reaffirmed" as one of two leading proponents of a philosophy of wilderness. In "Introduction" to Rothenberg, ed., *Wild Ideas* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1995), pages xii-xxvii, citations on pp. xv-xvii.

R. Edward Grumbine (Sierra Institute, University of California Extension, Santa Cruz) critiques the debate between Rolston and Callicott, in Rolston's "Wilderness Reaffirmed" epitomizing the two main positions regarding nature and culture. In "Wise and Sustainable Uses: Revisioning Wilderness," pages 3-25 in David Rothenberg, ed., *Wild Ideas* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1995), citations on pp. 9-13, p. 18, p. 21.

Andrew Dobson (Politics, University of Keele, U.K.) cites "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World," (Borman and Kellert), applying Rolston's discussion of a "telos" in a genetic set to the question of genetic engineering. In "Biocentrism and Genetic Engineering," *Environmental Values* 4(1995):227-239, citations on p. 232, p. 233, p. 234, p. 239.

Stephen R. Kellert (Environmental Sciences & Forestry, Yale University) cites "Respect for Life: Can Zen Buddhism Help in Forming an Environmental Ethic?" pages 103-121 in "Concepts of Nature East and West" in Michael E. Soulé and Gary Lease, eds., *Reinventing Nature: Responses to Postmodern Deconstructionism* (Washington, DC: Island Press, 1995), citation on p. 104, p. 120.

George Sessions (Philosophy, Sierra College, California) cites "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone," "Values in Nature," Values Gone Wild, and "Valuing Wildlands," in "Ecocentrism, Wilderness, and Global Ecosystem Protection," and "In Defense of Ecosystems." "Holmes Rolston has written a number of insightful papers ..." Pages 90-130, and notes, 317-326 in Max Oelschlaeger, ed., *The Wilderness Condition: Essays on Environment and Civilization* (San Francisco: Sierra Club Books, 1992), citation on p. 93, p. 99, p. 118, p. 318, p. 320, p. 325.

W. Sibley Towner (Union Theological Seminary in Virginia) cites "Does Nature Need to Be Redeemed?" (*Zygon and Horizons in Biblical Theology*). In "The Future of Nature," *Interpretation: Journal of Bible and Theology* 50(1996):27-35, citation on p. 28, p. 35.

James D. Proctor (Geography and Environmental Studies, University of California, Santa Barbara) cites "A Forest Ethic and Multivalue Forest Management" as an example of environmental ethics applied to forestry. In "Whose Nature? The Contested Moral Terrain of Ancient Forests," pages 269-297, and notes 520-527, in William Cronon, ed., *Uncommon Ground: Reinventing Nature* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1995), citations on p. 274, p. 281, p. 521, p. 524.

Arran E. Gare (Philosophy, Swinburne University, Australia) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" In *Postmodernism and the Environmental Crisis* (London: Routledge, 1995), p. 90, p. 178.

Robert Booth Fowler (Political Science, University of Wisconsin-Madison) cites Rolston's work in environmental ethics. In *The Greening of Protestant Thought* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1995), p. 66.

Peter W. Bakken, Joan Gibb Engel, and J. Ronald Engel cite "Does Nature Need to be Redeemed?" "Skillfully crossing the language barriers of separate disciplines, philosopher Rolston maintains that the worldviews of biologist and theologian on the necessity of nature's redemption are not as far apart as they initially seem." In Peter W. Bakken, Joan Gibb Engel, and J. Ronald Engel, *Ecology, Justice, and Christian Faith: A Guide to the Literature* (Westport CT: Greenwood Press, 1995), p. 83.

Peter W. Bakken, Joan Gibb Engel, and J. Ronald Engel cite "Environmental Ethics: Some Challenges for Christians." In Peter W. Bakken, Joan Gibb Engel, and J. Ronald Engel, *Ecology, Justice, and Christian Faith: A Guide to the Literature* (Westport CT: Greenwood Press, 1995), p. 104.

Peter W. Bakken, Joan Gibb Engel, and J. Ronald Engel cite "Wildlife and Wildlands: A Christian Perspective." In Peter W. Bakken, Joan Gibb Engel, and J. Ronald Engel, *Ecology, Justice, and Christian Faith: A Guide to the Literature* (Westport CT: Greenwood Press, 1995), p. 172.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Wales, Cardiff) cites "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value" for its account of systemic value. In *Value, Obligation, and Meta-Ethics* (Amsterdam/Atlanta, GA: Editions Rodopi B. V., 1995), p. 26, p. 31, p. 258, p. 259.

Mohammed H. I. Dore (Economics, Brock University, Ontario) cites "A Forest Ethic and Multivalued Forest Management" for its criticism of willingness-to-pay valuations of forests. He also cites "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value" for its analysis of the philosophical limitations for environmental ethics of the economic concept of value. In "The Problem of Valuation in Neoclassical Economics," *Environmental Ethics* 18(1996):65-70, citations on p. 69.

Yu Mouchang (Philosophy, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Beijing) cites "On Behalf of Bioexuberance," "Respect for Life: Can Zen Buddhism Help?," "Disvalues in Nature," and "Human Values and Natural Systems" Pages 249-258 in "Major Issues in Modern Western Ecological Research" (in Chinese) in Ch'iu Jen-tzung, ed., *Kuo wai tzy jan k'o hsüeh che hsüeh wen t'i (Philosophical Problems in Foreign Natural Science)*. Chung-kuo she hui k'o hsüeh, 1994 (Beijing: Chinese Social Science Press, 1994. ISBN 7-5004-1514-1), citations on p. 250, p. 252, p. 253, p. 254.

Ye Ping (Philosophy, Northeast Forestry University, Harbin China) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" and "Rights and Responsibilities on the Home Planet" in *Sheng t'ai lun li hsüeh (Ecological Ethics)*. Chinese Forestry Young Scientist's Works Series (Tung-pei lin yeh ta hsüeh ch'u pan she, 1994. ISBN 7-81008-487-9), citations on p. 139, p. 156.

Yu Mouchang (Philosophy, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Beijing) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" (p. 6), "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" (p. 206), "A Forest Ethic and Multivalued Forest Management" (p. 206), "Science-Based versus Traditional Ethics," "In Defense of Bioexuberance" (p. 79), and "Respect for Life: Can Zen Buddhism Help?" (p. 98). In *Ch'eng fa chung ti hsing wu tsou haiang sheng t'ai lun li hsüeh (Awakening to Retribution: Towards Environmental Ethics)*. Kuang-tung chiao yü ch'u pan she, 1995 (Kuang-cho [Kwangtung], China: Kuang-cho [Kwangtung] Educational Publisher, 1995. ISBN 7-5406-2872-3).

Lloyd C. Irland (Forestry, Irland Group, Winthrop, Maine) cites "A Forest Ethic and Multivalued Forest Management" in a select bibliography on environmental ethics. In *Ethics in Forestry* (Portland, OR: Timber Press, 1994), p. 249.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Wales, Cardiff) cites "Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," in "Ethics and the Environment: A Global Perspective," pages 331-342 in Brenda Almond, ed., *Introducing Applied Ethics* (Oxford, UK: Blackwell, 1995), citations on p. 337, p. 341.

Avner de-Shalit (Political Science, Hebrew University, Jerusalem) cites "The Nature of Value and the Value of Nature" and "Respect for Life: Can Zen Buddhism Help in Forming an Environmental Ethic?" In "Ruralism or Environmentalism," in *Environmental Values* 5(1996): 47-58, citation on p. 49, p. 50, p. 51, p. 57.

George Sessions (Philosophy, Sierra College) cites "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone," "Values in Nature," "Values Gone Wild," "Valuing Wildlands," and "In Defense of Ecosystems." "Holmes Rolston has written a number of insightful papers which sort out the various kinds of arguments for, and values in, wilderness and wild species." In "Ecocentrism, Wilderness, and Global Protection," pages 90-130, 317-326 in Max Oelschlaeger, ed., *The Wilderness Condition: Essays on Environment and Civilization* (San Francisco: Sierra Club Books, 1992), citation on p. 92, p. 99, p. 118, p. 318, p. 320, p. 324.

David Johns (Executive Director, The Wildlands Project) cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed." In "Wilderness and Human Habitation," pages 149-160 in David Clarke Burks, ed., *Place of the Wild* (Washington, DC: Island Press, 1994), citation on p. 160.

Peter Sandøe (Philosophy, University of Copenhagen), Roger Crisp (Philosophy, St. Anne's College, Oxford University), and Nils Holtug (Philosophy, University of Copenhagen) cite "The Value of Species" (reprinted version of "Duties to Endangered Species" in Tom Regan and Peter Singer, eds., *Animal Rights and Human Obligations*, Prentice-Hall, 1989) for its argument for a species-integrity based ethic. In "Animal Ethics," Copenhagen, Denmark: University of Copenhagen, Department of Education, Philosophy, and Rhetorics, 1996. Also in Mike Appleby and Barry Hughes, eds., *Animal Welfare*. Wallingford: C.A.B. International.

Donald Lindburg (Center for Reproduction of Endangered Species, Zoological Society of San Diego) and Linda Lindburg (editor, *Zoo Biology*) cite "Biology without Conservation: An Environmental Misfit and a Contradiction in Terms," in "To Cull or not to Cull," pages 195-208 in Bryan G. Norton, Michael Hutchins, Elizabeth F. Stevens, and Terry L. Maple, eds., *Ethics on the Ark: Zoos, Animal Welfare, and Wildlife Conservation* (Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995), citation on p. 206, p. 208.

Osmo Kontturi (Docent, University of Joensuu, Finland, and Finnish Association for Landscape Ecology) quotes "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" in "Ympäristön Tutkimus- Ja Suunnittele-ongelmien Sekä Ympäristöpolitiikan Ja -Filosofian Suhteista (Environmental Research and Planning in Relation to Environmental Politics and Philosophy" in *Ale Fennica: Journal of the Finnish Association for Landscape Ecology* vol. 7-8 (1992-1993):4-19, citation on p. 17, p. 18.

Tony Lynch (Philosophy and Politics, University of New England, Armidale, Australia) cites "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value" for its discussion of value realism. In "Deep Ecology as an Aesthetic Movement," *Environmental Values* 5(1996):147-160, citation on p. 154, p. 160.

Kristin Shrader-Frechette (Philosophy, University of South Florida) cites "Duties to Ecosystems" in "Individualism, Holism, and Environmental Ethics," *Ethics and the Environment* 1(1996):55-69, citation on p. 63, p. 68.

Dieter Hessel (Institute for Theological Inquiry, Princeton Theological Seminary) cites "Lake Solitude: The Individual in Wildness" for its discussion of the ecological dimensions of individuality. In "Spirited Earth Ethics: Cosmological and Covenantal Roots," *Church and Society* July/August 1996, pages 16-36, citation on p. 31, p. 36.

Andrew Brennan (University of Western Australia) cites "Valuing Wildlands" as a "well-informed criticism" of cost-benefit accounting of wildland values. In "Incontinence, Self-Deception, Shallow Analysis, Myth-making, and Economic Rationality," in J. Baird Callicott and Fernando J. R. da Rocha, eds., *Earth Summit Ethics: Toward a Reconstructive Postmodern Philosophy of Environmental Education* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1996), pages 93-114, citation on p. 113.

Kristin Shrader-Frechette (Philosophy, University of South Florida) cites "Duties to Ecosystems," and "Is There an Ecological Ethic in "Hard Ecology, Soft Ecology, and Ecosystem Integrity." Pages 125-145 in Laura Westra and John Lemons, eds., *Perspectives on Ecological Integrity* (Dordrecht/Boston: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1996), citations on p. 129, p. 143.

Reed F. Noss (The Wildlands Project and editor, *Conservation Biology*) cites Rolston's analysis of the difficulties of making operational the term "integrity" as applied to ecosystems, from the Forward, to Laura Westra, *An Environmental Proposal for Ethics: The Principle of Integrity*. In "Ecological Integrity and Sustainability: Buzzwords in Conflict?" Pages 60-76 in Laura Westra and John Lemons, eds., *Perspectives on Ecological Integrity*

(Dordrecht/Boston: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1996), citation on p. 64, p. 75.

John Lemons (Biology, University of New England, Biddeford, ME) cites "Valuing Wildlands" and "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed." In "Ecological Integrity and National Parks." Pages 177-201 in Laura Westra and John Lemons, eds., *Perspectives on Ecological Integrity* (Dordrecht/Boston: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1996), citation on p. 182, p. 183, p. 201.

Andrew Linzey (Theology, Mansfield College, Oxford University) cites "Does Nature Need to be Redeemed?" In *Animal Theology* (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 1995), p. 195.

Eugene C. Hargrove (Philosophy, University of North Texas), cites Rolston as a "major figure" in the field of environmental ethics. "The field first achieved respectability in mainstream professional philosophy with the publication of Rolston's "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in 1975. In "Environmental Ethics," pages 241-244 in Robert Paehlke, ed., *Conservation and Environmentalism: An Encyclopedia* (New York: Garland Publishing Co., 1995).

Leena Vilkkä (Philosophy, University of Helsinki) cites "In Defense of Ecosystems" in "Should We Preserve Intrinsic Values in Wilderness?" Pages 160-175 in Anna-Liisa Sippola, Pirjo Alaraudanjoki, Bruce Forbes and Ville Hallikainen, eds., *Northern Wilderness Areas: Ecology, Sustainability, Values* (Rovaniemi, Finland: University of Lapland, Arctic Centre, 1995). Citation on p. 170.

Robert Elliot (Philosophy, Sunshine Coast University College, Maroochydore, Qld, Australia) cites "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value" for its concept of intrinsic value in nature. In "Facts About Natural Values," *Environmental Values* 5(1996):221-234, citation on p. 221, p. 222, p. 224, p. 233, p. 234.

Daniel Schwartz (Rabbi, Temple Shalom, Chevy Chase, Maryland and Associate Director, National Religious Partnership for the Environment) cites Rolston's arguments for saving endangered species in "A Rabbi's Reply: In God's Green Earth We Trust" (replying to Daniel Gelernter, "In Rat's We Trust: Making a Moral Case against the Tryanny of Environmentalism). In *The Washington Post*, December 1, 1996, C2.

Eric Katz (Philosophy, New Jersey Institute of Technology) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?", "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?", "Is There an Ecological Ethic?", "Values Gone Wild," and "Valuing Wildlands," in a select bibliography. In *Nature as Subject* (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 1997), p. 244.

Michael Lockwood (Johnstone Center of Parks, Recreation, and Heritage, Charles Sturt University, Albury, N.S.W., Australia) cites "Values Gone Wild," "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" and "Disvalues in Nature," for the arguments for values in nature. In "End Value, Evaluation, and Natural Systems," *Environmental Ethics* 18(1996):265-278, citations on p. 265, p. 271, p. 275.

Kristin Shrader-Frechette (Philosophy, University of South Florida) cites "Duties to Ecosystems." In "Individualism, Holism, and Environmental Ethics," *Ethics and the Environment* 1(1996):55-69, citation on p. 63, p. 68.

Michael Cavanaugh (Baton Rouge, Louisiana) cites "Rights and Responsibilities on the Home Planet." *Biotheology* (Lanham, Md: University Press of America, 1996), citation on p. 233, p. 246.

Paul Schollmeier (Philosophy, University of Nevada, Las Vegas) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" "Values Gone Wild," "Nature and Human Emotions," and "The Pasqueflower," and "Duties to Ecosystems," in "Why We Love the Land," *Ethics and the Environment* 2(1997):53-65, citations passim.

Heiki Reila (Theology, University of Tartu, Estonia) cites "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" (from Bormann and Kellert), "Creation: God and Endangered Species," "Review of *Gaia and God: An Ecofeminist Theology of Earth Healing*" (Reuther), "Environmental Ethics in the Undergraduate Curriculum," and "The Bible and Ecology." In *Teoloogiline keskkonnaeetika ja inimkeskne traditsioon. Mõnede uudsete keskkonnaeetika lähete võrdlev analüüs (Environmental Ethics and the Tradition of Anthropocentrism. A Comparative Analysis of Some New Approaches in Contemporary Theological Ethics Confronting Environmental Problems)* (in Estonian) (University of Tartu, Estonia, Master's Thesis, 1996), citations on pp. 5, 7-11, 12, 17, 26, 87, 118, 119.

Paul Schullery (Park Historian, Yellowstone National Park) cites "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone" for its analysis of the values present in pristine wilderness versus those in restored nature. In *Searching for Yellowstone: Ecology and Wonder in the Last Wilderness* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1997), pages 245-246, p. 315.

Kate Soper (Philosophy, University of North London) cites "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value," in *What Is Nature?* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1995), citation on p. 216, p. 245.

Paul M. Wood (Forestry, University of British Columbia) cites "Values Gone Wild" and "Valuing Wildlands," in "Biodiversity as the Source of Biological Resources: A New Look at Biodiversity Values," *Environmental Values* 6(1997):251-268, citations on p. 264, p. 268.

Emyr Vaughan Thomas (Directorate of Policy and Science, Countryside Council for Wales, Ffordd Penrhos, Bangor, Wales) features Rolston's value theory, citing "Duties to Endangered Species" and Value in Nature and the Nature of Value." In "Rolston, Naturogenic Value and Genuine Biocentrism," *Environmental Values* 6(1997):355-360, citations passim.

Catherine Larrère (Philosophy, Université Michel de Montaigne, Bordeaux III, France) cites Rolston's concept of value in ecosystems, in a section "Le <holisme faible> de Rolston," noting especially "Duties to Ecosystems" and "Disvalues in Nature." In *Les philosophies de l'environnement* (Paris, Presses universitaires de France, 1997), pp. 72-77, other citations p. 17, p. 25, p. 26, p. 30, p. 32, p. 56, p. 61, p. 71, p. 73, p. 97, p. 101. In a section on wilderness, she cites Rolston's "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," pp. 89-91, also Rolston on nature and culture, pp. 97-101. She also cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as launching, with Richard Routley's "Is There a Need for a New, an Environmental Ethic?" the discipline of environmental philosophy (p. 18).

Catherine Larrère (Philosophy, Université Michel de Montaigne, Bordeaux III, France) and Raphaël Larrère (Agronomy, Director of Research, Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique (INRA), France) cite Rolston's "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" for its concept of wilderness and intrinsic value in wilderness. In *Du bon usage de la nature. Pour une philosophie de l'environnement (On the Good Use of Nature: Toward a Philosophy of the Environment)* (Paris: Aubier, 1997), citations on pp. 185-186, pp. 334-335.

Jack Weir (Philosophy, Morehead State University, Morehead, KY) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "An Argument for the Constitutive Goodness of the Natural Environment," *Southwest Philosophy Review* 10(1994):165-175, citations on pp. 170-183

passim.

Mariachiara Tallacchini (Dipartimento di Teoria e Storia del Diritto, Università degli Studi di Firenze--Department of Philosophy of Law, University of Florence) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and related articles. In *Diritto per la natura: Ecologia e filosofia del diritto (Law for Nature: Ecology and Philosophy of Law)* (Torino: Giappichelli, 1996), citations on p. 58, p. 106, pp. 115-122, pp. 134-135, p. 139, p. 151, p. 156, p. 157, p. 158.

Richard G. Botzler and Susan J. Armstrong (Wildlife Biology, Philosophy, Humboldt State University) say that Rolston is "a major creative force in the development of environmental ethics," reprinting "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World," as illustrating his impact. Pages 71-86 in Botzler and Armstrong, eds., *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence*, 2nd ed. (Boston: McGraw Hill, 1998), citation on p. 71.

Paul Veatch Moriarty (Philosophy, Longwood College, Virginia) and Mark Woods (Philosophy, University of San Diego) critique Rolston's position on hunting, which links human hunting with natural predation, arguing that hunting is not natural but cultural; Rolston assumes hunting was a primeval human activity, but the need to hunt is socially indoctrinated. In "Hunting does not Equal Predation," *Environmental Ethics* 19 (1997):391-404, citations passim. They cite Rolston, *Environmental Ethics*, "Treating Animals Naturally," "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone," and "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed."

Surjeet Kaur Chahal (Philosophy, University of Pune, India) cites "Values in Nature," "Is There an Ecological Ethic?," "Valuing Wildlands," "Duties to Ecosystems," and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" In *Environment and the Moral Life: Towards a New Paradigm* (New Delhi: Ashish Publishing House, 1994), citations on p. 86, p. 87, p. 96, p. 130.

Rick O'Neil (Philosophy, Transylvania University, Lexington, KY) cites "Duties to Endangered Species" for its claims about objective, intrinsic value at the species level. In "Intrinsic Value, Moral Standing, and Species," *Environmental Ethics* 19(1997):45-52, citation on p. 49.

