

Critical Notice of *Conserving Natural Value*. Columbia University Press, New York, 1994

Holmes Rolston, III

Philip Cafaro (Philosophy, Boston University) says: "This is a strong book, clearly written and carefully thought through. The author's firm grasp of the policy issues involved and of the science involved in the policy issues means he does not waste his reader's time with far-fetched examples or a simplistic application of general principles. He has a knack for focusing on what is most important in a debate, presents the alternatives clearly, and avoids knocking down straw men. ... Rolston's own positions are clearly stated and not overly hedged with qualifications. Such a style is well-suited to advance debate and furthers our understanding of these issues. I recommend this book..." "Holmes Rolston III's *Conserving Natural Value* admirably performs the service for the discipline of environmental ethics [of introducing researchers to key issues in the field]." Review in *Conservation Biology* 9(1995):965-966.

Edwin P. Pister (California Department of Fish and Game and Desert Fishes Council) says: "Of the many books appearing in the past decade relating to biological conservation I would rate *Conserving Natural Value* among the most important." Review in *Journal of Wildlife Management* 61(1997):256.

Thomas R. Stanley, Jr. (National Biological Service, Fort Collins, CO) cites and quotes from *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Ecosystem Management and the Arrogance of Humanism," *Conservation Biology* 9(1995):255-262, citations on p. 258, p. 262.

James E. Coufal and Charles M. Spuches (Environmental Sciences and Forestry, SUNY, Syracuse, NY) cite *Conserving Natural Value* in *Environmental Ethics in Practice: Developing a Personal Ethic* (Syracuse, NY: SUNY College of Environmental Science and Forestry, 1995), Appendix D12.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) analyzes the value theory in *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Intrinsic Value in Nature: A Metaethical Analysis," *EJAP, The Electronic Journal of Analytic Philosophy*, Issue on *Justifying Value in Nature*, Issue 3 (Spring 1995), citations passim.

Viriato Soromenho Marques (Philosophy, University of Lisbon) says that *Conserving Natural Value* is "a work that occupies a unique place on a new horizon of philosophical investigation, just now emerging." Review, *Philosophica* (Lisbon) No. 5(April 1995):130-131.

William Stolzenburg (Editor, *Nature Conservancy*) quotes a passage from *Conserving Natural*

Value on ethics and compromise in nature conservation in "Ten Things You Can Do to Save Life's Diversity," *Nature Conservancy* 46 (no. 4, July/August 1996):16-23, quotation on p. 23.

Bayard L. Catron (Public Policy and Ethics, George Washington University) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its arguments about intrinsic value. In "Does Deep Ecology Need Intrinsic Value?" pages 24-39 in Nina Witoszek, ed., *Rethinking Deep Ecology* (Oslo, Norway: Center for Development and the Environment, 1996), citation on p. 30, pp. 35-36.

Leena Vilkkä (Philosophy, University of Helsinki) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its account of intrinsic value in nature. In "Should We Preserve Intrinsic Values in Wilderness?" Pages 160-175 in Anna-Liisa Sippola, Pirjo Alaraudanjoki, Bruce Forbes and Ville Hallikainen, eds., *Northern Wilderness Areas: Ecology, Sustainability, Values* (Rovaniemi, Finland: University of Lapland, Arctic Centre, 1995. Citation on p. 166. p. 170.

Heiki Reila (Theology, University of Tartu, Estonia) cites *Conserving Natural Value* in *Teoloogiline keskkonnaeetika ja inimkeskne traditsioon. Mõnede uudsete keskkonnaeetika lähete võrdlev analüüs (Environmental Ethics and the Tradition of Anthropocentrism. A Comparative Analysis of Some New Approaches in Contemporary Theological Ethics Confronting Environmental Problems)* (in Estonian) (University of Tartu, Estonia, Master's Thesis, 1996), citations on p. 11, p. 119.