Bill Shaw (Department of Management Science and Information Systems, University of Texas, Austin) cites "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility," for its discussion of whether conservation can be based on virtue in humans or requires objective values in nature. In "A Virtue Ethics Approach to Aldo Leopold's Land Ethic," *Environmental Ethics* 19(1997):53-76, citation on pp. 63-64.

Dale Jamieson (Philosophy, Carleton College) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "The Wilderness Idea Affirmed." In "Animal Liberation Is an Environmental Ethic," *Environmental Values* 7(1998):41-57, citations on p. 45, p. 54, p. 55.

Peter H. Kahn, Jr. (Department of Education of Human Development, Colby College, Waterville, Maine) cites "Values in Nature" and "Biophilia, Selfish Genes, Shared Values" in an assessment of the evidence for the biophilia hypothesis of Edward O. Wilson and Stephen R. Kellert. In "Developmental Psychology and the Biophilia Hypothesis: Children's Affiliation with Nature," *Developmental Review* 17(1997):1-61, citations on p. 17, p. 42, p. 59.

Cheryl Foster (Philosophy, University of Rhode Island) cites "Does Aesthetic Experience of Landscapes Need To Be Science Based?" for Rolston's claims about the deepening of aesthetic experience with scientific knowledge of evolutionary history. In "The Narrative and the Ambient in Environmental Aesthetics," *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 56(1998):127-137, citations on p. 129, p. 135, p. 136, p. 137.

Emily Brady (Philosophy, Furness College, Lancaster University, UK) cites "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Landscapes Need To be Science-Based?" In "Imagination and the Aesthetic Appreciation of Nature," *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 56(1998):139-147.

Thomas Sieger Derr (Religious Studies, Smith College) cites "Environmental Ethics: Some Challenges to Christians." Pages 17-103 in Thomas Sieger Derr, James A. Nash, and Richard John Neuhaus, *Environmental Ethics and Christian Humanism* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1996), citation on pp. 25-25, p. 28, p. 148.

Raymond E. Grizzle (Environmental Studies, Taylor University, Upland, N.Y.) and Christopher B. Barrett (Economics, Utah State University) cite "Does Nature Need To Be Redeemed?" "Very few environmentalists, Christian or otherwise, have satisfactorily confronted the 'bad' or harsh side of nature. ... Important exceptions to this conclusion include Moltmann (1986), Nash (1991), and Rolston (1994)." In "The One Body of Christian Environmentalism," *Zygon: Journal of Religion and Science* 33(1998):233-253, citations on p. 240, p. 250, p. 253, p. 245, p. 253.

Jorge Issa (Philosophy, Universidad Autonoma Metropolitana-Izapa, Mexico City) cites "Challenges in Environmental Ethics" (from Michael Zimmerman et al, *Environmental Philosophy: From Animal Rights to Radical Ecology*) for its account of human responsibilities toward ecosystems. He also cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" In "Hacia una ética para el ecosistema, (Toward Ecosystem Ethics)." Pages 289-294 in Teresa Kwiatkowska and Jorge Issa, eds, *Los caminos de la ética ambiental (The Ways of Environmental Ethics)* (C.P. 06470, Mexico, D.F.: Plaza y Valdés Editores, 1998), citation on p. 290.

Pamela Smith (Theology, Saints Cyril and Methodius Seminary, Orchard Lake, Michigan) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as launching the field of environmental ethics in 1975. In *What Are They Saying About Environmental Ethics?* (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1997), citation on p. 4.

Viriato Soromenho-Marques (Philosophy and Law, University of Lisbon, Portugal) cites "Rights and Responsibilities on the Home Planet." In *O Futuro Frágil: Os desafios da crise global do ambiente (The Fragile Future: The Challenges of the Global Environmental Crisis)* (Mira-Sintra, Lisbon, Portugal: Publicações Europa-América, Lda, 1998), citation on p. 134, p. 140, p. 222.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of North Texas) and Michael P. Nelson (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cite Rolston's "Wilderness Reaffirmed" as one of the seminal papers launching the contemporary debate on philosophical understandings of wilderness preservation. In "Introduction," pages 1-20, in J. Baird Callicott and Michael P. Nelson, eds., *The Great New Wilderness Debate* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1998), citations on p. 9, p. 19.

Michael P. Nelson (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites "Valuing Wildlands," "Values in Nature," and "Values Gone Wild" for their arguments about preserving wilderness. In "An Amalgamation of Wilderness Preservation Arguments," pages 154-198 in J. Baird Callicott and Michael P. Nelson, eds., *The Great New Wilderness Debate* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1998), citations on p. 155, p. 156, p. 161, p. 170, p. 184, p. 193, p. 197, p. 198.

Eugene Hargrove (Philosophy, University of North Texas) cites "Valuing Wildlands" for its criticism of the contingent valuation of nature by resource economist. In "Taking

Environmental Ethics Seriously: The Challenge Before Us," pages 16-30 in Dorinda G. Dallmeyer and Albert F. Ike, eds., *Environmental Ethics and the Global Marketplace* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1998), citations on p. 17, p. 20, p. 30.

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, College of Charleston, SC) cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" for Rolston's discussion of whether humanly modified, improved nature remains genuinely natural. In "Enhancing Natural Value?" in *Human Ecology Review* 3 (no. 1, Autumn):8-11, citation on p. 9.

Robert Elliot (Philosophy, Sunshine Coast University College, Queensland, Australia) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?", "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?", "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value," and "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Landscapes Need to be Science-Based?" In *Faking Nature: The Ethics of Environmental Restoration* (London: Routledge, 1997). Citations on p. 3, p. 7, p. 13, pp. 16-17, p. 24, p. 27, p. 55, p. 61, p. 96, p. 128.

Christopher J. Preston (Philosophy, University of Oregon, University of Montana) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?", "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?", and "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" Rolston's account of objective intrinsic value in nature, "perhaps the most well known," remains the best available, despite the criticisms of Bryan Norton and J. Baird Callicott. In "Epistemology and Intrinsic Values: Norton and Callicott's Critiques of Rolston," *Environmental Ethics* 20(1998):409-429, citations passim.

Joan S. Elbers (Environmental history, Montgomery College, Maryland) cites "Biology without Conservation: An Environmental Misfit and a Contradiction in Terms," "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?", "Values Gone Wild," and "Valuing Wildlands." She says of "Values Gone Wild": "As a philosophical work that is yet rich in natural imagery and personal feeling, Rolston's essay makes a special contribution to environmental ethics." Of "Valuing Wildlands": "A telling argument against the use of cost-benefit analysis in making public land use decisions about wild nature." "An excellent place to begin an overview of wilderness philosophy." In *Changing Wilderness Values 1930-1990* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1991), citations on p. 41, p. 71, p. 80.

Lori Gruen (Philosophy, Lafayette College, Easton, PA) cites Rolston's account of "non-instrumental, non-anthropogenic" value in nature. In "Revaluing Nature," in Karen J. Warren, ed., *Ecofeminism: Women, Culture, Nature* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1997), pages 356-374, citation on p. 357.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Wales, Cardiff) critiques "Feeding People versus Saving Nature," in "Saving Nature, Feeding People, and Ethics," *Environmental Values* 7(1998):291-304. Sustainable development can be combined with environmental conservation, and there seldom need to make tradeoffs between the two, contrary to Rolston's claim that we must sometimes choose one or the other, and sometimes ought to conserve nature rather than to develop nature for human benefit. Citations passim. Also published in German as: "Natur Erhalten oder Menschen Ernähren?" ("Saving Nature or Feeding People?"), *Conceptus* 29:27-45.

Andrew Brennan (Philosophy, University of Western Australia) critiques "Feeding People versus Saving Nature," in "Poverty, Puritanism and Environmental Conflict," *Environmental Values* 7(1998):305-331. Rolston fails adequately to recognize the causes of poverty in Western corporate exploitation of developing nations, and our Western responsibility for the plight of developing nations; if we assumed responsibility for their hunger, there would be no conflict between feeding people and saving nature. Rolston is "an elitist and Puritan" environmentalist. Citations passim.

Ben A. Minteer (School of Natural Resources, University of Vermont), critiques Rolston's work in "No Experience Necessary? Foundationalism and the Retreat from Culture in Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Values* 7(1998):333-348. Rolston is a "foundationalist" and "retreats" from culture in his environmental ethics. One needs to put culture "up front" in environmental ethics "by taking a more contextual, social, and pragmatic approach," which will lead to a "democratically authentic environmental ethics." Citations passim.

Alan Carter (Philosophy, University of Glasgow, UK) "Saving nature and feeding people," *Environmental Ethics* 26, 4 (2004): 339–60. Holmes Rolston, III has argued that there are times when we should save nature rather than feed people. In arguing thus, Rolston appears tacitly to share a number of assumptions with Garrett Hardin regarding the causes of human overpopulation. Those assumptions are most likely erroneous. Rather than our facing the choice between saving nature or feeding people, we will not save nature unless we feed people. Reprinted in Robin Attfield (ed.), *The Ethics of the Environment* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008), pp. 543–64.

"Saving nature, feeding people, and the foundations of ethics," *Environmental Values* 7, no. 3 (August 1998): 349-357. <http://dx.doi.org/10.3197/096327198129341627>
<http://hdl.handle.net/10217/37701> Rolston replies to Robin Attfield's and Andrew Brennan's criticisms of his claims that sometimes one ought to conserve nature preferentially to caring for the poor. Tiger conservation in Royal Chitwan National Park, Nepal, does and ought to give tiger conservation priority over some of the desires for development of locally impoverished peoples. Ben Minteer argues that nature conservation ought to be "culturally-occupied"; Rolston argues for respect for intrinsic value in nature.

Clare Palmer (Philosophy, University of Stirling, UK) cites Rolston's "Feeding People versus Saving Nature." In Review, Roger S. Gottlieb, ed., *The Ecological Community: Environmental Challenges for Philosophy, Politics and Morality* (London: Routledge, 1997). "Rolston argues that there are circumstances where one 'ought not always to feed people first, but rather one ought sometimes to save nature.' That such a conclusion (and the arguments which lead to this conclusion) should be espoused by one so eminent in the field of environmental ethics may well cause some anxiety--and a flutter of refutation--from others in the environmental ethics community." In *Environmental Values* 7(1998):479-480.

Tal Scriven (Philosophy, California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo) cites "Values in Nature." "In *Wrongness, Wisdom, and Wilderness* (Albany: State University of New York, 1997), citations on p. 147, p. 184, p. 185, p. 204.

Stan Godlovitch (Philosophy, Lincoln University, Canterbury, New Zealand) cites "Values Gone Wild" for its account of objective value in nature. In "Valuing Nature and the Autonomy of Natural Aesthetics," *British Journal of Aesthetics* 38(1998):180-197, citation on p. 191.

Ronnie Z. Hawkins (Philosophy, University of Central Florida, Orlando) cites "Duties to Endangered Species" for its "most extensive" analysis of duties to species lines, about which Rolston has written "eloquently." In "Intergroup Justice: Taking Responsibility for Intraspecific and Interspecific Oppressions," *Ethics and the Environment* 3(1998):1-40, citation on p. 19, p. 39.

Albert Borgmann (Philosophy, University of Montana) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?". In *Technology and the Character of Contemporary Life: A Philosophical Inquiry* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984), citations on pp. 186, p. 193, p. 284, p. 285.

Clare Palmer (Philosophy, University of Stirling, UK) cites "The Wilderness Idea

Reaffirmed" for its discussion of sustainable development and wilderness conservation. In *Environmental Ethics* (Santa-Barbara, CA: ABC-CLIO, 1997), pp. 93-94. She also cites "Property Rights and Endangered Species" (*University of Colorado Law Review*) for its discussion of the Endangered Species Act and property rights, pp. 116-117. She also cites "Science-Based versus Traditional Ethics" (Engel and Engel, *Ethics of Environment and Development*), p. 157. She also cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as "an early and important exploration of the need for, and nature of, environmental ethics," p. 162.

William B. Karesh (Department of Field Veterinary Studies, Wildlife Health Sciences, Wildlife Conservation Society, Bronx Zoo) cites "Ethical Responsibilities toward Wildlife" (*Journal of the American Veterinary Medical Association*). In "Wildlife Rehabilitation--Additional Considerations for Developing Countries," *Journal of Zoo and Wildlife Medicine* 26(no. 1, 1995):2-9, citation on p. 3.

Robert G. Wagner (Ontario Ministry of Natural Resources) cites "A Forest Ethic and Multivalue Forest Management" (*Journal of Forestry*, co-authored with James Coufal). "More clearly defining what forest managers must sustain and examining our forest land ethic, Rolston and Coufal are central to this debate." In "Toward Integrated Forest Vegetation Management," *Journal of Forestry* 92(no. 11, 1994):26-30, citation on p. 27. p. 30.

Lynn Dickerson (Department of English, University of Richmond, VA) cites Rolston and Coufal, "A Forest Ethic and Multivalue Forest Management" for its stress on recreational, aesthetic, spiritual, and intrinsic values in nature. In "Elements of 19th Century Romanticism in Contemporary Forest Management Practices," *Journal of Forestry* 93 (no. 9, September 1995):36-40, citation on p. 36, p. 40.

Robert E. Gresswell and William J. Liss (both in Department of Fisheries and Wildlife, Oregon State University, Corvallis) cite "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone" and "Values in Nature." In "Values Associated with Management of Yellowstone Cutthroat Trout in Yellowstone National Park," *Conservation Biology* 9(no. 1, February, 1995):159-165, citations on p. 160, p. 165.

Joel T. Heinen (Environmental Studies, Florida International University, Miami) cites "Life in Jeopardy on Private Property" (from Kohm, ed., *Balancing on the Brink of Extinction*) for its analysis of the problems of endangered species conservation on private lands. In "Thoughts and Theory on Incentive-Based Endangered Species Conservation in the United States," *Wildlife Society Bulletin* 23 (no. 3, 1995):338-345.

Tim W. Clark, A. Peyton Curlee, and Richard P. Reading (School of Forestry and Environmental Studies, Yale University) cite "Values in Nature" and "Valuing Wildlands," for recognition of positive qualities in carnivores, such as strength, courage, and endurance, that humans recognize, respect, and that motivate carnivore conservation. In "Crafting Effective Solutions to the Large Carnivore Conservation Problem," *Conservation Biology* 10 (no. 4, August 1996):940-948, citation on p. 945, p. 948.

Dwight Barry (School of Forestry and Environmental Studies, Yale University) and Max Oelschlaeger (Philosophy, University of North Texas) cite "Biology without Conservation: An Environmental Misfit and Contradiction in Terms" (from Western and Pearl, *Conservation for the Twenty-First Century*) for its analysis of senses of "conservation," some descriptive and some normative. In "A Science for Survival: Values and Conservation Biology," *Conservation Biology* 10(no. 3, June 1996):905-911, citation on p. 906, p. 911.

Stephen Cohen and Damian Grace (School of Philosophy and School of Social Work, University of New South Wales, Sydney) cite "Just Environmental Business." In "Engineers and Social Responsibility: An Obligation to Do Good," *IEEE (Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers) Technology and Society Magazine* 13 (no. 3, Fall 1994):12-19, citation on p. 14, p. 19.

J.-M. Hatt, R. Baumgartner, and E. Isenbügel cite "Ethical Responsibilities toward Life" (*Journal of the American Veterinary Medical Association*). In "Diagnostic und medizinische Betreuung von Greifvögeln in einer Zusammenstellung der Fälle von 1985-1994 (Diagnosis and Therapy of Raptors with a Compilation of Cases 1985-1994), *Schweizer Archiv für Tierheilkunde* 138(1996):434-440, citation on p. 435, p. 440. The authors are in the faculty of veterinary medicine, University of Zurich, Switzerland.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Wales, Cardiff) cites "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value" as developing categories that make the idea of value in nature more plausible in the light of contemporary biology than the categories used in John Laird's, *The Idea of Value*. In "John Laird and *The Idea of Value*," *Journal of Value Inquiry* 29(1995)103-114, citations on pp. 111-114.

Erazim Kohák (Philosophy, Charles University, Prague) cites "Disvalues in Nature" for its philosophical account of extinction in natural history, a "scholarly overview" of the issue. In "Varieties of Ecological Experience," *Environmental Ethics* 19(1997):153-171, citation on p. 154. Also in "Druhy Ekologické Zkusenosti (Varieties of Ecological Experience)," *Filosoficky Casopis (Prague)* 43(1995):899-919, citation on p. 900. (In Czech).

Zhi Xu (Forest Resource Policy and Economics, University of Minnesota) cites "Valuing Wildlands" for its challenge to economic value as adequately registering the values at stake in sustainability and diverse impacts of development. In "Assessing Distributional Impacts of Forest Policies and Products: An Integrated Approach," *Evaluation Review* 18(no. 3, 1994):281-311, citation on p. 285, p. 310.

Andrew A. Smith, Margaret A. Moote, and Cecil R. Schwalbe (School of Renewable Natural Resources, University of Arizona, Tucson) cite "Property Rights and Endangered Species" (*University of Colorado Law Review*) and "Life in Jeopardy on Private Property," on moral duties to endangered species. In "The Endangered Species Act at Twenty: An Analytical Survey of Federal Endangered Species Protection," *Natural Resources Journal* 33(1993):1027-1075, citation on p. 1033, p. 1061, p. 1063.

Franz M. Wuketits (Philosophy of Science, University of Vienna, University of Graz, Austria) cites "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone." "These claims of environmental ethicists require the attention of everybody, and we should be clear by now that if we continue destroying nature we'll sooner than later destroy ourselves. ... [Rolston's] recent discussion of Yellowstone National Park is quite interesting." In "Moral Systems as Evolutionary Systems: Taking Evolutionary Ethics Seriously," *Journal of Social and Evolutionary Systems* 16(1993):251-271, citations on p. 257, p. 268, p. 270.

David N. Bengston (USDA Forest Service, North Central Forest Experiment Station, St. Paul, MN) cites "Valuing Wildlands" and "A Forest Ethic and Multivalue Forest Management" for the analysis of multiple kinds of values present in forests, many of which escape economic measures. In "Changing Forest Values and Ecosystem Management," *Society and Natural Resources* 7(1994):515-533, citations on p. 521, p. 524, p. 525, p. 526, p. 529, p. 532.

Edwin P. Pister (Desert Fishes Council and California Division of Wildlife) cites "Values in Nature" and Rolston as "one of the nation's leading environmental philosophers." In "Ethics

of Native Species Restoration: The Great Lakes," *Journal of Great Lakes Research* 21, Supplement 1 (1995):10-16, citations on pp. 14-15.

John van Buren (Philosophy, Fordham University, Bronx, NY) cites "Values Deep in the Woods" for its classification of forest related values. In "Critical Environmental Hermeneutics," *Environmental Ethics* 17(1995):259-275, citation on p. 263.

James A. Serpell (Veterinary Medicine, University of Pennsylvania) cites "Ethical Responsibilities toward Wildlife (*Journal of the American Veterinary Medical Association*) for an ethic that prefers natural integrity in animals to human intervention in wild nature to prevent animal suffering. In "Animal Sense (and Non-sense)," contribution to a panel discussion "A Consideration of Policy Implications: A Panel Discussion [on Policy for Animal Welfare and Protection], *Social Research* 62(1995):801-838, citation on p. 825, p. 827.

Olav Benestad (Centre for Development and the Environment, University of Oslo, Norway) cites "Challenges in Environmental Ethics" (in Cooper and Palmer, *The Environment in Question*). "A challenge in environmental ethics is to determine the boundaries of ethical obligation. Holmes Rolston III and C. H. Hooker have made valuable contributions by providing a wider and more systematic framework for further discussions than has hitherto been available." In "Energy Needs and CO₂ Emissions: Constructing a Formula for Just Distributions," *Energy Policy* 22(no. 9 1994):725-734, citation on p. 727, p. 734.

Brent S. Steel (Political Science, Washington State University-Vancouver), Peter List (Philosophy, Oregon State University), and Bruce Schindler (Forest Resources, Oregon State University) cite "A Forest Ethic and Multivalue Forest Management (*Journal of Forestry*) for applying an ecocentric or biocentric approach to values in forest. In "Conflicting Values About Federal Forests: A Comparison of National and Oregon Publics," *Society and Natural Resources* 7(1994):137-153, citation on p. 139, p. 153.

Mariachiara Tallacchini (Dipartimento di Teoria e Storia del Dritto, Università degli Studi di Firenze--Department of Philosophy of Law, University of Florence) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?", Rolston's review of Peter Wenz, *Environmental Justice* (in *Between the Species*), and "Rights and Responsibilities on the Home Planet" (*Yale Journal of International Law*) in her introduction to: Mariachiara Tallacchini, ed. *Etiche della terra: Antologia di filosofia dell' ambiente (The Land Ethic: An Anthology of Environmental Philosophy)* (Milan: Vita e Pensiera, 1998), citations on pp. 27-29, pp. 47-50, p. 55.

Richard P. Reading (United Nations Development Program and Mongolian Ministry for Nature and Environment, Ulaan Baatar, Mongolia), Tim W. Clark (School of Forestry, Yale University), and Andrew Arnold (Department of Conservation and Natural Resources, Portland, Victoria, Australia) cite "Values in Nature," for its analysis of the full range of values in nature. In "Attitudes toward the Endangered Eastern Barred Bandicoot" (Australia), *Anthrozoös* 7 (no. 4, 1994):255-269, citation on p. 267, p. 269.

Louis P. Pojman (Philosophy, United States Military Academy, West Point) summarizes Rolston's theory of intrinsic value in nature, citing, among other sources, "Values at Stake: Does Anything Matter?" in L. Pojman, ed., *Environmental Ethics* (Belmont, CA: Wadsworth, 1998). In a section "The Environmental Philosophy of Holmes Rolston III." He also cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" In *Global Environmental Ethics* (Mountain View, CA: Mayfield Publishing Co., 2000), pp. 144-153, pp. 304-307, p. 325.

Sabine U. O'Hara (Economics, Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute, Troy, NY) cites "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World," on the troubling consequences of the loss of biodiversity. In "Sustainability: Social and Ecological

Dimensions," *Review of Social Economy* 53(no. 4, 1995):529-551), citation on p. 544, p. 551.

Katharine K. Baker (Law, Chicago-Kent College of Law) cites "Valuing Wildlands," "Is There an Ecological Ethic?", and "Values in Nature," for the analysis of intrinsic value in nature. In "Consorting with Forests: Rethinking Our Relationship to Natural Resources and How We Should Value Their Loss," *Ecology Law Quarterly* (Berkeley: School of Law of the University of California) 22 (no. 4, 1995):677-728, citations on p. 685, p. 695, p. 696.

Beverly L. Driver (USDA Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Range and Experiment Station, Fort Collins, CO) cites "Valuing Wildlands" and "Creation and Recreation: Environmental Benefits and Human Leisure," for the account of benefits from biodiversity and of psychological benefits from natural recreation. In "Benefits-Driven Management of Natural Areas," *Natural Areas Journal* 16 (no. 2, 1996):94-99, citations on p. 95, p. 96.

Peter S. Burton (Economics, Dalhousie University, Halifax, NS) cites "Valuing Wildlands" as an example of environmentalists who doubt that monetary valuation registers all of the values carried by wilderness. In "Land Use Externalities: Mechanism Design for the Allocation of Environmental Resources," *Journal of Environmental Economics and Management* 30(1996);174-185, citation on p. 175, p. 185.

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, College of Charleston) and Bill Throop (Philosophy and Environmental Studies, Green Mountain College, Poultney, VT) cite "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone" and "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed." In "Refocusing Ecocentrism: De-emphasizing Stability and Defending Wilderness," *Environmental Ethics* 21(1999):3-21, citation on p. 4, p. 19.

Angelika Krebs (Philosophy, University of Frankfurt, Frankfurt am Main, Germany) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value." In *Ethics of Nature* (New York, Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1999), citations on p. 69, p. 99, p. 119.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Wales, Cardiff) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as one of four works (including Richard Sylvan, "Is There a Need for a New, an Environmental Ethic?", Arne Naess, "The Shallow and the Deep, Long-Range Ecology Movements," and John Passmore, *Man's Responsibility for Nature*) that "could be said to have founded environmental philosophy." In "Depth, Trusteeship, and Redistribution," pages 159-168 in Klaus Brinkmann, ed., *Ethics: The Proceedings of the Twentieth World Congress of Philosophy*, vol. 1 (Bowling Green Ohio: Philosophy Documentation Center, 1999), citations on p. 159, p. 165, p. 167.

Margery L. Oldfield (The Seatuck Foundation, Islip, NY, and University of Texas, Austin) cites "Valuing Wildlands" and "God and Endangered Species." In "Biodiversity, Values and Uses," pages 211-233 in William A. Nierenberg, ed., *Encyclopedia of Environmental Biology*, vol. 1 (New York: Academic Press, 1995), citations on p. 233.

Robert Frodeman (Philosophy, University of Chattanooga, Tennessee) and Carl Mitcham (Philosophy, Pennsylvania State University) cite "Ethics on the Home Planet." In "Geophilosophy: Philosophers and Geoscientists Thinking Together on the Future of the Earth Sciences," *GSA Today* (monthly newsletter of the Geological Society of America) 9(no. 7, July, 1999):18-19.

Paul H. Gobster (Research Scientist, USDA Forest Service North Central Research Station, Chicago) cites "Human Values and Natural Systems," "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Landscapes Need To Be Science-Based?" and "Aesthetic Experience in Forests." In "An Ecological Aesthetic for Forest Landscape Management," *Landscape Journal* 18 (no. 1,

spring 1999):54-64, citations on p. 55, p. 57, p. 58, p. 60, p. 63.

L. I. Vasilenko (Institute of Philosophy, Russian Academy of Sciences, Moscow) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" from the Russian translation in L. I. Vasilenko and V. E. Ermolaeva, eds., *Globalniye Problemy i Obshchechelovecheskiye Tsennosti (Global Problems and Human Values)* (Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1990). In "Ecological Ethics, from Naturalism to Philosophical Personalism," (in Russian) *Voprosy Filosofii*, issue 3, 1994, pages 37-42, citation on p. 38.

Don E. Marietta, Jr. (Philosophy, Florida Atlantic University), cites "Valuing Wildlands" for the analysis of market price and individual preference value with reference to wildland conservation. In "Decisions Regarding Technology: The Human Factor." Pages 57-72 in Marina Paola Banchetti-Robino, Don E. Marietta, Jr., and Lester Embree, eds., *Philosophies of the Environment and Technology*, vol. 18, 1999, of the series *Research in Philosophy and Technology* (Stamford, CT: JAI Press Inc., 1999), citation on p. 60.

Larry A. Hickman (Philosophy, Southern Illinois University, Carbondale) cites "Values Gone Wild," contesting Rolston's distinction between treating nature as "resource" and nature as "source" as being non-pragmatic. In "Green Pragmatism: Reals without Realism, Ideals without Idealism." Pages 39-56 in Marina Paola Banchetti-Robino, Don E. Marietta, Jr., and Lester Embree, eds., *Philosophies of the Environment and Technology*, vol. 18, 1999, of the series *Research in Philosophy and Technology* (Stamford, CT: JAI Press Inc., 1999), citation on pp. 51-53.

Michael Lockwood (Johnstone Centre, Charles Sturt University, Albury, NSW, Australia) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Values Gone Wild." In "Humans Valuing Nature: Synthesizing Insights from Philosophy, Psychology, and Economics," *Environmental Values* 8(1999):381-401, citations on p. 383, p. 398.

Anna Peterson (Religion, Wesleyan University, Middletown, CT) cites "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" "Rolston's point is a vital corrective to the solipsism and paralysis encouraged by hard versions of social constructionism, which too often contend that our incapacity to 'know' the nonhuman world, in any complete or final sense, absolves us of responsibility for learning about or caring for it." In "Environmental Ethics and the Social Construction of Nature," *Environmental Ethics* 21(1999):339-357, citations passim on pp. 352-355.

Mick Smith (Sociology, University of Abertay Dundee, Dundee, Scotland) cites "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" for its analysis of objective value in nature. In "To Speak of Trees: Social Constructivism, Environmental Values, and the Future of Deep Ecology," *Environmental Ethics* 21(1999):359-376, citation on p. 374.

Antony R. Berger (Earth Science, University of Victoria, Victoria, BC) cites "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?" and "Disvalues in Nature." In *Dark Nature in Classic Chinese Thought* (Victoria, BC: University of Victoria, Centre for Studies in Religion and Society, 1999), citations on p. 2, p. 3, p. 54.

Jennifer Welchman (Philosophy, University of Alberta, Canada) cites "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" for its development of a nonanthropocentric theory of value in nature. In "The Virtues of Stewardship," *Environmental Ethics* 21(1999):411-423, citation on p. 411.

Susan J. Armstrong (Philosophy, Humboldt State University, California) and Richard G. Botzler (Biology, Humboldt State University, California) cite "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Nature Need to be Science-Based?" In their introduction to a section on "Aesthetics of

Nature," in Armstrong and Botzler, eds. *Environmental Ethics: Convergence and Divergence*, 2nd. ed. (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1998), citation on p. 153.

Wayne Stewart cites "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" for its discussions of non-anthropocentric ethics and on species in ecosystem. In *Metaphysics by Default*, Chapter 18, Potential Benefits, References 7 and 13. A website book publication: <http://mbdefault.org>

Vernon Pratt, Jane Howarth, and Emily Brady (Philosophy, University of Lancaster, UK) cite "In Defense of Ecosystems," and "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Nature Need to Be Science-Based?" In *Environment and Philosophy* (London and New York: Routledge, 2000), p. 156, p. 167, p. 169, p. 170.

Theodore W. Nunez (Philosophy and Religious Studies, Villanova University) cites "Disvalues in Nature" and "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct." In *Holmes Rolston, Bernard Lonergan, and the Foundations of Environmental Ethics*, Ph.D. dissertation, 1999, Catholic University of America, Washington. This is published (in part) as: "Rolston, Lonergan, and the Intrinsic Value of Nature," *Journal of Religious Ethics* 27 (no. 1, Spring, 1999):105-128.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Wales, Cardiff) cites "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?," "Feeding People versus Saving Nature," and "Duties to Endangered Species." In *The Ethics of the Global Environment* (Edinburgh: University of Edinburgh Press, 1998), p. 17, p. 26, p. 123, p. 131, p. 134, p. 149.

Karen J. Warren (Philosophy, Macalaster College, St. Paul, MN) and Jim Cheney (University of Wisconsin-Waukesha, Waukesha, WI) cite Rolston's review of Andrew Brennan, *Thinking about Nature*. In "Ecological Feminism and Ecosystem Ecology," *Hypatia* 6(no. 1, Spring 1991):179-197, citations on p. 194, p. 197.

Alan Carter (Philosophy, Heythrop College, University of London) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" In "Humean Nature," *Environmental Values* 9(2000):3-37, citation on p. 34, p. 37.

James P. Sterba (Philosophy, University of Notre Dame) cites "Feeding People versus Saving Nature." In *Justice for Here and Now* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1999), citation on p. 199.

Mark D. Linville (Philosophy, Atlanta Christian College) cites "Beauty and the Beast: Aesthetic Appreciation of Wildlife" and "Values in Nature." In "A Little Lower than the Angels: Christian Humanism and Environmental Ethics," *Christian Scholar's Review* 28(1998):283-297, citations on p. 293, p. 296.

Kathleen Braden (Geography, Seattle Pacific University) cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed." In "On Saving the Wilderness: Why Christian Stewardship is Not Sufficient," *Christian Scholar's Review* 28(1998):254-269, citation on p. 256.

Karen J. Warren (Philosophy, Macalaster College) and Jim Cheney (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Waukesha) cite Rolston's review of Andrew Brennan, *Thinking about Nature* on the connections between environmental ethics and ecology. In "Ecological Feminism and Ecosystem Ecology," *Hypatia* 6 (no. 1, Spring, 1991):179-197, citation on pp. 196-197.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Wales, Cardiff) cites "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" for its argument that humans do have and require objective knowledge of nature, a requirement for an environmental ethic. In *The Ethics of the Global*

Environment (Edinburgh: University of Edinburgh Press, 1999), citation on p. 17, p. 26.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Wales, Cardiff) cites "Feeding People versus Saving Nature" for its argument that rapid population growth is incompatible with environmental integrity in much of the Third World. In *The Ethics of the Global Environment* (Edinburgh: University of Edinburgh Press, 1999), citation on p. 123, p. 131.

Peter C. List (Philosophy, Oregon State University, Corvallis) says of "Values Deep in the Woods:" "This broader conception of values is present in the writings of one of our foremost figures in environmental ethics, Holmes Rolston III. Rolston is a distinguished professor of philosophy at Colorado State University and author of numerous influential essays on environmental philosophy, including an original and groundbreaking book in the field, *Environmental Ethics*. ... He applies his formal analysis of the types of value carried by nature to forests specifically." Continuing, List says of "Aesthetic Experience in Forests": "Rolston characterizes human aesthetic experience in forests as requiring an active engagement that is different than in the case of experiencing human art objects. ... This broader and also deeper approach to forest values and forest valuing reflects the manifold value categories that the American public holds with regard to forests." In *Environmental Ethics and Forestry: A Reader* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2000), citation on p. 74.

Wim Zweers (Philosophy, University of Amsterdam) cites "Values in Nature," also "Lake Solitude: The Individual in Wildness." In *Participating with Nature: Outline for an Ecologization of our World View* (Utrecht, Netherlands: International Books, 2000), citations on pp. 93, 95-96, p. 294. p. 379. Earlier in Dutch (Utrecht: Uitgeverij Van van Arkel, 1995).

Todd Hartman (staff writer, *Denver Rocky Mountain News*) cites "Fishes in the Desert" on valuing the unique qualities of desert fish. In "Fish Story" (Endangered Fishes in the U.S. West), *Denver Rocky Mountain News*, Section T, pp. 1x-12x, December 3, 2000, citation on p. 7x.

Peter S. Wenz (Philosophy, University of Illinois, Springfield) cites "Feeding People versus Saving Nature" for its discussion of value judgments in conflicts between poverty and biological conservation. In *Environmental Ethics Today* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2001), citations on pp. 160-164, p. 311. Similarly in "Environmental Synergism," *Environmental Ethics* 24(2002):389-408, citation on p. 405.

Alan Holland (Philosophy, University of Lancaster, Lancaster, UK) cites "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?," "Duties to Ecosystems," and "Saving Nature, Feeding People, and the Foundations of Ethics." In "Ecological Integrity and the Darwinian Paradigm," pages 45-59 in David Pimentel, Laura Westra, and Reed F. Noss, eds., *Ecological Integrity: Integrating Environment, Conservation, and Health* (Washington, DC: Island Press, 2000), citations on p. 47, p. 56, p. 59.

Theodore Nunez (Center for Ethics, Villanova University) cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" and "Nature and Culture in Environmental Ethics." In "Can a Christian Environmental Ethic Go Wild? Evaluating Ecotheological Responses to the Wilderness Debate," pages 329-348 in John Kelsey and Sumner B. Twiss, eds., *The Annual of the Society of Christian Ethics* (Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 2000), citations on p. 332, p. 338, p. 343, p. 346, p. 347.

Mark Wynn (Philosophy of Religion, Australian Catholic University), cites "Disvalues in Nature" and "Does Nature Need to be Redeemed?" for their arguments about value and disvalues in nature and the compatibility of this with natural theology. In *God and Goodness: A Natural Theological Perspective* (London: Routledge, 1999), citations on pp.

107-109, pp. 210-211. passim.

Charles C. Taliaferro (St. Olaf College, St. Paul, MN) cites Rolston on values in nature and the compatibility of this with arguments for belief in God. In Review of Mark Wynn, *God and Goodness*, in *Faith and Philosophy* 18(no. 1, 2001):137-139, citation on p. 137.

Taylor V. Stein (School of Forest Resources and Conservation, University of Florida), Dorothy H. Anderson (Department of Forest Resources), and Tim Kelly (Office of Planning, Minnesota Department of Natural Resources, St. Paul) cite "Valuing Wildlands" and "Creation and Recreation: Environmental Benefits and Human Leisure" for Rolston's analysis of the broad spectrum of values in nature. In "Using Stakeholders' Values to Apply Ecosystem Management in an Upper Midwest Landscape," *Environmental Management* 24 (no.3, 1999):399-413.

Dan E. Huff (U.S. National Park Service, Intermountain Region, Denver) and John D. Varley (Yellowstone National Park) cite "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone." In "Natural Regulation in Yellowstone National Park's Northern Range," *Ecological Applications* 9(no. 1, 1999):17-29, citations on p. 18, p. 28.

R. Gerald Wright (Department of Fish and Wildlife Resources, University of Idaho) cites "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone." In "Wildlife Management in the National Parks: Questions in Search of Answers," *Ecological Applications* 9(no. 1, 1999):30-36, citation on p. 32, p. 35.

Robert P. McIntosh (Biology, Notre Dame University) cites "Duties to Ecosystems" for its analysis of ecosystems as communities. In "The Myth of Community as Organism," *Perspectives in Biology and Medicine* 41(no. 3, 1998):426-438, citations on pp. 431-432, p. 435, p. 438.

Eric Mount, Jr. (Religion, Center College, Danville, KY) cites "Environmental Ethics: Some Challenges for Christians." In "The Currency of Covenant," pages 295-310 in Harlan Beckley, ed., *The Annual of the Society of Christian Ethics* (Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 1996), citations on p. 308. p. 309.

Dominic Moran (Economic Planning Unit, Prime Minister's Department, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia), David Pearce, and Anouk Wendelaar (Centre for Social and Economic Research on the Global Environment, University College, London) cite "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" (from Winkler and Coombes, eds., *Applied Ethics: A Reader*). In "Investing in Biodiversity: An Economic Perspective on Global Priority Setting," *Biodiversity and Conservation* 6(1997):1219-1243, citation on p. 1237.

Michael A. Huston (Environmental Sciences Division, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, Oak Ridge, TN) cites "Creation: God and Endangered Species" for its analysis of the religious value of biodiversity. In "Hidden Treatments in Ecological Experiments: Re-evaluating the Ecosystem Function of Biodiversity," *Oecologia* 110(1997):449-460, citation on p. 449, p. 460.

Cindy Deacon Williams (aquatic ecologist, Pacific Rivers Council) cites and quotes "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility." In "Sustainable Fisheries: Economics, Ecology, and Ethics," *Fisheries* 22(no. 2, 1997):6-11, citation on p. 9, p. 11.

Brian D. Winter (National Park Service, Olympic National Park) and Robert M. Hughes (aquatic biologist, Dynamic, Corvallis, OR) cite "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility" in "Biodiversity: American Fisheries Society Position Statement," *Fisheries*

22 (no. 1, January, 1997):22-29, citation on p. 23, p. 28. Also, with revisions, in *Fisheries* 22 (no. 3, March):16-23, citation on p. 17, p. 22.

Daniel Simberloff (Biology, Florida State University, Tallahassee) and Peter Stiling (Biology, University of South Florida, Tampa) cite "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" (from Bormann and Kellert). In "Risks of Species Introduced for Biological Control," *Biological Conservation* 78(1996):185-192, citation on p. 187, p. 191. Again in "How Risky is Biological Control?" *Ecology* 77(1996):1965-1974, citation on p. 1969, pp. 1973-1974.

John Benson (Philosophy, Lancaster University, UK) has extended commentary on "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature," using it as a contrast with John Stuart Mill's "Nature," Rolston finding positive values in nature that Mill overlooks. Rolston is "a venerable American environmental philosopher" (p. 113). In *Environmental Ethics: An Introduction with Readings* (London: Routledge, 2000), discussion and citations on pp. 113-114, p. 117, pp. 237-242.

Christopher Key Chapple (Asian and Pacific Studies, Loyola Marymont University, Los Angeles) and Mary Evelyn Tucker (Religion, Bucknell University) cite "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?" In a Select Bibliography, *Hinduism and Ecology: The Intersection of Earth, Sky, and Water* (Cambridge: Center for the Study of World Religions and Harvard University Press, 2000), citation on p. 564.

Bryan G. Norton (School of Public Policy, Georgia Institute of Technology) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?", criticizing Rolston's objectivist epistemology. In "Objectivity, Intrinsicity and Sustainability: Comment on Nelson's 'Health and Disease as 'Thick' Concepts in Ecosystemic Contexts,'" *Environmental Values* 4(1995):323-332, citations on pp. 327-329.

Marcel Sarot (University of Utrecht) cites Rolston for his account of disvalue in nature. In a review of Mark Wynn, *God and Goodness: A Natural Theological Perspective* (London: Routledge, 1999), in *Religious Studies: An International Journal for the Philosophy of Religion* (Cambridge University Press) 37(2001):116-118, citation on p. 118.

Mark A. Michael (Philosophy, Austin Peay State University, Clarksville, TN) cites "Duties to Endangered Species," "Treating Animals Naturally," "Ethical Responsibilities Toward Wildlife," and "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed." In "How to Interfere With Nature," *Environmental Ethics* 23(2001):135-154, citations on p. 137, p. 145, p. 151.