Emyr Vaughan Thomas (Directorate of Policy and Science, Countryside Council for Wales, Ffordd Penrhos, Bangor, Wales) features Rolston's value theory, citing *Conserving Natural Value*." In "Rolston, Naturogenic Value and Genuine Biocentrism," *Environmental Values* 6(1997):355-360, citations passim.

Catherine Larrère (Philosophy, Université Michel de Montaigne, Bordeaux III, France) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its analysis of intrinsic value in nature. In *Les philosophies de l'environnement* (Paris, Presses universitaires de France, 1997), p. 27, p. 29, p. 30.

Catherine Larrère (Philosophy, Université Michel de Montaigne, Bordeaux III, France) and Raphaël Larrère (Agronomy, Director of Research, Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique (INRA), France) cite Rolston's *Conserving Natural Value* for its concept intrinsic value in nature. In *Du bon usage de la nature. Pour une philosophie de l'environnement (On the Good Use of Nature: Toward a Philosophy of the Environment)* (Paris: Aubier, 1997), citation on p. 240, p. 340.

Leena Vilkkä (Philosophy, University of Helsinki) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In *The Intrinsic Value of Nature* (Amsterdam & Atlanta: Rodopi, 1997), p. 79, p. 129.

Markku Oksanen (Philosophy, University of Turku, Finland) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its discussion of biodiversity. In "The Moral Value of Biodiversity," *Ambio* (Royal Swedish Academy of Sciences)26 (no. 8, Dec. 1997):541-545, citation on pp. 544-545.

Rick O'Neil (Philosophy, Transylvania University, Lexington, KY) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its claims about objective, intrinsic value in nature. In "Intrinsic Value, Moral Standing, and Species," *Environmental Ethics* 19(1997):45-52, citation on p. 49.

Stan Godlovitch (Philosophy, Human Sciences, Lincoln University, Canterbury, New Zealand) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its discussion of value in nature. In "Evaluating Nature Aesthetically," *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 65(1998):113-125, citation on p. 124.

Markku Oksanen (Philosophy, University of Turku, Finland) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its argument about how natural values underlie cultural and economic values. In *Nature as Property: Environmental Ethics and the Institution of Ownership* (Turku, Finland: Reports from the Department of Practical Philosophy, University of Turku, Volume 10, 1998), citation on p. 44, p. 212.

Viriato Soromenho-Marques (Philosophy and Law, University of Lisbon, Portugal) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In *O Futuro Frágil: Os desafios da crise global do ambiente (The Fragile Future: The Challenges of the Global Environmental Crisis)* (Mira-Sintra, Lisbon, Portugal: Publicações Europa-América, Lda, 1998), citation on p. 140, p. 222.

Michael P. Nelson (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "An Amalgamation of Wilderness Preservation Arguments," pages 154-198 in J. Baird Callicott and Michael P. Nelson, eds., *The Great New Wilderness Debate* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1998), citation on p. 184, p. 197.

Richard B. Primack (Biology, Boston University) cites *Conserving Natural Value*: "A leading environmental philosopher lays out the ethical arguments for preserving biological diversity. In *Essentials of Conservation Biology*, 2nd ed. (Sunderland, MA: Sinauer Associates, Publishers, 1998), citations on p. 126, p. 127, p. 129, p. 135, p. 143.

Christopher Preston (Philosophy, University of Oregon, University of Montana) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Epistemology and Intrinsic Values: Norton and Callicott's Critiques of Rolston," *Environmental Ethics* 20(1998):409-429, citations on p. 411, p. 413, p. 416.

Clare Palmer (Philosophy, University of Stirling, UK) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In *Environmental Ethics* (Santa-Barbara, CA: ABC-CLIO, 1997), p. 42, pp. 56-57, pp. 94-94, p. 109 (for its arguments about intrinsic value in and the conservation of wilderness), p. 160, also cf. p. 143, p. 180.

Peter B. Moyle (Wildlife, Fish, and Conservation Biology, University of California, Davis) and Petrea R. Moyle (Natural Heritage Institute, San Francisco) cite *Conserving Natural Value*. "The best arguments for protection of biodiversity, from our perspective, are the ethical and moral arguments ... e.g. Rolston 1994). Ultimately, if these arguments do not prevail, much of the world's biodiversity is likely to be lost." In "Endangered Fishes and Economics: Intergenerational Obligations," *Environmental Biology of Fishes* 43(no. 1, 1995):29-37, citation on p. 30, p. 37.