Philip Cafaro (Philosophy, Colorado State University) cites "Wilderness Reaffirmed" for its accounts of wilderness and intrinsic value in nature. In "For a Grounded Conception of Wilderness and More Wilderness on the Ground," *Ethics and the Environment* 6(2001):1-17, citations on p. 7, p. 9, p. 11, p. 14, p. 15, p. 17.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Wales, Cardiff) cites and defends Rolston's accounts of intrinsic value in nature. In "Postmodernism, Value and Objectivity," *Environmental Values* 10(2001):145-162, references passim.

Simon P. James (University of Durham, Durham, UK) cites "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?" In "'Thing-Centered' Holism in Buddhism, Heidegger, and Deep Ecology," *Environmental Ethics* 22(2000):359-375, citation on p. 373.

O. Gene Myers (Committee on Human Development, University of Chicago) says of "Biophilia, Selfish Genes, Shared Values," Rolston's article in Stephen R. Kellert and Edward O. Wilson, eds., *The Biophilia Hypothesis*, that "Rolston's contribution is pivotal,

first because it clarifies the conceptual setting of biophilia's central ideas. He puts them in the context of genetic theory. ... Rolston abandons sociobiology's interpretive gestalt of 'selfishness,' choosing instead 'conservation of intrinsic value.' ... This naturalism is Rolston's second key gift: a conception faithful to the inspirations of most writing about biophilia." Review, *Environmental Ethics* 18(1996):327-330, citations on p. 330.

Peter H. Kahn, Jr. cites "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" on human dialectical relationships with nature, humans finding both resistance and support encountering nature. In *The Human Relationship with Nature: Development and Culture* (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 1999), citations on pp. 57-58, p. 269. He also cites "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?", "Values in Nature," "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value," "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Landscapes Need to be Science-Based?", and "Biophilia, Selfish Genes, Shared Values," pp. 112-113, p. 183, p. 198, p. 369.

Mikael Stenmark (Theology, Uppsala University, Sweden) cites "Winning and Losing in Environmental Ethics," and "Feeding People versus Saving Nature," as he features Rolston's position in environmental ethics as one of four leading philosophers who have major importance for environmental decision making. In *Environmental Ethics and Policy Making* (Aldershot, UK: Ashgate, 2001), citations passim.

Maria Davradou and Gene Namkoong (Forest Sciences, University of British Columbia) cite "Duties to Endangered Species," "Challenges in Environmental Ethics," and other articles, applying Rolston's principles in environmental ethics to the conservation of grizzly bears and their habitat in British Columbia. In "Science, Ethical Arguments, and Management in the Preservation of Land for Grizzly Bear Conservation," *Conservation Biology* 15 (no. 3, June, 2001):570-577, citations passim.

Maria José Varandas Martins da Silva cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" "Wildlife and Wildlands: A Christian Perspective," and "Rights and Responsibilities on the Home Planet," using Rolston's value theory as the basis of her analysis. In *O Valor da Natureza: Caminhos para uma Ética Ecocentrada (Values in Nature: Toward an Ecocentric Morality)*. Faculdade de Letras da Universidade Clássica de Lisboa, 2000. M. A. thesis, University of Lisbon. In Portuguese. Citations passim.

Gregory H. Aplet (Forest Ecologist, The Wilderness Society) cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" for its analysis of distinctions between nature and culture. In "On the Nature of Wilderness: Exploring What Wilderness Really Means," *Denver University Law Review* 76(1999):347-367, citation on p. 354.

Frederick Ferré (Philosophy, University of Georgia) cites "Preservation of Natural Value in the Solar System." In *Living and Value: Toward a Constructive Postmodern Ethics* (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2001), citations on p. 248, p. 350.

Frank W. Derrigh (Philosophy, New York City Technical College) cites "Feeding People versus Saving Nature." In "Is Coerced Fertility Reduction to Preserve Nature Justifiable?" *Philosophy in the Contemporary World* 8 (no. 1, Spring 2001):21-30, citation on p. 23, p. 30.

Robert B. Keiter (Law, Wallace Stegner Center for Land, Resources and the Environment, University of Utah College of Law) cites "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone." In "Preserving Nature in the National Parks: Law, Policy, and Science in a Dynamic Environment," *Denver University Law Review* 74(no. 3, 1997):649-695, citation on p. 671, p. 672.

Steven F. Philipp (Health, Leisure, Sports, University of West Florida, Pensacola) cites

"Creation and Recreation: Environmental Benefits and Human Leisure." In "Race, Gender, and Leisure Benefits," *Leisure Sciences* 19(1997):191-207, citation on p. 191.

Paul Schullery (Yellowstone National Park) cites "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone." In "Yellowstone's Ecological Holocaust: The Legacy of Market Hunting in the Park's First Decade," *Montana: The Magazine of Western History* 47(no. 3, Autumn, 1997):16-33, citation and quotation on p. 32.

Peter H. Kahn, Jr. (Education and Human Development, Colby College, Maine), cites "Values in Nature" and "Biophilia: Selfish Genes, Shared Values." In "Developmental Psychology and the Biophilia Hypothesis: Children's Affiliation with Nature," *Developmental Review* 17(1997):1-61, citation on p. 17, pp. 33-34, p. 42, p. 59.

Robert S. Fudge (Philosophy, James Madison University, Harrisonburg, VA) cites and quotes "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Nature Need to be Science-Based?," developing Rolston's account of the role of science in the aesthetic appreciation of nature. In "Imagination and the Science-Based Aesthetic Appreciation of Unscenic Nature," *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 59(no. 3, Summer 2001):275-285, citations passim.

Thomas Heyd (Philosophy, University of Victoria, Victoria, British Columbia) cites "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Nature Need to be Science-Based?" In "Aesthetic Appreciation and the Many Stories about Nature," *British Journal of Aesthetics* 41(no. 2, April 2001):125-137, citation on p. 129.

Craig L. Shafer (The George Wright Society, Hancock, MI) cites "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone" for its analysis of the concept of the "natural" as applied to management policy in Yellowstone National Park. In "The Northern Yellowstone Elk Debate: Policy, Hypothesis, and Implications," *Natural Areas Journal* 20(no. 4, 2000):342-359, citation on p. 344.

Jame Schaefer (Theology, Marquette University) cites "Aesthetic Appreciation in Forests" and "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Landscapes Need to be Science-Based?" In "Appreciating the Beauty of Earth," *Theological Studies* 62(2001):23-52, citation on p. 24.

Nigel S. Cooper (Diocese of Chelmsford, Essex, UK) cites "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct" and "The Land Ethic at the Turn of the Millennium" for Rolston's defense of realism against the social construction of nature. In "Speaking and Listening to Nature: Ethics within Ecology," *Biodiversity and Conservation* 9(2000):1009-1027, citation on p. 1010.

Simon A. Hailwood (Philosophy, Liverpool University, UK) cites "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Landscapes Need to be Science-Based?" In "The Value of Nature's Otherness," *Environmental Values* 9(2000):353-372), citation on p. 356, p. 372.

Bill Throop (Green Mountain College, Vermont) cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" as "an important defense of wilderness preservation." In "Humans and the Value of the Wild," *Human Ecology Review* 3(no. 1, 1996):3-7, citations on p. 6., p. 7.

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, College of Charleston) cites Rolston doubt in "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" that humans can "improve" wilderness areas. In "Enhancing Natural Value?" *Human Ecology Review* 3(no. 1, 1996):8-11, citation on p. 9, p. 11.

Jan Wawrzyniak (Philosophy, Adam Mickiewicz University, Poznan, Poland) cites:
-"Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?"
-"The River of Life: Past, Present, and Future"

- "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?"
- "The Human Standing in Nature: Storied Fitness in the Moral Observer"
- "Science-based versus Tradition Ethics"
- "Disvalues in Nature"
- "Environmental Ethics - Some Challenges for Christians"
- "Rights and Responsibilities on the Home Planet"
- "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value"
- "Global Environmental Ethics: A Valuable Earth"
- "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct"
- "Nature and Culture in Environmental Ethics"

In *Teoretyczne podstawy neonaturalistycznej bioetyki środowiskowej (The Theoretical Foundations of Neonaturalistic Environmental Bioethics)*, Wydawnictwo Naukowe IF UAM (IF UAM Publishers), Poznań, 2000), citations passim.

Gary E. Varner (Philosophy, Texas A & M University) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" In *In Nature's Interests* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999), citation on p. 6, p. 149.

Jordan Paper (Religious and East Asian Studies, York University, Toronto) cites "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?" In "Chinese Religion, 'Daoism,' and Deep Ecology," pages 107-126, in David Landis Barnhill and Roger S. Gottlieb, eds., *Deep Ecology and World Religions: New Essays on Sacred Grounds* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2001), citations on p. 117, p. 125. Similar citation in "'Daoism' and 'Deep Ecology': Fantasy and Potentiality," pages 3-21 in N. J. Girardot, James Miller, and Liu Xiaogan, eds., *Daoism and Ecology: Ways within a Cosmic Landscape* (Cambridge, MA: Center for the Study of World Religions and Harvard University Press, 2001), citations on p. 13, p. 20.

Avner de-Shalit (Politics, Hebrew University, Jerusalem) cites "River of Life," in "Future Generations, Obligations to," in *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, 10 vols, ed., Edward Craig (London: Routledge, 1998) in vol. 3, pp. 819-822, citation on p. 821-822.

Mikael Stenmark (Theology, Uppsala University, Uppsala, Sweden) cites "Winning and Losing in Environmental Ethics" and "Feeding People versus Saving Nature." In *Environmental Ethics and Policy Making* (London: Ashgate, 2002), citations passim. Previously published in Swedish.

David Takacs (Environmental Studies, Cornell University) cites and quotes from "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" and "Duties to Endangered Species." In his chapter on values: "The writings of ... Holmes Rolston have provided me with much scope for contemplation of the theory issues raised in this chapter" (p. 196). In *The Idea of Biodiversity: Philosophies of Paradise* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996), citations on p. 54, p. 56, p. 67, p. 196, p. 377.

Irene Klaver (Philosophy, University of North Texas, Denton), Jozef Keulartz, Henk van den Belt, and Bart Gremmen (all in Department of Applied Philosophy, Wageningen University, Wageningen, The Netherlands) cite "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone" on the analysis of nature and culture. In "Born to be Wild: A Pluralistic Ethics Concerning Large Herbivores in the Netherlands," *Environmental Ethics* 24(2002):3-21, citations on pp. 13-14.

Steven Vogel (Philosophy, Denison University, Granville, OH) cites "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" and "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" on the various meanings of the word "nature" and nature as a social construct. In "Environmental Philosophy after the End of Nature," *Environmental Ethics* 24(2002):23-39, citations on pp. 26-27, p. 33.

N. J. Girardot (Religion, Lehigh University), James Miller (Religion, Queen's University,

Kingston, Ontario), and Liu Xiaogan (Philosophy, Beijing University) cite "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?" in a select, annotated bibliography. In *Daoism and Ecology: Ways within a Cosmic Landscape* (Cambridge, MA: Center for the Study of World Religions and Harvard University Press, 2001), citation on p. 422.

Philip Cafaro (Philosophy, Colorado State University) cites "Values in Nature." In "Less is More: Economic Consumption and the Good Life," *Philosophy Today* 42(Spring 1998):26-39, citations on p. 35, p. 39.

Philip Cafaro (Philosophy, Colorado State University) cites "The Pasqueflower," "Human Values and Natural Systems," and "Mystery and Majesty in Washington County." In "The Naturalist's Virtues," *Philosophy in the Contemporary World* 8 (no. 2, Fall-Winter 2001):85-99), citations on p. 91, p. 92, p. 97, pp. 98-99.

Geoffrey B. Frasz (Philosophy, Community College of Southern Nevada, Las Vegas) cites "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility." In "What Is Environmental Virtue Ethics that We Should Be Mindful of?" *Philosophy in the Contemporary World* 8 (no. 2, 2001):5-14, citation on p. 6, p. 13.

Richard L. Fern (Ethics, Yale Divinity School) cites "The River of Life: Past, Present, and Future." In *Nature, God and Humanity: Envisioning an Ethics of Nature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), citations on pp. 51-52, p. 91, pp. 256-257.

Alexander Gillespie (University of Nottingham [UK], Law School; Legal Representative, International Whaling Commission) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?", "Values Gone Wild," "Valuing Wildlands," "Biology without Conservation: An Environmental Misfit and Contradiction in Terms," "Values and Duties to the Natural World," "Challenges in Environmental Ethics," "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," "Rights and Responsibilities on the Home Planet," "The River of Life: Past, Present, and Future," and "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value." In *International Environmental Law, Policy and Ethics* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), citations on p. 40, p. 84, p. 106, p. 115, p. 143, p. 148, p. 149, p. 150, p. 153, p. 163, p. 164, p. 166, pp. 202-203.

Theresa Satterfield (Decision Research, Eugene, Oregon) cites "Aesthetic Experience in Forests," using it in her survey instrument and to measure the strength of religious dimensions of aesthetic values in nature. In "In Search of Value Literacy: Suggestions for the Elicitation of Environmental Values," *Environmental Values* 10(2001):331-359, citations on p. 349, p. 368.

James D. Proctor (Geography, University of California, Santa Barbara) cites "Is there an Ecological Ethic?" as introducing questions of intellectual interest to geographers. In "Geography, Paradox and Environmental Ethics," *Progress in Human Geography* 22 (no. 2, 1998):234-255, citations on p. 234, p. 254.

Gregory Cooper (Philosophy, Duke University) cites "Environmental Ethics: Duties to and Values in the Natural World" on ecosystems as selective systems. In "Teleology and Environmental Ethics," *American Philosophical Quarterly* 35(no. 2, 1998):195-207, citation on p. 200, pp. 201-202, p. 204, p. 207.

Taylor V. Stein (School of Forest Resources and Conservation, University of Florida), Dorothy H. Anderson (Department of Forest Resources, University of Minnesota) and Tim Kelly (Office of Planning, Minnesota Department of Natural Resources) cite "Valuing Wildlands" and "Creation and Recreation: Environmental Benefits and Human Leisure" for the analysis of multiple values on landscapes. In "Using Stakeholders' Values to Apply Ecosystem Management in an Upper Midwest Landscape," *Environmental Management*

24(no. 3, 1999):399-413, citation on p. 399, p. 400, p. 413.

Andrew J. Kerr (Organic Farming, Dodgeville, WI) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "The Human Standing in Nature: Storied Fitness in the Moral Observer," for Rolston's attempts to overcome the naturalistic fallacy by arguing from the character of evolutionary and ecological creativity to human duties to conserve the storied process and its products. In "The Possibility of Metaphysics: Environmental Ethics and the Naturalistic Fallacy," *Environmental Ethics* 22(2000):65-99, citations on pp. 92-95, passim.

Ben A. Minteer (School of Public Policy, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta) cites "Saving Nature, Feeding People, and the Foundations of Ethics," countering Rolston's claims about saving tigers in Nepal for their own sake with pragmatic justifications for saving tigers. In "Intrinsic Value for Pragmatists," *Environmental Ethics* 22(2001):57-75, citations on pp. 71-77.

Christopher J. Preston (Philosophy, University of South Carolina, Columbia, SC) cites "Down to Earth: Persons in Place in Natural History" and "Naturalizing Values: Organisms and Species" for Rolston's development of narrative in ethics complementing intrinsic value in nature. In "Intrinsic Value and Care: Making Connections through Ecological Narratives," *Environmental Values* 10(2001):243-263, citation on p. 243, p. 244, pp. 247-248, p. 251, pp. 253-256, p. 258, pp. 262-263.

Jill Le Blanc (Philosophy, McMaster University, Hamilton, Ontario) critiques "Disvalues in Nature," arguing that Rolston's account of evil in nature requires as much a mystical as it does a rationalist response. In "A Mystical Response to Disvalue in Nature," *Philosophy Today* 45(Fall 2002):254-265, citations passim.

Paul Gimeno cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in an extensive review of *Conserving Natural Value*. "Éthique environnementale, valeur, anthropocentrisme et démocratie," *Critique: Revue generale des publications francaises et etrangeres* (Paris) 54(no. 612, 1998):225-245, citation on p. 226. In French.

T. N. Jenkins (Rural Studies, University of Wales, Aberystwyth) cites "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?" In "Chinese Traditional Thought and Practice: Lessons for an Ecological Economics Worldview," *Ecological Economics* 40(2002):39-52, citation on p. 48, p. 52.

Andrew Dobson (Politics, University of Keele, England) cites "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World," for its account of integrity in plants and animals, a consideration which constrains genetic engineering. In "Genetic Engineering and Environmental Ethics," *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (Cambridge University Press) 6(1997):205-221, citations on p. 213, p. 214, p. 215, p. 220, p. 221.

Gottard M. Teutsch (Bayreuth, Germany) cites and summarizes "Respekt vor dem Leben: Das berücksichtigen, was Singer als belanglos ansieht" from *Natur und Kultur* 2, 1, 97-117. In "Mensch und Mitgeschöpf unter ethischem Aspekt (Humans and Fellow Creatures from an Ethical Aspect)," *Altex: Alternativen zu Tierexperimenten* (Heidelberg), 18(no. 4, 2001):227-259, citations on p. 236, p. 259.

Johnny P. Stowe, Jr., Elise Vernon Schmidt, and Deborah Green (College of William and Mary, Williamsburg, VA) cite "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" In "Toxic Burials: The Final Insult," *Conservation Biology* 15 (no. 6, 2001):1817-1819, citation on p. 1818, p. 1819.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of North Texas) cites and quotes from "Is There an

Ecological Ethic?", "Values in Nature," "Valuing Wildlands," and "Naturalizing Callicott," on intrinsic value in nature and its effectiveness in conservation policy. In "The Pragmatic Power and Promise of Theoretical Environmental Ethics: Forging a New Discourse," *Environmental Values* 11(no. 1, 2002):3-25, citations on p. 5, p. 11, p. 12, p. 21, p. 22, p. 25.

Clare Palmer (Philosophy, Lancaster University, UK) cites "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value," "Feeding People and Saving Nature," "Wilderness Reaffirmed," and "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" In "An Overview of Environmental Ethics," in Andrew Light and Holmes Rolston, III, eds., *Environmental Ethics* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 2003), pp. 15-37, citations on p. 17, p. 26, p. 33, p. 37.

Jerre J. Vaske, Maureen P. Donnelly, Daniel R. Williams, and Sandra Jonker (Department of Natural Resource Recreation and Tourism, Colorado State University, and Rocky Mountain Research Station, US Forest Service, Fort Collins, CO) cite "Human Values and Natural Systems" for Rolston's taxonomy of values in nature. In "Demographic Influences on Environmental Value Orientations and Normative Beliefs about National Forest Management," *Society and Natural Resources* 14(2001):761-776, citation on p. 773, p. 776.

Richard W. Haynes (Pacific Northwest Research Station, USDA Forest Service, Portland, OR) and Thomas M. Quigley (Pacific Northwest Research Station, LaGrande, OR) cite "Environmental Science and Environmental Ethics" for its analysis of the role of advocacy in environmental science. In "Broad-scale Consequences of Land Management: Columbia Basin Example," *Forest Ecology and Management* 153(2001):179-188, citation on p. 179, p. 188.

Stephen Trudgill (Biogeography, Geography, Cambridge University) cites "Nature, the Genesis of Value, and Human Understanding" for its account of the use of metaphor in understanding nature. In "Psychobiogeography: Meanings of Nature and Motivations for a Democratized Conservation Ethic," *Journal of Biogeography* 28(2001):677-698.

Bill Willers (Biology, University of Wisconsin, Oshkosh) cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" for its criticism of postmodern attacks on the wilderness idea. In "The Postmodern Attack on Wilderness," *Natural Areas Journal* 21(2001):259-265, citation on p. 260, p. 265.

Terry C. Daniel (Psychology and School for Renewable Natural Resources, University of Arizona, Tucson) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" and "Human Values and Natural Systems" for Rolston's analysis of objective properties underlying the assessment of landscape quality. In "Whither Scenic Beauty? Visual Landscape Quality Assessment in the 21st Century," *Landscape and Urban Planning* 54(2001):267-281, citations on p. 269, p. 274, p. 280.

Stephen Wearing (University of Technology, Sydney) and John Neil (University of Newcastle, UK) cite "Challenges in Environmental Ethics" for its account of the ecocentric approach to an ethics of nature. In "Refiguring Self and Identity Through Volunteer Tourism," *Loisir et société, Society and Leisure* 23 (no. 2, 2000):389-419, citation on p. 402, p. 416.

Gregory Brown (Environmental Science, Alaska Pacific University, Anchorage) and Patrick Reed (Chugach National Forest, Anchorage) use Rolston's topology of types of values in nature, testing it for public acceptance and forest management, especially for the types of intrinsic values in nature. In "A Forest Ethic and Multivalue Forest Management." In "Validation of a Forest Values Typology for Use in National Forest Planning," *Forest Science* 46(no. 2, 2000):240-247, citations passim.