Thomas N. Gladwin, James J. Kennelly, and Tara-Shelomith Krause (Global Environment Program, School of Business, New York University) cite *Conserving Natural Value* for its analysis of the full range of values residing in nature, including the primary value of aggregate life-support services provided by the entire natural system. In "Shifting Paradigms for Sustainable Development: Implications for Management Theory and Research," *Academy of Management Review* 20(1995):874-907, citation on p. 893, p. 905.

Ronald E. Purser (Organization Development, Loyola University, Chicago), Changkil Park (Organization Behavior, Case Western Reserve University) and Alfonso Montuori (Systems Science, Saybrook Institute and College of Notre Dame, San Francisco) cite *Conserving Natural Value* for its account of how a responsibility for preserving the health of the land has become a major concern. In "Limits to Anthropocentrism: Toward an Ecocentric Organization Paradigm?" *Academy of Management Review* 20(1995):1053-1089, citation on p. 1070, p. 1071, p. 1073.

Louis P. Pojman (Philosophy, United States Military Academy, West Point) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its concept of biotic community. In *Global Environmental Ethics* (Mountain View, CA: Mayfield Publishing Co., 2000), p. 325.

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, College of Charleston) and Bill Throop (Philosophy and Environmental Studies, Green Mountain College, Poultney, VT) cite *Conserving Natural Value* for its discussion of stability, integrity, and change in ecosystems. In "Refocusing Ecocentrism: De-emphasizing Stability and Defending Wilderness," *Environmental Ethics* 21(1999):3-21, citation on p. 7. p. 12, p. 13.

Sahotra Sarkar (Philosophy, University of Texas, Austin) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Wilderness Preservation and Biodiversity Conservation--Keeping Divergent Goals Distinct," *BioScience* 49(1999):405-412, citation on p. 407, p. 412.

Yu Mouchang (Institute of Philosophy, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Beijing) cites *Conserving Natural Value* and the work of Rolston in environmental ethics as one of the leading figures in the West, devoting a section to the exegesis and evaluation of Rolston's work. In *Xinshiji Xinshijiao (Eco-Ethics--from Theory to Practice)* (Beijing: Shengtai Lunlixue, 1999), citations on pp. 46-52, passim.

Malcolm A. Jeeves (Neuro-psychology, University of St. Andrews) and R. W. Berry (Genetics, University of London) cite *Conserving Natural Value*. In *Science, Life, and Christian Belief* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1998), p. 228, p. 296.

Theodore W. Nunez (Philosophy and Religious Studies, Villanova University) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In *Holmes Rolston, Bernard Lonergan, and the Foundations of Environmental Ethics*, Ph.D. dissertation, 1999, Catholic University of America, Washington. This is published (in part) as:
"Rolston, Lonergan, and the Intrinsic Value of Nature," *Journal of Religious Ethics* 27 (no. 1, Spring, 1999):105-128.

Bryan G. Norton (Philosophy, Georgia Institute of Technology) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Biodiversity and Environmental Values: In Search of a Universal Earth Ethic," *Biodiversity and Conservation* 9(2000):1029-1044, citation on p. 1030, p. 1044.

Theodore Nunez (Center for Ethics, Villanova University) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its discussion of relevant differences between nature and culture. In "Can a Christian Environmental Ethic Go Wild? Evaluating Ecotheological Responses to the Wilderness Debate," pages 329-348 in John Kelsey and Sumner B. Twiss, eds., *The Annual of the Society of Christian Ethics* (Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 2000), citations on p. 332, p. 333, p. 345.

Michael P. Nelson (Philosophy, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Aldo Leopold, Environmental Ethics, and the Land Ethic," *Wildlife Society Bulletin* 26(no. 4, 1998):741-744, citation on p. 741, p. 744.