Werner L. Kutsch, Wolf Steinborn, Mathias Herbst, Rainer Baumann, Jan Barkmann, and Ludger Kappan (Ökologiezentrum der Christian-Albrechts-Universität zu Kiel, Germany) cite Rolston's preface to Laura Westra, *An Environmental Proposal for Ethics: The Principle of Integrity*. In "Environmental Indication: A Field Test of an Ecosystem Approach to Quantify Biological Self-Organization," *Ecosystems* 4(2002):49-66, citation on p. 50, p. 65.

Steve Trudgill (Biogeography and Environmental Management, Department of Geography, Cambridge University) cites "Nature, the Genesis of Value and Human Understanding." In *The Terrestrial Biosphere: Environmental Change, Ecosystem Science, Attitudes, and Values* (Harlow, UK: Pearson Education/Prentice Hall, 2001), citation on p. 109, p. 282.

Glenn W. Suter II (National Center for Environmental Assessment, Environmental Protection Agency, Cincinnati, OH) cites Rolston's Preface to Laura Westra, *An Environmental Proposal for Ethics: The Principle of Integrity*. In "Generic Assessment Endpoints Are Needed for Ecological Risk Assessment," *Risk Analysis* 20 (no. 2, 2000):173-178, citations on p. 177, p. 178.

Andrew Brennan and Yeuk-Sze Lo (Philosophy, University of Western Australia) cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" as an early and influential article in the field, and also "Feeding People versus Saving Nature" as a later and controversial article. In "Environmental Ethics," *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Stanford University, 2002. Online at: <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/ethics-environmental/>

Edward O. Wilson (Biology, Harvard University) cites "In Defense of Bioexuberance." In *The Future of Life* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2002), citation on pp. 133, 134, p. 205.

Johan Hattingh (Philosophy, University of Stellenbosch, South Africa) and Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Wales, Cardiff) cite "Feeding People versus Saving Nature." In "Ecological Sustainability in a Developing Country such as South Africa? A Philosophical and Ethical Inquiry," *International Journal of Human Rights* 6(no. 2, Summer 2002);65-92, citations on pp. 85-88.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of North Texas), Larry B. Crowder, and Karen Mumford cite "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" for its analysis of how humans in culture differ from wild nature. In "Current Normative Concepts in Conservation," *Conservation Biology* 13(no. 1, 1999):22-35, citation on p. 24, p. 34.

Michael Hauskeller (Philosophy, University of Darmstadt, Germany) cites "Value in Nature and Nature of Value" (in German translation) on the concept of intrinsic (inherent) value in nature. In *Versuch über die Grundlagen der Moral* (München: C. H. Beck, 2001), citations on pp. 49-54, p. 275.

Mark Rowlands (Philosophy, University of Ireland, Cork) cites "Values in Nature." In *The Environmental Crisis: Understanding the Value of Nature* (Basingstoke, Hampshire: Macmillan Press; New York: St. Martins, 2000), citation on p. 12, p. 179.

Elisa Aaltola and Markku Oksanen (Philosophy, University of Turku, Finland) cite "Enforcing Environmental Ethics: Civic Law and Natural Value." In "Species Conservation and Minority Rights: The Case of Springtime Bird Hunting in Åland," *Environmental Values* 11(2002):443-460, citation on p. 445, p. 460.

Malcolm Budd (Philosophy, University College London) cites "Aesthetic Experience in Forests" on the positive aesthetics in nature. In "The Aesthetics of Nature," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 100(2000):137-157, citations on p. 138, pp. 150-151, p. 157.

Stan Godlovitch (Philosophy, Lincoln University, Canterbury, NZ) cites "Values Gone Wild." In "Valuing Nature and the Autonomy of Natural Aesthetics," *British Journal of Aesthetics* 38(no. 2, 1998):180-197, citation on p. 191.

Suzanne E. Foster (Philosophy, Marquette University, Milwaukee) cites "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility" on how caring for nonhumans is based on a perception of their goodness. In "Aristotle and the Environment," *Environmental Ethics* 24(2002):409-428, citation on p. 422.

Philipp Balzer, Klaus Peter Rippe, and Peter Schaber (Ethik-Zentrum der Universitaet Zuerich, Center for Ethics, University of Zurich, Switzerland) cite "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" on the similarity of Aristotle's *telos* of an organism and in contemporary biology of an organism's genetic makeup. In "Two Concepts of Dignity for Humans and Non-Human Organisms in the Context of Genetic Engineering," *Journal of Agricultural and Environmental Ethics* 13(2000):7-27, citation on p. 21, p. 27.

Christoph Rehmann-Sutter (Institute für Geschichte und Ethik der Medizin der Universität Basel, Switzerland) cites "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value" for its organismic theory of intrinsic value. In "Biological Organicism and the Ethics of the Human-Nature Relationship," *Theory in Biosciences/Theorie in den Biowissenschaften* 119(2000):334-354, citation on p. 338, p. 354.

Mariachiara Tallacchini (Dipartimento di Teoria e Storia del Diritto, Università degli Studi di Firenze--Department of Philosophy of Law, University of Florence) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" In "A Legal Framework from Ecology," *Biodiversity and Conservation* 9(2000):1085-1098, citation on p. 1098.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of North Texas, Denton) cites "Saving Nature, Feeding People, and the Foundations of Ethics." In "Silencing Philosophers: Minter and the Foundations of Anti-foundationalism," *Environmental Values* 8(1999):499-516, citations on p. 504, p. 511, p. 512, p. 515.

Daniel Berthold-Bond (Philosophy, Bard College, Annandale-on-Hudson, NY) cites "People, Population, Prosperity, and Place." In "The Ethics of 'Place': Reflections on Bioregionalism," *Environmental Ethics* 22(2000):5-24, citation on p. 6.

David Lowenthal (Geography, University College, London) cites "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" In "Nature and Morality from George Perkins Marsh to the Millennium," *Journal of Historical Geography* 26(2000):3-27, citation on p. 20.

Douglas B. Johnson (Madison, WI) cites "Environmental Protection and an Equitable International Order." Rolston is "a well-known environmental ethicist." In "Green Businesses: Perspectives from Management and Business Ethics," *Society and Natural Resources* 11(1998):259-266, citation on p. 261, p. 266.

Axel Gosseries (FNRS [National Fund for Scientific Research] Research Professor (Maitre de recherches) and a Professeur extraordinaire at Louvain, France) cites "Feeding People versus Saving Nature?" In "L'éthique environnementale aujourd'hui (Environmental Ethics Today)," *Revue Philosophique de Louvain* 96(no. 3, 1998):395-426, citation on p. 401.

Ilona Cheyne (Newcastle Law School, UK) cites "Duties to Endangered Species." In "Law and Ethics in the Trade and Environment Debate: Tuna, Dolphins and Turtles," *Journal of Environmental Law* (Oxford University Press) 12 (no. 3, 2000):293-316, citation on p. 310.

Richard P. Reading, Brian J. Miller (Denver Zoological Foundation and Northern Rockies Conservation Cooperative, Denver), and Stephen R. Kellert (Yale University School of Forestry and Environmental Studies) cite "Values in Nature" on nonmarket values in nature. In "Values and Attitudes toward Prairie Dogs," *Anthrozoos* 12(no. 1, 1999):43-52, citation on p. 44, p. 51.

Luc Ferry (Philosophy, The Sorbonne, Paris and University of Caen) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" In *Le nouvel ordre écologique: L'arbre, l'animal et l'homme*. Paris: Bernard Grasset, 1992. In English: *The New Ecological Order*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995. Citation on p. 87, English edition.

Daniel C. Esty (Associate Dean, Yale School of Forestry and Environmental Studies; Law, Yale Law School, Deputy Chief of Staff for Policy, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency) cites "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" for its analysis of values in nature of moral concern. In "Toward Optimal Environmental Governance," *New York University Law Review* 74(December 1999):1495-1574, citation on p. 1523.

Helene Marsh and Carole M. Eros (Ecology, James Cook University, Townsville, Qld, Australia) cite "Values in Nature." In "Ethics of Field Research: Do Journals Set the Standard?", *Science and Engineering Ethics* 5(1999):375-382, citation on p. 376, p. 381.

Philip J. Burton (Symbios Research and Restoration, Smithers, British Columbia), Daniel D. Kneeshaw (Le Groupe de Recherche en Ecologie Forestiere, Université du Québec a Montréal), and K. David Coates (British Columbia Forest Service, Research Station, Smithers, British Columbia) cite "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" In "Managing Forest Harvesting to Maintain Old Growth in Boreal and Sub-boreal Forests," *The Forestry Chronicle* 75(no. 4, 1999):623-631, citation on p. 629, p. 631.

Robert Sparrow (Philosophy, Research School of Social Sciences, Australian National University, Canberra) cites "The Preservation of Natural Value in the Solar System." In "The Ethics of Terraforming," *Environmental Ethics* 21(no. 3, 1999):227-245, citations on p. 228, p. 232.

Jerry J. Vaske and Maureen P. Donnelly (Natural Resource Recreation and Tourism, Colorado State University) cite "Human Values and Natural Systems" for its taxonomy of values in nature. In "A Value-Attitude-Behavior Model Predicting Wildland Preservation Voting Intentions," *Society and Natural Resources* 12(1999):523-537, citation on p. 534, p. 536.

Robert Manning, William Valliere, and Ben Minter (School of Natural Resources, University of Vermont) cite "A Forest Ethic and Multivalued Forest Management" for its classification of types of values in forests. In "Values, Ethics, and Attitudes Toward National Forest Management: An Empirical Study," *Society and Natural Resources* 12(1999):421-436, citation on p. 422, p. 436.

Michael E. Patterson (School of Forestry, University of Montana), Alan E. Watson (Aldo Leopold Wilderness Research Institute, Missoula, MT), Daniel R. Williams (U.S. Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station, Fort Collins, CO), and Joseph R. Roggenbuck (Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg, VA) cite "Beauty and the Beast: Aesthetic Experience of Wildlife." In "An Hermeneutic Approach to Studying the Nature of Wilderness Experiences," *Journal of Leisure Research* 30(no. 4, 1998):423-452, citation on p. 425, p. 451.

Steven Vogel (Philosophy, Denison University, Granville, OH) cites "Nature for Real: Is

Nature a Social Construct?" and "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" In "Nature as Origin and Difference: On Environmental Philosophy and Continental Thought," *Philosophy Today* 42 (SEEP Supplement):169-181, citation on p. 169, p. 179. Reprinted pages 296-310 in Michael E. Zimmerman, et al, *Environmental Philosophy: From Animal Rights to Radical Ecology*, 4th ed. (Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson/Prentice Hall, 2005), citations on p. 309-310.

Christopher J. Preston (Philosophy, University of South Carolina) cites "Duties to Endangered Species" [reprinted as "Why Species Matter" in Van De Veer and Pierce, *The Environmental Ethics and Policy Book*]. In *Grounding Knowledge: Environmental Philosophy, Epistemology, and Place* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2003), citations on pp. 114-116, p. 144, p. 153.

Mathew Humphrey (Philosophy, University of Nottingham, UK) cites "Saving Nature, Feeding People, and the Foundations of Ethics." In *Preservation Versus the People? Nature, Humanity, and Political Philosophy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), citations on p. 3, p. 18, p. 205.

Hugo Fjelsted Alroe and Erik Steen Kristensen (Danish Research Centre for Organic Farming, Tjele, Denmark) cite "Lake Solitude: The Individual in Wildness" on the sense of participation in wild nature. They also cite Rolston's account of systemic value. In "Toward a Systemic Ethic: In Search of an Ethical Basis for Sustainability and Precaution," *Environmental Ethics* 25(2003):59-78, citation on p. 69, p. 77.

David Schmidtz and Matt Zwolinski (Philosophy, University of Arizona) cite Rolston's entry on "Biodiversity" in Dale Jamieson, ed., *A Companion to Environmental Ethics* for "a superb discussion of scientific and philosophical puzzles involved in the concept of a species," but taking issue with Rolston's defense of policy in African nations of shooting elephant poachers. In "Review, Dale Jamieson, ed., *A Companion to Environmental Philosophy* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2001)" in *Environmental Ethics* 25(2003):99-104.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of North Texas) and Michael P. Nelson (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" In *American Indian Environmental Ethics* (Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pierson/Prentice Hall, 2004), citation on p. 4. p. 140.

Christopher Belshaw (Philosophy, The Open University, Milton Keynes, UK) cites "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value." In *Environmental Philosophy: Reason, Nature and Human Culture* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2001), citation on p. 209, p. 305.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Wales, Cardiff) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Feeding People versus Saving Nature," In *Environmental Ethics: An Overview for the Twenty-First Century* (Cambridge: Polity/Blackwell, 2003), citations on pp. 37, 38, 44, 56-58, 60, 141-144, 154, 156, 215.

J. Robert Loftis (Philosophy, University of Alabama) cites "Is There an Ecology Ethic" and "Duties to Endangered Species." In "Three Problems for the Aesthetic Foundations of Environmental Ethics," *Philosophy in the Contemporary World* 10 (no. 2, Fall-Winter 2003):41-50, citations on p. 46, p. 47, p. 50.

Bruce Morito (Department of Philosophy, Athabasca University, Athabasca, Alberta, Canada) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?," "Values Gone Wild," and "Disvalues in Nature." In "Intrinsic Value: A Modern Albatross for the Ecological Approach,"

Environmental Values 12(2003):317-336, citations on p. 322, p. 328, pp. 334-336.

Patrick Curry (Sophia Centre, Bath Spa University College, UK) dislikes Rolston's realism in "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" in "Re-Thinking Nature: Towards an Eco-Pluralism," *Environmental Values* 12(2003):337-360, citation on p. 352, p. 359.

Mark A. Michael cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" In "What's In a Name: Pragmatism, Essentialism, and Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Values* 12(2003):361-379, citation on p. 362, p. 378, p. 379.

Ronald Sandler (Philosophy, Northeastern University, Boston) cites "Saving Nature, Feeding People, and the Foundations of Ethics." In "The External Goods Approach to Virtue Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 25(2003):279-293, citation on p. 281.

Bryan Norton (Philosophy and Public Policy, Georgia Institute of Technology) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" In "Conservation: Moral Crusade or Environmental Public Policy?" Pages 187-205, pages 378-380 in Ben A. Minteer, and Robert E. Manning, eds., *Reconstructing Conservation: Finding Common Ground* (Washington: Island Press, 2001), citation on pp. 194-195, p. 378.

Robert E. Manning (Natural Resources, University of Vermont) cites "A Forest Ethic and Multivalue Forest Management" on the classification of forest and related values. In Ben A. Minteer and Robert E. Manning, ed., *Reconstructing Conservation: Finding Common Ground* (Washington, DC: Island Press, 2001), pp. 207-222, pp. 380-382, citations on p. 209, p. 381.

Marc Bekoff (Biology, University of Colorado, Boulder) cites "Environmental Ethics in Antarctica" on preserving Antarctica without permanent human development there. In "Minding Animals, Minding Earth: Old Brains, New Bottlenecks," *Zygon: Journal of Religion and Science* 34(2003):911-941, citation on p. 923, p. 941.

Christine E. Gudorf and James E. Hutchingson (Philosophy, Florida International University) cite "Environmental Ethics: Values and Duties in the Natural World" on the radical character of environmental ethics in both theory and practice. In *Boundaries: A Casebook in Environmental Ethics* (Washington: Georgetown University Press, 2003), citations on p. 1, p. 2, p. 22, p. 23.

Bill Hook (Computer Science, Boulder, CO) cites "Challenges in Environmental Ethics" and "Valuing Wildlands." In "Intrinsic Value: Under the Scrutiny of Information and Evolutionary Theory," *Environmental Ethics* 25(2003):359-373, citations on p. 363, p. 373.

Bryan Norton (Philosophy and Public Policy, Georgia Institute of Technology) and Ben A. Minteer (Public Policy, Georgia Institute of Technology) cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic?". In "From Environmental Ethics to Environmental Public Policy: Ethicists and Economists, 1973-Future." Pages 373-407 in Tom Tietenberg and Henk Folmer, eds., *The International Yearbook of Environmental and Resource Economics 2002/2003: A Survey of Current Issues* (Cheltenham UK: Edward Elgar, 2002), citations on p. 376, p. 406.

David Strohmaier (Historical Research Associates, Missoula, Montana) cites "Valuing Wildlands" on wildlands and cultural values. In "Threescore and Ten: Fire, Place and Loss in the West," *Ethics and the Environment* 8(no. 2, 2003):31-41, citation on p. 41.

James Jakob Liszka (Philosophy, University of Alaska, Anchorage) cites "Duties to Ecosystems" on ethical concerns for ecosystems. In "The Narrative Ethics of Leopold's *Sand County Almanac*," *Ethics and the Environment* 8(no. 2, 2003):41-70, citation on p.

67, p. 70.

Kathryn Norlock (Philosophy, St. Mary's College of Maryland) cites "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World." In "The Atrocity Paradigm Applied to Environmental Ethics," *Ethics and the Environment* 9(no. 1, 2004):85-93, citation p. 88, p. 92, p. 93.

Eccy de Jonge cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?," "Values in Nature," "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?," "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," and "Feeding People versus Saving Nature?". In *Spinoza and Deep Ecology: Challenging Traditional Approaches to Environmentalism* (Aldershot, Hants., UK: Ashgate, 2004), citations on p. 17, p. 18, p. 31, p. 158.

Hugh P. McDonald (Philosophy, New York City College of Technology) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" and "Feeding People versus Saving Nature?" In *John Dewey and Environmental Philosophy* (New York: State University of New York Press, 2004). Rolston is "among the [three] most prominent environmental philosophers, who have published the most thoroughgoing and articulate defenses of intrinsic value in environmental philosophy" (pp. xiv-xv). "Such a wide and dynamic notion of the kinds, bearers, and location of values enable Rolston to criticize a wide array of traditional value theories" (p. 45). Citations on pp. xiv-xv, 1, 9-11, 18, 26, 36-50, 53, 55-56, 59, 64-65, 121, 123-124, 133, 140, 152.

Robert Chapman (Philosophy, Pace University) cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," and complains that Rolston inadequately distinguishes between wilderness and wildness. In "Crowded Solitude: Thoreau on Wildness," *Environmental Philosophy* 1 (no. 1, Spring 2004):58-72, citations on pp. 60-61, p. 67.

Michael Ruse (Philosophy, Florida State University) says that Holmes Rolston is "the leading philosopher of ecology." In "My World, and Welcome to It," *New York Times Book Review*, July 4, 2004, p. 22.

Audrey R. Chapman (Dialogue on Science, Ethics, and Religion, American Association for the Advancement of Science) cites "Ecology: A Primer for Christian Ethics." In "The Greening of Science, Theology, and Ethics." Pages 211-227 in Ted Peters, ed., *Science and Theology: The New Consonance* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1998), citation on p. 213, p. 215.

Lisa H. Sideris (School of Environment and Faculty of Religious Studies, McGill University, Montreal) cites Rolston repeatedly: "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone," "Biophilia, Selfish Genes, Shared Values," "Challenges in Environmental Ethics," "Disvalues in Nature," "Does Nature Need to be Redeemed?," "Duties to Endangered Species," "Environmental Ethics in Antarctica," "God and Endangered Species," "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," and "Wildlife and Wildlands." In *Environmental Ethics, Ecological Theology, and Natural Selection* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003), citations passim.

Workineh Kelbessa (Philosophy, Addis Ababa University, Ethiopia) cites "Duties to Endangered Species," "Biophilia, Selfish Genes, Shared Values," "Feeding People versus Saving Nature," "Ethics and the Environment: Types of Environmental Ethics," and "Ethics on the Home Planet." In "Environmental Ethics in Theory and Practical Application," *Ethiopian Journal of the Social Sciences and Humanities* 1 (no. 1, December 2003):63-88, citations passim, esp. p. 87.

James J. Kennedy (Environmental Science, Wageningen University, Netherlands and Utah State University, Logan) and Niels Elers Koch (Danish Forest and Landscape Research Institute, Hoersholm, Denmark) cite Rolston and Coufal, "A Forest Ethic and Multivalued Forest Management." In "Viewing and Managing Natural Resources as Human-Ecosystem Relationships," *Forest Policy and Economics* 6(2004):497-504, citation on p. 500.

Cassandra Y. Johnson, J. M. Bowker (Southern Research Station, USDA Forest Service, Athens, GA), John C. Bergstrom (Agricultural and Applied Economics, University of Georgia) and H. Ken Hull (Southern Research Station, USDA Forest Service) cite "Valuing Wildlands." In "Wilderness Values in America: Does Immigrant Status or Ethnicity Matter?," *Society and Natural Resources* 17(2004):611-628, citation on p. 615.