Arthur H. Westing (Westing Associates in Environment, Security and Education, Putney, VT) cites *Conserving Natural Value* as a book helping to formulate core environmental values. In "Core Values for Sustainable Development," *Environmental Conservation* 23(no. 3, 1996):218-225, citation on p. 218, p. 225.

Michael Samways (Zoology, University of Natal, South Africa) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In

"The Art of Unintelligent Tinkering," *Conservation Biology* 10(1996):1307.

Nicholas Agar (Philosophy, Victoria University, Wellington, New Zealand) repeatedly cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In *Life's Intrinsic Value: Science, Ethics, and Nature* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001), citations on pp. 67-68, p. 87, pp. 133-134, p. 136, p. 175, p. 178, p. 179, p. 181.

Bryan G. Norton (School of Public Policy, Georgia Institute of Technology) cites *Conserving Natural Value*, criticizing Rolston's objectivist epistemology. In "Objectivity, Intrinsicity and Sustainability: Comment on Nelson's 'Health and Disease as "Thick" Concepts in Ecosystemic Contexts,'" *Environmental Values* 4(1995):323-332, citation on p. 328.

Philip Cafaro (Philosophy, Colorado State University) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its accounts of wilderness and intrinsic value in nature. In "For a Grounded Conception of Wilderness and More Wilderness on the Ground," *Ethics and the Environment* 6(2001):1-17, citations on p. 7, p. 9, p. 11, p. 14, p. 15, p. 17.

Mikael Stenmark (Theology, Uppsala University, Sweden) features Rolston's position in *Conserving Natural Value* as one of four leading philosophers who have major importance for environmental decision making. In *Environmental Ethics and Policy Making* (Aldershot, UK: Ashgate, 2001), citations passim.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of North Texas, Denton) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its analysis of intrinsic value in nature. In "Multicultural Environmental Ethics," *Daedalus: Journal of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences* 130(no. 4, Fall 2001):77-97, citation on p. 89, p. 96.

Maria José Varandas Martins da Silva cites *Conserving Natural Value* and Rolston's value theory as the basis of her analysis. In *O Valor da Natureza: Caminhos para uma Ética Ecocentrada (Values in Nature: Toward an Ecocentric Morality)*. Faculdade de Letras da Universidade Clássica de Lisboa, 2000. M. A. thesis, University of Lisbon. In Portuguese. Citations passim.

Viriato Soromenho-Marques (Philosophy, University of Lisbon, Portugal) cites *Conserving Natural Value* in a select bibliography. In Domingos Moura, Francisco Ferereira, Francisco Nunes Correia, Gonçalo Ribeiro Telles, and Viriato Soromenho-Marques, *Ecologia e Ideologia (Ecology and Ideology)* (Lisboa: Livros e Leituras, 1999), citation on p. 141.

Craig L. Shafer (The George Wright Society, Hancock, MI) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its analysis of the concept of the "natural" as applied to park management policy. In "The Northern Yellowstone Elk Debate: Policy, Hypothesis, and Implications," *Natural Areas Journal* 20(no. 4, 2000):342-359, citation on p. 344.

Bill Throop (Green Mountain College, Vermont) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its analysis of the concept of the wild. "Rolston (1994) contains an excellent discussion of different senses in which humans are, and are not, parts of nature." In "Humans and the Value of the Wild," *Human Ecology Review* 3(no. 1, 1996):3-7, citations on p. 6, p. 7.

Jan Wawrzyniak (Philosophy, Adam Mickiewicz University, Poznan, Poland) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In *Teoretyczne podstawy neonaturalistycznej bioetyki środowiskowej (The Theoretical Foundations of Neonaturalistic Environmental Bioethics)*, Wydawnictwo Naukowe IF UAM (IF UAM Publishers), Poznań, 2000), citations passim.

Mikael Stenmark (Theology, Uppsala University, Uppsala, Sweden) analyses Rolston's position, especially in *Conserving Natural Value*, as one of the principal figures studied. In *Environmental Ethics and Policy Making* (London: Ashgate, 2002), citations passim. Previously published in Swedish.