Daniel Brito (Instituto de Ciências Biológicas, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Brazil) cites "Duties to Endangered Species," for its analogy of destroying species being like tearing pages out of a book humans hardly know how to read. In "Lack of Adequate Taxonomic Knowledge May Hinder Endemic Mammal Conservation in the Brazilian Atlantic Forest," *Biodiversity and Conservation* 13(2004):2135-2144, citation on p. 2142.

Kurt Jax (UFZ [Helmholtz-Zentrum für Umweltforschung] Centre for Environmental Research Leipzig-Halle, Department of Conservation Biology, Leipzig, Germany) and Ricardo Rozzi (Omoro Ethnobotanical Park, Universidad de Magallanes, Puerto Williams, Chile) cite "Biology and Philosophy in Yellowstone" on the protection of values in non-human nature. In "Ecological Theory and Values in the Determination of Conservation Goals: Examples from Temperate Regions of Germany, United States of America, and Chile," *Revista Chilena de Historia Natural* 77(2004):349-366, citation on p. 359, p. 365.

Terre Satterfield (Institute for Resources and Environmental Sustainability, University of British Columbia, Vancouver) cites "Ethics and the Environment" (in Baker and Richardson, eds., *Ethics Applied*, Simon and Schuster) for its arguments about anthropocentric versus biocentric morality. In "Emotional Agency and Contentious Practice: Activist Disputes in Old-Growth Forests," *Ethos* (American Anthropological Association) 32 (no. 2, 2004):233-256, citation on p. 248, p. 255.

Shashi Kant and Susan Lee (Faculty of Forestry, University of Toronto) cite "Valuing Wildlands" and Rolston and Coufal, "A Forest Ethic and Multivalued Forest Management" for its analysis of types of values in forests. In "A Social Choice Approach to Sustainable Forest Management: An Analysis of Multiple Forest Values in Northwestern Ontario," *Forest Policy and Economics* 6(2004):215-227, citation on p. 216.

Sen Wang (Pacific Forestry Centre, Canadian Forestry Service, National Resources Canada, Victoria, BC) cites Rolston and Coufal, "A Forest Ethic and Multivalued Forest Management" for its analysis of multiple values in forests. In "One Hundred Faces of Sustainable Forest Management," *Forest Policy and Economics* 6(2004):205-213, citation on p. 208, p. 212.

Elizabeth Willott (Entomology, University of Arizona, Tucson) cites "Disvalues in Nature," and Light and Rolston, eds., *Environmental Ethics: An Anthology*. In "Restoring Nature, Without Mosquitoes?" *Restoration Ecology* 12(no. 2, 2004):147-153, citations on p. 148, p. 153, also cf. p. 149.

Tim Hatcher (Adult and Community College Education, North Carolina State University, Raleigh) cites "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value" and Light and Rolston, eds., *Environmental Ethics: An Anthology*. In "Environmental Ethics as an Alternative for Evaluation Theory in For-Profit Business Contexts," *Evaluation and Program Planning* 27(2004):357-363, citation on p. 360, p. 363.

Eric Clark (Department of Social and Economic Geography, Lund University, Lund, Sweden) cites "Duties to Endangered Species." In "The Ballad Dance of the Faeroese: Island Biocultural Geography in an Age of Globalisation," *Tijdschrift voor Economische en Social Geografie* 95(no. 3, 2004):284-297, citation on p. 292, p. 296.

Lewis P. Hinchman (Philosophy, Clarkson University, Potsdam, NY) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" in (Guren and Jamieson). In "Is Environmentalism a Humanism?" *Environmental Values* 13(2004):3-29, citations on p. 5, p. 28, p. 29, cf. p. 24.

David Harmon (Executive Director, George Wright Society) cites "God and Endangered Species" for its argument about the prolific Earth and the goodness of creation. In "Biodiversity and the Sacred: Some Insights for Preserving Cultural Diversity and Heritage," *Museum International* 55(no. 218, 2003):63-69, citation on p. 68, p. 69.

Louis-Jacques Van Bogaert (Department of Philosophy, University of Stellenbosch, South Africa) cites *Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World* (in Winkler and Coombs, eds, *Applied Ethics*, for its arguments about the moral considerability of sentience. In "Sentience and Moral Standing," *South African Journal of Philosophy* 23(no. 3, 2004):292-301, citation on p. 292, p. 299, p. 300.

Eileen Crist (Science and Technology in Society, Virginia Tech, Blacksburg, VA) cites "Wildlife and Wildlands: A Christian Perspective" and "Nature for Real." In "Against the Social Construction of Nature and Wilderness," *Environmental Ethics* 26(no. 1, 2004):5-24, citations on p. 11, p. 16, p. 21, p. 23.

Ben A. Minteer, Elizabeth A. Corley, and Robert E. Manning (Human Dimensions of Biology Faculty, School of Life Sciences, Arizona State University, Tempe) cite "Is There an Ecological Ethic?", disliking Rolston's emphasis on intrinsic value in nature, in favor of a more pragmatic and contextually applied environmental ethics. In "Environmental Ethics Beyond Principle? The Case for a Pragmatic Contextualism," *Journal of Agricultural and Environmental Ethics* 17(2004):131-156, citation on p. 134, p. 156.

Alexander Gillespie (School of Law, Waikato University, Hamilton, New Zealand; Legal Representative, International Whaling Commission) cites "Environmental Ethics in Antarctica." In "Legitimizing a Whale Ethic," *Environmental Ethics* 25(no. 4, 2003):395-410, citation on p. 403.

Jim Chen (Law, University of Minnesota Law School) cites "Property Rights and Endangered Species." In "Webs of Life: Biodiversity Conservation as a Species of Information Policy," *Iowa Law Review* 89(no. 2, 2004):495-609, citation on p. 558.

M. Nils Peterson (Fisheries and Wildlife, Michigan State University), Roel R. Lopez (Wildlife and Fisheries Sciences, Texas A&M University), Philip A. Frank (Florida Keys Project Leader, U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service), Markus J. Peterson (Wildlife and Fisheries Sciences, Texas A&M), and Nova J. Silvy (Wildlife and Fisheries Sciences, Texas A&M) cite "Values in Nature." In "Evaluating Capture Methods for Urban White-Tailed Deer," *Wildlife Society Bulletin* 31 (no. 4, 2003):1176-1187, citation on p. 1177, p. 1187.

Craig L. Shafer (George Wright Society, Hancock, MI) cites "Valuing Wildlands" on the issue of science and the quantification of values in nature. In "A Geography of Hope: Pursuing the Voluntary Preservation of America's National Heritage," *Landscape and Urban Planning* 66(no. 3, 2004):127-171, citation on p. 132, p. 171.

Patrick Söderholm and Thomas Sundqvist (Economics, Luleå University, Luleå, Sweden) cite "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?," setting aside the possibility of using "strong intrinsic values" in economic theory. In "Pricing Environmental Externalities in the Power Sector: Ethical Limits and Implications for Social Choice," *Ecological Economics* 46(no. 3, 2003):333-350, citation on p. 335, p. 349.

I. H. Burnley (Geography, University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia) cites "Rights and Responsibilities on the Home Planet," *Australian Geographer* 34(no. 3, 2003):267-280, citation on p. 280.

Troy D. Glover (Recreation and Leisure Sciences, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Ontario) cites "Creation and Recreation: Environmental Benefits and Human Leisure," "Regulating the Rave Scene: Exploring the Policy Alternatives of Government," *Leisure Sciences* 25(no. 4, 2003):307-325, citation on p. 307, p. 325.

Michael A. Tarrant (School of Forest Resources, University of Georgia), H. Ken Cordell, and Gary T. Green (both USDA Forest Service, Southern Research Station, Athens, GA) cite Rolston and Coufal, "A Forest Ethic and Multivalue Forest Management" as keying "a trigger for the paradigm shift changes in public values of forests and management." Rolston and Coufal help to "understand how these values can be optimized and implications for changing forest practices in the 21st century." In "PVF: A Scale to Measure Public Values of Forests," *Journal of Forestry* 101(no. 6, September, 2003):24-30, citations on p. 25, pp. 28-29, p. 30.

Sung Jin Kim (Philosophy, Hallym University, Chuncheon, Gangwan-do, Korea) cites "Is there an Ecological Ethic? In "The Philosophy Department of Colorado State University and Professor Holmes Rolston III." Pages 129-148 in *Hwan Kyong Ch'ol Hak (Environmental Philosophy)* (Official Journal of the Korean Society for the Study of Environmental Philosophy), vol. 3, 2004, citation on p. 134.

Michael Ruse (Philosophy, Florida State University) cites "Environmental Ethics" in the Bunnin/Tsui-James *Blackwell Companion to Philosophy* as a good overview article. In "Stewardship for the Earth: A Review of Some Recent Books on Biology and Values," *BioScience* 53(no. 9, 2003):876-879, citation p. 879.

Anders Melin (Centre for Theology and Religious Studies, Lund University, Sweden) cites "What Do We Mean by the Intrinsic Value and Integrity of Plants and Animals?" (from Heaf and Wirtz, eds. *Ilgene* volume). In an analysis of Rolston's concept of duties to endangered species. In "Genetic Engineering and the Moral Status of Non-Human Species," *Journal of Agricultural and Environmental Ethics* 17(2004):479-495, citations passim.

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, College of Charleston, SC) cites "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Nature Need to be Science-Based?" and "From Beauty to Duty: Aesthetics of Nature and Environmental Ethics." In "Allen Carlson's Environmental Aesthetics and the Protection of the Environment," *Environmental Ethics* 27(2005):57-76, citations on p. 58, p. 59, p. 74.

W. L. Minckley, Paul C. Marsh, Thomas E. Dowling, Philip W. Hedrick (all in Biology, Arizona State University), James E. Deacon (Environmental Studies, University of Nevada, Las Vegas), William J. Matthews (Zoology, University of Oklahoma), and Gordon Mueller (U.S. Geological Survey, Biological Resources Division, Denver) cite "Fishes in the Desert: Paradox and Responsibility." In "A Conservation Plan for Native Fishes of the Lower Colorado River," *BioScience* 53 (no. 3, 2003):219-234, citation on p. 223.

Deborah Oughton (Chemistry and Biotechnology, Agricultural University of Norway, Aas)

cites "Challenges in Environmental Ethics." In Protection of the Environment from Ionising Radiation: Ethical Issues," *Journal of Environmental Radioactivity* 66(2003):3-18, citation on p. 6, p. 9, p. 13, p. 18.

Ralph R. Acampora (Philosophy and Religion, Hofstra University, Hempstead, NY) cites "Nature for Real." In "The Joyful Wisdom of Ecology -- On Perspectival and Relational Contact with Nature and Animality," comparing Rolston with Nietzsche on the dialectic between humans and nature. *New Nietzsche Studies* vol. 5, nos. 3/4 and vol 6, nos. 1/2, Winter 2003, Spring 2004):22-33, citations passim.

Richard J. Evanoff (International Politics and Economics, Aoyama Gakuin University, Tokyo) cites "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" and "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" In "Reconciling Realism and Constructivism in Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Values* 14(2005):61-81, citations on p. 65, p. 66.

Ben A. Minteer (Human Dimensions of Biology, School of Life Sciences, Arizona State University) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?," and "Saving Nature, Feeding People, and the Foundations of Ethics." "In the early and mid-1970's, first-generation ethicists such as Richard Routley and Holmes Rolston set forth what would become highly influential arguments suggesting that a radically new environmental ethic ... was required" (pp. 39-40) -- a position Minteer hopes now to moderate pragmatically. "Holmes Rolston [is] perhaps the most prominent environmental philosopher writing today" (p. 54). In "Environmental Philosophy and the Public Interest: A Pragmatic Reconciliation," *Environmental Values* 14(2005):37-60.

Derek D. Turner (Philosophy, Connecticut College, New London, CT) cites "Duties to Endangered Species." In "Are We at War with Nature?" *Environmental Values* 14(2005):21-36, citation on p. 24, p. 35.

Mark A. Michael (Philosophy, Austin Peay State University, Clarksville, TN) cites "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?," "Treating Animals Naturally," "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," "Ethical Responsibilities toward Wildlife," and "A Managed Earth and the End of Nature," on Rolston's analysis of the concept of the natural and duties to protect nature. In "Is It Natural to Drive Species to Extinction?" *Ethics and the Environment* 10(2005):49-66, citations passim.

Joseph R. DesJardins (Philosophy, College of St. Benedict, St. John's University, St. Joseph, MN) cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" for its defense of the concept of wilderness. In *Environmental Ethics: An Invitation to Environmental Philosophy*, 4th ed. (Belmont, CA: Thomson, Wadsworth, 2006), citation on p. 161f, p. 173.

J. Claude Evans (Philosophy, Philosophy, Environmental Studies, Washington University, St. Louis) cites "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World," "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," and "Feeding People Versus Saving Nature?" In *With Respect for Nature: Living as Part of the Natural World* (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2005), citations on pp. xv, xix, 3, 129, 139-141, 144-146, 160-161, 179-180, 239, 250, 251.

J. Robert Loftis (Philosophy, St. Lawrence University) says of "Aesthetic Experience in Forests": "It is always nice to read essays on aesthetics that are themselves aesthetically pleasing. Rolston's 'The Aesthetic Experience of Forests' operates simultaneously as an ode to forests and as an argument for the cognitive model of appreciation. It is a powerful piece of writing." Review of Allen Carlson and Arnold Berleant, eds., *The Aesthetics of Natural Environments* (Peterborough, Ontario: Broadview Press, 2004), *Environmental Ethics* 27(2005):429-432, citation on p. 431.

David Strong (Philosophy, Rocky Mountain College, Billings, Montana) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" and the Light and Rolston anthology, *Environmental Ethics*. In "Environmental Ethics," in Carl Mitcham, ed., *Encyclopedia of Science, Technology, and Ethics* (Farmington, MA: Macmillan Reference, USA, Thomson/Gale, 2005), vol. 2, pp. 653-661, citations on p. 655, pp. 657-658, p. 660.

Thomas Leddy (Philosophy, San José State University, California) cites "Aesthetic Experience in Forests," largely objecting to Rolston' defense of a science-based aesthetic experience in forests. In "A Defense of Arts-Based Appreciation of Nature," *Environmental Ethics* 27(2005):299-315, citation on pp. 299-300, p. 303, p. 305, p. 306, p. 309.

Patrick Curry (Philosophy, Bath Spa University, Bath, UK) cites "Challenges in Environmental Ethics" and "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?." In *Ecological Ethics: An Introduction* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2006), citation on p. 62, p. 144, p. 164.

Bryan G. Norton (Philosophy, Public Policy, Georgia Institute of Technology) cites "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?." In *Searching for Sustainability: Interdisciplinary Essays in the Philosophy of Conservation Biology* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), citations on p. 101, p. 103.

Hanna Siurua (Lancaster University, UK) cites "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?", "Feeding People versus Saving Nature," "Saving Nature, Feeding People, and the Foundations of Ethics," "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," and "Enforcing Environmental Ethics." In "Nature above People: Rolston and 'Fortress' Conservation in the South," *Ethics and the Environment* 11(no. 1, 2006):71-96, citations passim.

Patrick R. Frierson (Philosophy, Whitman College, Walla Walla, WA) says of "Environmental Virtue Ethics: Half the Truth but Dangerous as a Whole," that Rolston raises a "more serious" objection to environmental virtue ethics and, in the anthology on environmental virtue ethics in which this essay is contained, that "one of the chief weaknesses of this book is the failure to take this problem sufficiently seriously. This is a particularly important weakness. ... Rolston seems right that EVE [environmental virtue ethics] is a secondary approach derivative on other (e.g. intrinsic value) approaches. This would not undermine its value entirely but it would make it 'dangerous as a whole.' ... Rolston's objection is a bigger problem for many of the authors in this collection" because they are insensitive to this issue. Review of Ronald Sandler and Philip Cafaro, eds., *Environmental Virtue Ethics* (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 2005) in *Environmental Values* 15(2006):258-260.

Roger S. Gottlieb cites "God and Endangered Species" for its combining scientific and religious insights toward conservation of biodiversity. In *A Greener Faith: Religious Environmentalism and Our Planet's Future*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2006. Citations on pp. 39-40, p. 252.

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, Charleston College, South Carolina) cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed" on the question of wilderness and pristine nature. In "Respecting Nature's Autonomy in Relationship with Humanity." Pages 86-98 in Thomas Heyd, ed., *Recognizing the Autonomy of Nature: Theory and Practice* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005), citations on pp. 88-89, p. 98.

Michael A. Tarrant (School of Forest Resources, University of Georgia, Athens), H. Ken Cordell (U.S. Forest Service, Southern Research Station, Athens, GA) cite "A Forest Ethic and Multivalue Forest Management," for its expanded account of values in forests, beyond the traditional categories of multiple use, and contributing to a "paradigm shift" in valuing forests. In "Amenity Values of Public and Private Forests: Examining the Value-Attitude

Relationship," *Environmental Management* 30(no. 5, 2002):692-703. citation on p. 692, p. 693, p. 703.

Michael Hughes (College of Business, University of Notre Dame, Freemantle, Australia) and Angus Morrison-Saunders (Division of Science and Engineering, Murdoch University, Murdoch, Western Australia) cite "Aesthetic Experience in Forests." They find in a survey of the "Top Tree Walk," a developed Forest attraction in giant trees in Western Australia, that Rolston's account of aesthetic values in forests is supported. In "Visitor Attitudes Toward a Modified Natural Attraction," *Society and Natural Resources* 16(2003):191-303. citations on p. 192, p. 199, p. 200, p. 201, p. 203.

Ralph Acampora (Philosophy, Hofstra University, Hempstead, NY) cites "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" In discussing various contemporary images of animals, Acampora advocates a "soft realism," citing Rolston: "What is helpful about Rolston's approach is his willingness to forego the polemical pendulum swing between foundationalism and relativism." This helps "to enable a negotiation or navigation of what phenomenologists call the lifeworld--a range of everyday experiences shared with other forms of life (in both the cultural and biotic senses of the term)." In "Representation Cubed: Reviewing Reflections on Animal Imagery," *Society & Animals* 9(no. 3, 2001):299-307, citation on p. 303, p. 307.

Daniel A. Dombrowski (Philosophy, Seattle University, WA) cites "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" "It is the purpose of this short article to defend the realism of Holmes Rolston and other environmental philosophers against the social constructionism of Neil Evernden and others." "We are the measurers, but not the measure of bears, to use Rolston's terms." In "Bears, Zoos, and Wilderness: The Poverty of Social Constructionism," *Society and Animals* 10(no. 2, 2002):195-202, citations passim.

Andrew Light (Applied Philosophy Group, New York University) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" In "Contemporary Environmental Ethics: From Metaethics to Public Philosophy," *Metaphilosophy* 33(no. 3, 2002):426-449, citations on p. 428, p. 432, p. 449. "Holists, such as ... Holmes Rolston, III have prevailed in staking a claim for environmental ethics in some forms of holism, most forcefully by recourse to the argument that many forms of individualism encounter problems in their plausible extension to species and ecosystems" (p. 432).

Judith N. Scoville (Philosophy and Religion, Northland College, Ashland, WI) cites "Disvalues in Nature," citing Rolston's discussion of predators and prey and its incorporation into community in environmental ethics. In "Fitting Ethics to the Land: H. Richard Niebuhr's Ethic of Responsibility and Ecotheology," *Journal of Religious Ethics* 30(no. 2, 2002):207-229, citations on p. 226, p. 229.

Gary E. Belovsky (Biology, University of Notre Dame) cites "Biophilia, Selfish Genes, Shared Values" for its account of saving shared genes. In "Judeo-Christian Perceptions of Nature and its Variability." Pages 148-175 in David M. Lodge and Christopher Hamlin, ed., *Religion and the New Ecology: Environmental Responsibility in a World of Flux* (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2006), citations on p. 193, p. 174.

G. G. Brown (Environmental Science, Alaska Pacific University), P. Reed (USDA Forest Service, Chugach National Forest, Anchorage, AK), and C. C. Harris (Resource Recreation and Tourism, University of Idaho, Moscow, ID) cite "A Forest Ethic and Multivalue Forest Management," using a slightly modified version of Rolston's typology of natural values in a survey instrument. In "Testing a Place-Based Theory for Environmental Evaluation: An Alaska Case Study," *Applied Geography* 22(2002):49-76, citations on p. 58, p. 76.

Mikael Stenmark (Theology, University of Uppsala, Sweden) cites "Winning and Losing in Environmental Ethics." In "The Relevance of Environmental Ethical Theories for Policy Making," *Environmental Ethics* 24(2002):135-148, citations on p. 144.

Theresa Satterfield (Decision Research, Eugene, Oregon) cites "Aesthetic Experience in Forests." In "In Search of Value Literacy: Suggestions for the Elicitation of Environmental Values," *Environmental Values* 10(2001):331-359, citation on p. 349.

J. Baird Callicott cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed." In "Choosing Appropriate Temporal and Spatial Scales for Ecological Restoration," *Journal of Biosciences* 27(no. 4, Suppl. 2, 2002):409-420, citation on p. 416.

Paul H. Carr (Air Force Research Laboratory and Physics, University of Massachusetts, Lowell) cites "*The Pasqueflower*". In *Beauty in Science and Spirit* (Center Ossipee, New Hampshire, 2006), citation on p. 76, p. 158.

Jame Schaeffer (Systematic Theology and Ethics, Marquette University) cites "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value" for its account of intrinsic value in nature. In "Valuing Earth Intrinsically and Instrumentally: A Theological Framework for Environmental Ethics," *Theological Studies* 66(2005):783-814, citation on p. 784.

Petra Andersson (Philosophy, Göteborg University, Sweden) cites Rolston in Light and Rolston, *Environmental Ethics: An Anthology*. In *Humanity and Nature: Towards a Consistent Holistic Environmental Ethics* (Göteborg, Sweden: Acta Philosophica Gothoburgensia, no 20, 2007. Göteborg. ISSN: 0283-2380 ISBN: 978-91-7346-578-6), citation on p. 4, p. 170.

Petra Andersson cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," "Value in Nature and the Nature of Value," "Duties to Endangered Species," "A Managed Earth and the End of Nature," "Natural and Unnatural: Wild and Cultural," and "What Do We Mean by the Intrinsic Value and Integrity of Plants and Animals?" In *Humanity and Nature: Towards a Consistent Holistic Environmental Ethics* (Göteborg, Sweden: Acta Philosophica Gothoburgensia, no 20, 2007. ISSN: 0283-2380 ISBN: 978-91-7346-578-6), citations on p. 3, 6, 9, 10, 14, 18, 25, 50, 51, 52, 53, 54, 59, 60, 61, 63, 64, 67, 68, 69, 71, 77, 78, 82, 84, 94, 99, 105, 138, 142.

Glenn Parsons (Philosophy, Ryerson University, Toronto, ON) cites "Beauty and the Beast: Aesthetic Experience of Wildlife" as the only philosophical work focusing specifically on this issue. In "The Aesthetic Value of Animals," *Environmental Ethics* 29(2007):151-169, citation on p. 157.

Simon Hailwood (Philosophy, University of Liverpool, UK) cites "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" In "Landscape, Nature, and Neopragmatism," *Environmental Ethics* 29(2007):131-149, citation on p. 131.

Harry B. Wilson (Philosophy student, Harvard University) cites "Challenges in Environmental Ethics," from Cooper and Cooper, *The Environment in Question*, for its account of duties to endangered species as that most suitable for the Endangered Species Act. In "Finding an Ethical Basis for Section 7 of the Endangered Species Act," *Journal of Undergraduate Sciences* 3(Summer 1996):85-87.

James P. Sterba (Philosophy, University of Notre Dame) cites "Enforcing Environmental Ethics," in the case of poor Nepalese versus tiger and other endangered species protected in Nepal. In "Justice," pp. 148-164 in Andrew Dobson and Robyn Eckersley, eds., *Political Theory and Ecological Challenge* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006), citations

on p. 153, p. 163.

Bruce Barcott quotes Holmes Rolston on endangered species, in an article on an ornithologist who was taken to court for animal cruelty when he shot a feral cat that was about to kill a piping plover, an endangered species at Galveston Bay, Texas. In "Kill the Cat that Kills the Bird?" *New York Times Magazine*, December 2, 2007, pp. 46-51.

Ellen R. Klein (Philosophy, Flagler College, Florida) comments on Holmes Rolston's arguments for intrinsic value in nature, and the moral wrongness of destruction of Earth. In "Space Exploration: Humanity's Single Most Important Moral Imperative," *Philosophy Now*, May/June 2007, pp. 8-10, citation on p. 9.

Marti Kheel (Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley, CA) has a chapter, "The Ecophilosophy of Holmes Rolston III" in *Nature Ethics: An Ecofeminist Perspective* (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 2008), pp. 137-162, including citations of "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" "Respect for Life: Christians, Creation, and Environmental Ethics," "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" "Engineers, Butterflies, Worldviews," "The River of Life: Past, Present, and Future," "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" "Philosophical Aspects of the Environment," "In Defense of Ecosystems," "Does Nature Need to be Redeemed," "Treating Animals Naturally," and others. citations passim.

Thomas Heyd (Philosophy, University of Victoria, Canada) cites "Duties to Endangered Species," "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Landscapes Need to be Science-based," "The Aesthetic Experience of Forests," and "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed." In *Encountering Nature: Toward an Environmental Culture*. Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing Co., 2007), citations on p. 42, p. 83, p. 189.

Rolston is cited repeatedly by the various contributors in Allen Carlson and Sheila Lintott, eds., *Nature, Aesthetics, and Environmentalism: From Beauty to Duty* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2008). The editors take the subtitle of their anthology from Rolston's article, reprinted herein: "From Beauty to Duty: Aesthetics of Nature and Environmental Ethics." Citations on p. 2, 13, 20, 162, 207, 213, 224, 232, 237, 239, 241, 242, 250, 253, 295, 319, 325-337, 456.

Workineh Kelbessa (Philosophy, University of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia) cites "Can the East Help the West to Value Nature?," "Respect for Life: Can Zen Buddhism Help in Forming an Environmental Ethic?," "Ethics and the Environment: Types of Environmental Ethics," and "Ethics on the Home Planet." In "The Rehabilitation of Indigenous Environmental Ethics in Africa," *Diogenes* 207(2005):17-34.

Philip Cafaro (Philosophy, Colorado State University) cites "Environmental Virtue Ethics: Half the Truth but Dangerous as a Whole." In review of Ronald L. Sandler, *Character and Environment: A Virtue-Oriented Approach in Environmental Ethics* (New York: Columbia University Press), in *Journal of Agricultural and Environmental Ethics* 21(2008):389-393, citation on p. 391.

Tina Tin (Antarctic and Southern Ocean Coalition), Alan D. Hemmings (Gateway Antarctica Centre for Antarctic Studies and Research, University of Canterbury, New Zealand), and Ricardo Roura (Arctic Center, University of Groningen, The Netherlands) cite "Environmental Ethics in Antarctica." In "Pressures on the Wilderness Values of the Antarctic Continent," *International Journal of Wilderness* 14(no. 3, December 2008):7-12, citation on p. 8, p. 12.

Allen Carlson (Philosophy, University of Alberta) and Sheila Lintott (Philosophy, Bucknell

University) cite Rolston's "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Nature Need to be Science-Based? They also cite "Aesthetic Experience in Forests," for its account of the need for participation in aesthetic experience of nature. They also cite "Aesthetics in the Swamps." In "Nature and Positive Aesthetics," Allen Carlson and Sheila Lintott, eds., *Nature, Aesthetics, and Environmentalism: From Beauty to Duty* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2008), pp. 205-210, citations on p. 207, p. 210, p. 13, pp. 20-21.

Mohammed Reza Balali (Soil and Water Research Institute, Tehran, Iran) and Josef Keulartz (Applied Philosophy Group, Wageningen, The Netherlands) cite Rolston on religion and a land ethic, from "Caring for Nature: What Science and Economics Can't Teach Us But Religion Can." In "Reflexive Water Management in Arid Regions: The Case of Iran," *Environmental Values* 18(2009):91-112, citation on p. 107, p. 111.

Robert Barry Leal (Macquarrie University, Australia) cites and quotes "Wildlife and Wildlands: A Christian Perspective." In *Wilderness in the Bible: Toward a Theology of Wilderness*. New York: Peter Lang, 2004. Citations on p. 200, 203, 204, 210.

Rolston's work is cited about two dozen times in J. Baird Callicott and Robert Frodeman, eds., *Encyclopedia of Environmental Ethics and Philosophy* (Detroit: Macmillan Reference, Gale: Cengage Learning, 2009). Cited topics include Rolston's African butterfly argument on endangered species, an animal-integrity approach to farm animals, on conservation of caves, his criticism of environmental virtue ethics, his appraisal of Taoist (Daoist) contributions to environmental ethics, on ecotheology, on environmental history, on human duties to species and ecosystems, on hunger, his role in the International Society for Environmental Ethics, on the intersection of aesthetics and ethics, on intrinsic value, on the moral standing of ecosystems, natural aesthetics, nonanthropocentrism, his opposition to Descartes' position on nature, on values in nature, and his visits to China and Portugal. See the index and passim.

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, College of Charleston) cites "From Beauty to Duty: Aesthetics of Nature and Environmental Ethics," and "Disvalues in Nature." In "Animal Beauty, Ethics, and Environmental Preservation," *Environmental Ethics* 32(2010):115-134, citations on p. 120, p. 125, p. 132. He also cites Allen Carlson, "We See Beauty Where We Could Not See It Before: Rolston's Aesthetics of Nature," in Christopher Preston and Wayne Ouderkirk, eds., *Nature, Value, Duty: Life on Earth with Holmes Rolston, III* (Dordrecht: Springer, 2007), citation on pp. 126-127, p. 131.

Emily Brady (Geography, University of Edinburgh) cites "Disvalues in Nature," for its account of beauty in the motions of predators chasing prey. In *The Sublime in Modern Philosophy: Aesthetics, Ethics, and Nature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), on p. 172f, p. 217. She also cites "The Aesthetic Experience of Forests," on p. 189, p. 217.

John Basl (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Madison) cites "Restoration" (an extract from Rolston, *Environmental Ethics*) in William Throop, ed., *Environmental Restoration* (Amherst, NY: Humanity Books, 2000). In "Restitutive Restoration: New Motivations for Ecological Restoration," *Environmental Ethics* 32(2010):135-147, citation on p. 137.

Ian A. Smith (Philosophy, Metropolitan State College of Denver) cites Rolston's "Why Species Matter" from Donald VanDeVeer and Christine Pierce, eds., *The Environmental Ethics and Policy Book*, 3rd ed. (Belmont, CA: Thomson/Wadsworth, 2003). In "The Role of Humility and Intrinsic Goods in Preserving Endangered Species: Why Save the Humpback Chub?," *Environmental Ethics* 32(2010):165-182, citation on p. 181.

"Ronald L. Sandler (Philosophy, Northeastern University) cites "Environmental Virtue

Ethics: Half the Truth but Dangerous as a Whole,” and Rolston’s value-oriented approach to environmental ethics, Sandler himself favoring a virtue-oriented approach. In *Character and Environment: A Virtue-Oriented Approach to Environmental Ethics* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2007). He also cites “Saving Nature, Feeding People, and the Foundations of Ethics.” Citations on pp. 112-113, 170, 171.

Julian Delord examines Rolston’s arguments for saving endangered species extensively. In *L’extinction d’espèce: histoire d’un concept & enjeux éthiques* (Paris: Publications Scientifiques du Muséum nationale d’Histoire naturelle, 2010), pages 451,454-455, 473, 475-476, 495, 505, 507, 510-515, 518, 520, 526, 547-553, 556-558, 574, 578, 607. ISBN 978-2-85653-656-8.

John Mizzoni, “Against Rolston’s Defense of Eating Animals: Reckoning with the Nutritional Factor in the Argument for Vegetarianism,” *International Journal of Applied Philosophy*, vol. 16(Spring 2002):125-131). Reprinted in *Taking Sides: Clashing Views on Controversial Moral Issues* 9th edition, (ed.) Stephen Satris (Guilford, CT: McGraw-Hill/Dushkin, 2003), pp. 239-245; 2006, 10th edition, pp. 337-43.

Ouderkirk, Wayne, “On Wilderness and People: The View from Mt. Marcy,” in Michael P. Nelson and J. Baird Callicott, eds., *The Wilderness Debate Rages on: Continuing the Great New Wilderness Debate* (Athens, Ga: University of Georgia Press, 2008), pp. 435-460. Ouderkirk analyses Rolston’s ideas of wilderness, especially on pp. 442ff, finding Rolston insightful but too dualistic in his distinction between nature and culture.

J. Baird Callicott, “Contemporary Criticisms of the Wilderness Idea,” in Michael P. Nelson and J. Baird Callicott, eds., *The Wilderness Debate Rages on: Continuing the Great New Wilderness Debate* (Athens, Ga: University of Georgia Press, 2008), pp. 355-377. Callicott criticizes Rolston’s account of wilderness, pp. 356f, p 368, p. 376.

David W. Orr, “The Not-So-Great Wilderness Debate,” in Michael P. Nelson and J. Baird Callicott, eds., *The Wilderness Debate Rages on: Continuing the Great New Wilderness Debate* (Athens, Ga: University of Georgia Press, 2008), pp. 423--433. He cites Rolston’s defense of wilderness, pp. 426f, p 434.

David Macauley (Philosophy and Environmental Studies, Penn State, Brandywine) cites and quotes from “Aesthetic Experience in Forests.” In *Elemental Philosophy: Earth, Air, Fire, and Water as Environmental Ideas* (Albany, NY: State University Press of New York, 2011). Citations on p.93, pp. 339-340, p. 375, p. 475. He also cites and quotes from “Environmental Ethics in Antarctica,” pp. 336-337, p. 415.

Michael Bowman and Catherine Redgwell cite “Biology without Conservation: An Environmental Misfit and Contradiction in Terms.” In Michael Bowman and Catherine Redgwell, eds., *International Law and the Conservation of Biological Diversity* (London: Kluwer Law International, 1996). Citation on p. 28.

Berry Crawford (Western Washington University, Bellingham, WA) has a section on “Holmes Rolston on Ecosystems,” in *Ethics for Environmental Policy: An Integrated, Life-Centered Approach* (San Diego, CA: Cognella Academic Publishing, 2013), pp. 87-97, also a section “Holmes Rolston: Revelation of Value in Life’s Storied Evolutions,” pp. 85-90. He cites Rolston 32 times, including “Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?,” “The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed,” “Care on Earth: Generating informed Concern,” “The Human Standing in Nature: Storied Fitness in the Moral Overseer,” “Naturalizing Values: Organisms and Species,” “Value in Nature and the Nature of Value,” “Duties to Endangered Species,” “Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World,” “Challenges in Environmental Ethics.”

Larry L. Rasmussen (Ethics, Union Theological Seminary, New York) cites "Saving Creation: Faith Shaping Environmental Policy," in *Earth-Honoring Faith: Religious Ethics in a New Key* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), on pp. 111, 385, 435.

Carlo Enrico Lombardo, *Values and Information in Rolston's Environmental Ethics*, M.A. thesis, Katholieke Universiteit, Leuven, Belgium, 2013. Advisor: Ullrich Melle. Online at: http://www.academia.edu/3046059/Values_and_Information_in_Rolstons_Environmental_Ethics

Respecting values for Rolston is respecting the information an organism holds in its deepest and most proper identity. Rolston distinguishes precisely between moral patients and moral agents, and he extends this from individual organisms, using it also to interpret the values belonging to species and ecosystems. Ecosystems are the contexts where organismic information is generated by the pressures of natural selection. Both organisms and species are the loci where such information is conserved, thereby conserving their intrinsic value. Human beings, as moral agents, ought to respect such biological value. He cites Rolston's "What is a Gene?" repeatedly, also his "Challenges in Environmental Ethics," *Genes, Genesis and God*, and *A New Environmental Ethics*.

Vanessa Lux (Center for Literary and Cultural Research, Freie Universität, Berlin) cites "What Is a Gene?". In *Genetik und psychologische Praxis* (Berlin: Springer, 2012). ISBN 978-3-531-19333-5. DOI 10.1007/978-3-531-19334-2. Cited on p. 14, and in Chapter 2, Die Gene und das Psychische.

Daniel P. Sulmasy (St. Vincent's Hospital and New York Medical College) cites "What Is a Gene?" In "The Logos of the Genome: Genomes as Parts of Organisms," *Theoretical Medicine and Bioethics* 27(2006):535-540, suggesting that the question "What is a genome?" is as important as the question "What is a gene?"

Lenny Moss (Department of Sociology and Philosophy, University of Exeter) replies to "What Is a Gene?." In "The Question of Questions: What Is a Gene? Comments on Rolston and Griffiths and Stotz," in *Theoretical Medicine and Bioethics* 27(2006):523-534.

Christoph Rehmann-Sutter (Institute für Geschichte und Ethik der Medizin der Universität Basel, Switzerland) cites "What Is a Gene?" In "Genetics, a Practical Anthropology," in M. Düwell et al, eds., *The Contingent Nature of Life* (Berlin: Springer Science, 2008), p. 39, p. 20.

Alasdair Cochrane (Political Theory, University of Sheffield, UK) cites and quotes, "Duties to Endangered Species," criticizing Rolston's thinking of extinction as a kind of "superkilling" and attributing value at the species level. He also cites "Challenges in Environmental Ethics." In *Animal Rights Without Liberation: Applied Ethics and Human Obligations* (New York: Columbia University Press. Citations on pp. 167-168, p. 171, p. 225, p. 237.

Mark A. Bedau (Philosophy, Reed College) and Ben T. Larsen cite "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" In "Lessons from Environmental Ethics about the Intrinsic Value of Synthetic Life," in Gregory E. Kaebnick and Thomas H. Murray, eds., *Synthetic Biology and Morality: Artificial Life and the Bounds of Nature* (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 2013), pp. 69-87. citations on p. 70, p. 72, p. 80, p. 87.

Christopher J. Preston cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" for its discussion of intrinsic value as this bears on synthetic organisms. In "Synthetic Bacteria, Natural Processes, and Intrinsic Values," in Gregory E. Kaebnick and Thomas H. Murray, eds., *Synthetic Biology and Morality: Artificial Life and the Bounds of Nature* (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 2013), pp. 107-129, citations passim.

Alicia Caldwell, *Denver Post* Editorial Writer, quotes Rolston in an editorial, "The Wrong Way to Deal with Denver's Feral Cat Population," *Denver Post*, Tuesday, June 17, 2014, page 15A.

Christian U. Becker (Philosophy, Pennsylvania State University) cites "Feeding People versus Saving Nature," in *Sustainability Ethics and Sustainability Research* (Dordrecht: Springer, 2012) pp. 25, p. 31.

Paul Wapner (Environmental Politics, American University, Washington) cites "The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed." In *Living Through the End of Nature: The Future of American Environmentalism* (Cambridge, MS: The MIT Press, 2010), citation on p. 222 (cf. p. 17), p. 245.

Ronald L. Sandler (Philosophy, Northeastern University, Boston) cites "Duties to Endangered Species" and "Are Values in Nature Subjective or Objective?" and "Biodiversity" [Jamieson, *Companion*] In Ronald L. Sandler, "Solar Radiation Management and Nonhuman Species," in Christopher J. Preston, ed., *Engineering the Climate: The Ethics of Solar Radiation Management* (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, Rowman and Littlefield, 2012), pp. 95-109, citations on p. 99f, p. 249 .

William R. Stoeger (Astronomer, Vatican Observatory) cites Rolston and *Biology, Ethics, and the Origins of Life*. In "Astrobiology and Beyond: From Science to Philosophy and Ethics," in Chris Impey, Anna H. Spitz, and William Stoeger, eds., *Encountering Life in the Universe: Ethical Foundations and Social Implications of Astrobiology* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2013), pp. 56-79, citation on p. 60f., p. 78.

Woodruff T. Sullivan III (Department of Astronomy and Astrobiological Program, University of Washington) cites Rolston "attractive scheme" for analysis of extraterrestrial value and *Biology, Ethics, and the Origins of Life*. In "Planocentric Ethics: Principles for Exploring a Solar System That May Contain Extraterrestrial Microbial Life." In Chris Impey, Anna H. Spitz, and William Stoeger, eds., *Encountering Life in the Universe: Ethical Foundations and Social Implications of Astrobiology* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2013), pp. 167-177, citation on p. 171f, p. 177.

Joshua M. Moritz cites "Disvalues in Nature." In "Animal Suffering, Evolution, and the Origins of Evil: Toward a 'Free Creatures' Defense," *Zygon: Journal of Religion and Science* 49(no. 2):348-380, citations on p. 355, 367.

Dave Foreman cites Rolston, "Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed," in a criticism of Baird Callicott's arguments about rethinking wilderness. Rolston "has effectively whacked him about the head and shoulders." (p. 395). "Rolston does a fine job of sorting out themuddle." (p. 402). In "Wilderness Areas for Real," in J. Baird Callicott and Michael P. Nelson, *The Great New Wilderness Debate* (Athens, GA: University of Georgia Press, 1998).

Sean C. Lema (Biological Sciences, Center for Coastal Marine Sciences, California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo) cites "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" In "The Ethical Implications of Organism-Environment Interdependency," *Environmental Ethics* 36(2014):151-169, citation on p. 151.

Mark Dowie (a journalist) cites and quotes "Feeding People vs. Saving Nature," as evidence of philosophers who put nature above people. In *Conservation Refugees: The Hundred-Year Conflict between Global Conservation and Native Peoples* (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 2009), citations and quotations on pp. 86-89, p. 235, p. 302.

Rolston is cited from *Environmental Ethics* (1988), "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Nature Need to be Science Based?," "Aesthetic Experience in Forests," (1998). "Aesthetics in the Swamps," (2000), "From Beauty to Duty: Aesthetics of Nature and Environmental Ethics," (2002). In Allen Carlson, "Environmental Aesthetics", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Spring 2015 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <<http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2015/entries/environmental-aesthetics/>>.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University of Wales, Cardiff) cites "Feeding People versus Saving Nature," "Duties to Ecosystems," and "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" In *The Ethics of the Global Environment*, 2nd edition (Edinburgh: University of Edinburgh Press, 2015), p. 260.

Zinzhong Yao (Philosophy, Rinmin University, Beijing) cites "Environmental Ethics: Values in and Duties to the Natural World" and "Ethics and the Environment (Types of Environmental Ethics)." In "An Eco-Ethical Interpretation of Confucian Tianren Heyl," *Frontiers of Philosophy in China* 9(2014):570-585, on p. 585.

James W. Nickel (Philosophy, University of Colorado, Boulder) cites "Rights and Responsibilities on the Home Planet." In "The Human Right to a Safe Environment: Philosophical Perspectives on Its Scope and Justification," *Yale Journal of International Law* 18(1993):281- 295, citation on p. 282. He also cites *Philosophy Gone Wild*.

L. Clifton Edwards (Religious Studies, Hawai'i Pacific University) cites "Celestial Aesthetics" repeatedly. In *Creation's Beauty as Revelation: Toward a Creational Theology of Natural Beauty* (Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock, Pickwick Publications, 2014). Citations on p. 143, p. 149f, p. 191. He also cites "Does Aesthetic Appreciation of Landscapes Need to be Science-Based?" p. 150, "Aesthetics in the Swamps," p. 150, p. 166, p. 191, "The Pasqueflower," p. 167, p. 172, p. 191, and "Environmental Science and Religion/Science," p. 191.

Michael Bonnett (Education, Cambridge University, UK) cites "Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?" In "Sustainability, the Metaphysics of Mastery and Transcendent Nature," in Helen Kopnina and Eleanor Shoreman-Ouimet, eds., *Sustainability: Key Issues* (New York: Routledge, Earthscan, 2015), pp. 25-39, citation on p. 32, p. 39.

Jason Kawall (Philosophy, Religious Studies, Colgate University) gives a short section to Holmes Rolston's founding influence in the field of environmental ethics. In "A History of Environmental Ethics," (Chapter 2, pp. 14-26, in Stephen M. Gardiner and Allen Thompson, eds., *The Oxford Handbook of Environmental Ethics*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2017).

"Holmes Rolston III published his 'Is There an Ecological Ethic?' in the journal *Ethics* in 1975; in it he sketches proposals, including the attribution of intrinsic value to species, that he would later develop in great depth. Rolston's paper is perhaps most significant as it appeared in one of the most widely read and respected journals in the analytic philosophical tradition. This was something of a coup, and would serve to introduce the wider philosophical community to the emerging field and its questions" (p. 14). See also his Section 3.3 "Holmes Rolston." "Holmes Rolston developed a rich, thorough-going environmental ethic ..." (p. 18).

Allen Thompson (Philosophy, Oregon State University) in "Chapter 7: Anthropocentrism: Peril and Promise," says "Rolston's view exemplifies perhaps the pinnacle of an ethical nonanthropocentrism..." (P. 81, also p 82, p. 87, p. 89) Pages 77-90 In Stephen M. Gardiner and Allen Thompson, eds., *The Oxford Handbook of Environmental Ethics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2017).

Robert Garner (Politics, University of Leicester, UK) cites “Is There an Ecological Ethic?” in Helen Kopnina and Eleanor Shoreman-Ouimet, eds., *Sustainability: Key Issues* (New York: Routledge, Earthscan, 2015), pp. 331-346, citation on p. 336, p. 346.

Andrew McMurry (School of Literature, Communication, and Culture, Georgia Tech) cites and quotes from the Rolston entry “Ralph Waldo Emerson” in Palmer, ed., *Fifty Key Thinkers on the Environment*. In *Environmental Renaissance: Emerson, Thoreau and the Systems of Nature* (Athens, GA: University of Georgia Press, 2003) on p. 25, p. 260.

Eileen Crist (Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University) cites “Disvalues in Nature.” In “Choosing a Planet of Life,” pages 43-55 in Haydn Washington and Paul Twomey, eds., *A Future Beyond Growth: Towards a Steady State Economy* (New York: Routledge, 2016), on p. 46, p. 51.

Tina Tin (Charles les Eaux, France, Associate Editor, *International Journal of Wilderness*) cites and quotes from Rolston, “Environmental Ethics in Antarctica” and “Environmental Ethics on Antarctic Ice” repeatedly. In “From the Anthropocentric to the Abiotic: Environmental Ethics and Values in the Antarctic Wilderness,” *Environmental Ethics* 39(2017):57-74. Rolston has done “inspiring work” (p. 57).

Larry Rasmussen (Ethics, Union Theological Seminary, New York) cites “Ecology: A Primer for Christian Ethics,” [*Journal of Catholic Social Thought* 4(no. 2, 2007):293-312]. In “Human Environmental Rights and/or Biotic Rights,” pages 36-52 in Carrie Gustafson and Peter Juviler, eds., *Religion and Human Rights: Competing Claims?* (London: M. E. Sharpe, 1990), citations on pp. 40-46, pp. 51-52.

Pat Brereton (Head, School of Communications, Dublin City University, Ireland) cites and quotes from Rolston’s “Winning and Losing in Environmental Ethics” in *Environmental Ethics and Film* (London: Routledge, Earthscan, 2016), p. 136, p. 227.

Alasdair David Charles Cochrane (London School of Economics and Political Science) cites “Duties to Endangered Species” and “Challenges in Environmental Ethics.” Pages 208-209 in *Moral Obligations to Non-Humans*, PhD in Government, UMI Number: U615648, ProQuest LLC, 2014.

Lewis Petrinovich (Psychology, University of California, Riverside) cites, quotes, and discusses “Disvalues in Nature,” pp 374-376, p. 412 in *Darwinian Dominion: Animal Welfare and Human Interests* (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 1999).

Brian Luke (Philosophy, University of Dayton, Ohio, and Trinity Lutheran Seminary, Columbus, Ohio) cites “Disvalues in Nature” repeatedly. He challenges Rolston’s acceptance of the claim that humans evolved as hunters (as well as gatherers), also Rolston’s claim that some kinds of positive animal values, strengths, and skills could only have evolved through predation. Luke fears that such claims feed into justifying men’s exploitation of animals. In *Brutal: Manhood and the Exploitation of Animals* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2007), on pp. 59-66, p. 271.

Ian A. Smith (Philosophy, Washburn University, Topeka, Kansas) cites and quotes from Rolston extensively. In *The Intrinsic Value of Endangered Species* (London: Routledge, 2016). On pages 3, 13, 19, 25, Chapter 3, “Rolston’s Account: Objective Value,” pp. 42-57, p. 66, 76, 79, 90, 92, 96, 105, 109, 121, 126, 336-138, 148, 150.

Dalia Matijević (Zagreb, Croatia) cites Rolston’s “Is There an Ecological Ethic?” in “Ethics of Institutional Nature Protection: Proposal for the Integrated Assessment of the Nature Protection Ethics in Croatia,” *Socijalna Ekologija* (ISSN 1330-0113) 24(2015, nos. 2-

3):145-171, citation on p. 161, p. 171. (Article in English) DOI:10.17234/SocEkol.24.2.4

Damla Dönmez (Humanities and Social Science Department, Istanbul Technical University, Turkey) cites “From Beauty to Duty: Aesthetics of Nature and Environmental Ethics” in “Saving ‘Disinterestedness’ in Environmental Aesthetics: A Defense against Berleant,” *Estetika: The Central European Journal of Aesthetics*, LIII/New Series IX 2016(#2)149-164, citations on pp. 161-162, p. 164. (Article in English)

Edward Huijbens (Social Sciences, Research professor of the Icelandic Tourism Research Centre and at the School of Business and Science at the University of Akureyri [UNAK] and Gísli Pálsson (Anthropology, University of Iceland) cite Rolston, “Aesthetics in the Swamps” in “The Bog in our Brain and Bowels: Social Attitudes to the Cartography of Icelandic Wetlands, in *Environment and Planning D-society & Space*, vol. 27 (2009): 296-316, citations on p. 311, p. 316. “The bog in our brain and bowels, the primitive vigor of Nature in us” is a phrase taken from Thoreau.

Mark Woods (Philosophy, University of San Diego) cites and quotes from “Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?,” “The Wilderness Idea Reaffirmed,” “Feeding People vs. Saving Nature,” and “Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?” In *Rethinking Wilderness* (Peterborough, Ontario, Canada and Tonawanda, NY, Broadview Press, 2017), citations on p. 63, p. 129, p. 140, p. 206-207, p. 290-291.

Michael Northcott (Ethics, University of Edinburgh, Scotland) cites “Ecological Pope.” In “On Going Gently into the Anthropocene” pages 19-34 in Celia Deane-Drummond, Sigurd Bergman and Markkus Vogt, eds., *Religion in the Anthropocene* (Eugene Oregon: Cascade Books, Wipf and Stock, 2017), citation on p. 31.

Marion Hourdequin (Philosophy, Colorado College) cites and quotes from “Environmental Virtue Ethics: Half the Truth, but Dangerous as a Whole.” In *Environmental Ethics: From Theory to Practice* (London, New York, Bloomsbury Academic, 2015), on p. 53. She also cites Rolston’s work on value in ecosystems (p. 72), and Rolston’s work on value in plants and in endangered species (pp. 74-75). She cites “Value in Nature and the Nature of Value,” and “Feeding People vs. Saving Nature.” Bibliography pp. 231-232.

Samantha Vice (Philosophy, University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa) cites and quotes from “Beauty and the Beast: Aesthetic Experience of Wildlife.” In “The Ethics of Animal Beauty,” *Environmental Ethics* 39(2017):75-96, on p. 80, p. 83, p. 85, regarding animation in such experience. “Rolston ... provides a wonderful extended description of encounters with wildlife” (p. 83).

Donato Bergandi (Museum of Natural History, Paris) ed., *The Structural Links between Ecology, Evolution and Ethics: The Virtuous Epistemic Circle*, Dordrecht, Springer: Boston Studies in the Philosophy of Science, 2013), cites Rolston 1985, “Duties to Endangered Species,” *Bioscience* on p. 7, p. 10, p. 27.

Rosely A. L. Imbernon (School of Arts, Sciences and Humanities – University of São Paulo, Brazil) and Clara Vasconcelos (Faculty of Sciences, University of Porto, Portugal) cite “Feeding People versus Saving Nature.” In “Geoethic Ethic Issues Involving Tailings Dam: Values and Conflicts,” pp. 49-57 in *International Journal of Educational Studies* 5(no. 1, 2018), citation on p. 50, p. 51, p. 57.

Karl E. Peters (Philosophy and Religion, Rollins College, Winter Park FL, and editor, *Zygon: Journal of Religion and Science*) cites “Rights and Responsibilities on the Home Planet.” in “Living with the Wicked Problem of Climate Change,” *Zygon: Journal of Religion and Science* 53(2018, no. 2):427-442, citations on p. 428, p. 441.

Haydn Washington (Institute of Environmental Studies, University of New South Wales, Australia) cites and quotes from “Disvalues in Nature.” In *A Sense of Wonder towards Nature: Healing the Planet through Belonging* (London: Routledge, Earthscan, 2019). citation on p. 35, p. 37. He also cites and quotes from “Naturalizing Callicott,” p. 64, p. 72. He also cites and quotes from “Value in Nature and the Nature of Value,” p. 64, p. 72, p. 104, p. 113. p. 118, p. 133. He also cites and quotes from “Natural and Unnatural: Wild and Cultural,” p. 118, p. 133.

In the critical review of Kenneth Worthy, Elizabeth Allison, and Whitney A. Bauman, eds. *After the Death of Nature: Carolyn Merchant and the Future of Human-Nature Relations* (eventually published by Routledge, 2019), the anonymous reviewers say of Rolston’s contribution, “Leading and Misleading Metaphors: From Organism to Anthropocene” (pages 103-116 in print): Reader 1: “The essay by Rolston is particularly engaging, vigorous, and pointed, as well as clear. The reader is animated by his writing as by his thought.” Reader 2: “Holmes Rolston adopts, adapts, and challenges Merchant’s ideas and approaches his discussion of the Anthropocene - an exemplar of the creative adaptation of someone’s longstanding ideas.”

Pasi Heikkurinen (University of Leeds, England and MTT Agrifood Research Finland - Aalto University School of Economics, Organization and Management, Finland) and Tarja Ketola (Turku School of Economics, Turku, Finland) cite Rolston, “Value in Nature and the Nature of Value,” discussing the differences between instrumental and intrinsic values, and how Rolston makes intrinsic values one of the core axioms in environmental ethics. In “Corporate Responsibility and Identity: from a Stakeholder to an Awareness Approach,” *Business Strategy and the Environment* 21(2012):326-337, on p. 327, p. 337.

Robin Attfield (Philosophy, University College, Cardiff, Wales) devotes a section to “Rolston’s contribution” to environmental ethics. In *Environmental Ethics: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, UK, 2018). Rolston is “an American philosopher, now widely regarded as the father of environmental philosophy,” pp. 9-11. Further citations on pp. 24-25, p. 37, p. 50, p. 121.

Hicham-Stéphane Afeissa (Académie de Dijon, France) cites Rolston repeatedly. In *Esthétique de la charogne (For an aesthetic of carrion)* Éditions Dehors, France. In French. ISBN 978-2-3675-1014-9. The major contribution of environmental aesthetics during the second half of the twentieth century was to demonstrate that there is a link between aesthetic experience and scientific knowledge, indebted to the lessons of ecology, to such a point that we can well hold the landscapes swamps for the paradigmatic object of any environmental aesthetic. But can we hope to reevaluate the disgusting spectacle of a decaying body, whatever our notions about the ecology of nutrient recycling? Is carrion not the limit object of all aesthetics? Citation in Preface by Luiz Marques (Université de ‘État de Campinas (São Paulo), p. 17. Citations by Afeissa, p. 50n, pp. 594-598, pp. 600-603 in his conclusion, quoting Rolston at length and citing a half dozen of Rolston’s works.

Christopher D. Ives (School of Geography, University of Nottingham) and Jeremy Kidwell (Department of Theology and Religion, University of Birmingham, UK) cite Rolston “Caring for Nature: What Science and Economics Can’t Teach Us But Religion Can,” (*Environmental Values* 15 (2006):307–313) with regard to religion and environmental conservation. In “Religion and Social Values for Sustainability,” *Sustainability Science* 2019, Springer online at: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11625-019-00657-0>.

Eileen Crist (Science, Technology, and Society, Virginia Tech) cites and quotes from “The Exuberance of Life (*Bioscience* 35(11);718-726) in *Abundant Earth: Toward an Ecological Civilization* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2019), on p. 19, p. 294.

Eileen Crist (Science, Technology, and Society, Virginia Tech) cites and quotes from “After Preservation: Dynamic Nature in the Anthropocene” (in Minter and Pyne) in *Abundant Earth: Toward an Ecological Civilization* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2019), on p. 117, p. 294.

David R. Keller (Philosophy and Humanities, Utah Valley University, Orem, Utah) cites “Is There an Ecological Ethic?”, 1975) in *Ecology and Justice--Citizenship in Biotic Communities* (Cham, Switzerland: Springer Nature Switzerland AG, 2019), on p. ix.

Yelena I. Kosovich-Anderson (Curator of bryophyte collection, University of Wyoming Rocky Mountain Herbarium, Laramie, WY) in “Bryophyte Inventory in Wyoming: 16 Years of Challenging Efforts,” *The Bryological Times*, Vol. 148, pages 6-9, says: “I came to Wyoming for the first time in 1998 by invitation of my colleague from Colorado, Professor of Philosophy and amateur bryologist, Holmes Rolston III. I was completely charmed with the majestic, beautiful and truly challenging for a scientist country of the American Rocky Mountains. (on p. 7)

Nathan Kowalsky (University of Alberta, St. Joseph’s College) assesses the thought of Holmes Rolston repeatedly in “Following Human Nature,” *Environmental Ethics* 28(2006):165-183. “Holmes Rolston, III argues that human cultures should “follow nature” when interacting with nature. Yet he understands culture to necessarily degrade ecosystems, and allows that purely cultural values could legitimate the destruction of nature itself.” Rolston’s reconciliation is too weak.” (p, 165) “Rolston claims that non-instrumental value in nature is independent of valuing subjects (i.e., humans), while many of his critics argue that theories of mind-independence are naïve. But regardless of how we account for this value’s existence, both sides agree that nature has value for its own sake. For the purposes of this essay, I take it for granted that naturalness is a good in itself. This is just as well, for Rolston’s aim is not so much a theory of natural value per se, as it is an ethical response to such value. He argues that duties to the natural world are generated in our encounters with natural value, and the most basic of these is the duty to “follow nature.” Rolston spends the better part of a book developing this” (p. 166) Further citations pp. 167-170, 173, 174, 175, 179, 181, 182, 183.

Katie McShane (Philosophy, Colorado State University) cites “Is There An Ecological Ethic?” In “Environmental Ethics: An Overview,” *Philosophy Compass* 4/3 (2009): 407–420, on p. 407, p. 410, p. 417, as one of the founding papers in environmental ethics. She also cites “Value in Nature and the Nature of Value,” p. 410, p. 418, p. 420. She also cites “Nature for Real: Is Nature a Social Construct?” p. 415, p. 418.

Alex Waller (Khao Yai International School, UK/Thailand; AUSN (Accredited Universities of Sovereign Nations) Visiting Professor of Science Education and Environmental Ethics) cites “Feeding People versus Saving Nature,” in “Preventing the Catastrophian Age: Mechanisms to Negate the Need of Lifeboats.” *Eubios Journal of Asian and International Bioethics* 29 (January 2019): 36 - 41. The issue is the shooting of poachers to save endangered species. Citation on p. 38, p. 40.

Gregory S. McElwain (Religious Studies, College of Idaho) cites “Loving Nature: Christian Environmental Ethics” (in Simmons and Sorrell) in *Mary Midgley: An Introduction* (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2020), on p. 94, p. 95, p. 174, p. 175.

Nir Barak (Dept. of Political Science, Hebrew University of Jerusalem) cites Rolston on geese versus airplanes. “In direct response to Callicott’s ‘Chicago’ argument, Rolston (2001) writes: ‘It is only philosophical confusion to remark that both geese in flight, landing on Yellowstone Lake, and humans in flight, landing at O’Hare in Chicago, are equally natural, and let it go at that ... Geese fly naturally; humans fly in artifacts.’” (quoted from

Rolston, "Natural and unnatural; wild and cultural," *Western North American Naturalist*, 2001). In "Civic Ecologism: Environmental Politics in Cities," *Ethics, Policy & Environment*, Vol. 29, Issue 3, 2020. DOI: 10.1080/21550085.2020.1746005.

Allen Carlson (Philosophy, University of Alberta) cites Rolston as among the founding contributors to environmental aesthetics. In "Ten Steps in the Development of Western Environmental Aesthetics," pp 13-24, in Martin Drenthen and Josef Keulartz, eds., *Environmental Aesthetics: Crossing Divides and Breaking Ground* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2014), citations on p. 17, pp. 18-19..

Henry Dicks (Université Jean Moulin Lyon 3. Lyon, France) and Vincent Blok (Wageningen University, Netherlands) cite Rolston, "Can and Ought We to Follow Nature?" and "Is There an Ecological Ethic?" in "Can Imitating Nature Save the Planet?" *Environmental Values* 28 (no. 5, 2019): 519-526, citation on p. 521, p. 525.

Justin L. Harmon (Community and Therapeutic Recreation, University of North Carolina, Greensboro) and Gerard T. Kyle (Dept of Recreation, Park, and Tourism Sciences, Texas A&M, College Station) cite Rolston, "Natural and Unnatural, Wild and Cultural," *Western North American Naturalist*, 61 (2002, no. 3), 267–276, for its recognition of healing values in hiking. In "Connecting to the Trail: Natural Spaces as Places of Healing," *Leisure Sciences* (2020): <https://doi.org/10.1080/01490400.2020.1712282> Published online 13 January 2020.