Philip Cafaro (Philosophy, Colorado State University) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Thoreau's Virtue Ethics in *Walden*," *The Concord Saunterer*. N.S. (Journal of the Thoreau Society) 8(2000):23-47, citation on p. 47.

Michael Samways (Zoology, University of Natal, South Africa) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "A Conceptual Model of Ecosystem Restoration Triage Based on Experiences from Three Remote Oceanic Islands," *Biodiversity and Conservation* 9(2000):1073-1083, citation on p. 1077, p. 1082.

Theresa Satterfield (Decision Research, Eugene, Oregon) cites *Conserving Natural Value* on intrinsic value in nature, using Rolston's taxonomy of values in nature as a coding framework to organize her survey instrument and to classify her research results analyzing what kinds of values persons hold, and how these values can be better elicited. In "In Search of Value Literacy: Suggestions for the Elicitation of Environmental Values," *Environmental Values* 10(2001):331-359, citations on p. 333, pp. 340-342, p. 345, p. 347, p. 349, p. 352, p. 358.

Mark Woods (Philosophy, University of Dan Diego) and Paul Veatch Moriarty (Philosophy, Longwood University) cite *Conserving Natural Value* on exotic species, especially feral mustangs. In "Strangers in a Strange Land: The Problem of Exotic Species," *Environmental Values* 10(2002):163-191, citation on p. 173, p. 190.

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, College of Charleston) cites *Conserving Natural Value* on exotic species, especially feral mustangs, also on nature returning and naturalizing. In "Exotic Species, Naturalisation, and Biological Nativism," *Environmental Values* 10(2001):193-224, citations on pp. 196-198, p. 203, p. 211, p. 222, p. 224.

Piers H.G. Stephens, (Politics and Philosophy, Manchester Metropolitan University) cites *Conserving Natural Value* in a discussion of the extent of naturalness remaining on Earth after extensive human occupation. In "Nature, Purity, Ontology," *Environmental Values* 9(2000):267-294, citation on p. 269, p. 289.

Paul Gimeno has an extensive review of *Conserving Natural Value*. "Éthique environnementale, valeur, anthropocentrisme et démocratie (Environmental Ethics, Value, and Democracy)," *Critique: Revue generale des publications francaises et etrangeres* (Paris) 54(no. 612, 1998):225-245, citations passim. Rolston's position can be used effectively to criticize three deadly assumptions widely held in Europe concerning environmental ethics: that it is necessarily founded on a naturalistic theory of value, that it reduces the value of human beings to that of other animals, and that environmental ethics implies a politics that contradicts modern democratic political theory. In French.

J. Baird Callicott (Philosophy, University of North Texas) cites and quotes from *Conserving Natural Value* on intrinsic value in nature and its effectiveness in conservation policy. In "The Pragmatic Power and Promise of Theoretical Environmental Ethics: Forging a New Discourse," *Environmental Values* 11(no. 1, 2002):3-25, citations on p. 11, p. 25.

Wayne Ouderkirk (Empire State College, SUNY, Cobleskill, NY) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Mindful of the Earth: A Bibliographical Essay on Environmental Philosophy," *The Centennial*

Review (College of Arts and Letters, Michigan State University) 42(no. 1, Winter, 1998):353-392, citations on pp. 362-363.

Friedrich Valjavec cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Sesshafte Jäger, akkulturierte Sammler, Zur Cambridge-Enzyklopädie zeitgenössischer Wildbeuter (Sedentary Hunters, Acculturated Gatherers, Cambridge Encyclopedia of Contemporary Hunter-Gatherers)", *Anthropos* (International Review of Anthropology and Linguistics, Anthropos Institut) 96(no. 1, 2001):207-217, citation on p. 215, p. 217.

Robert L. Chapman (Philosophy and Religious Studies, Pace University, New York) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "The Goat-stag and the Sphinx: The *Place* of the Virtues in Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Values* 11(2002):129-144, citation on pp. 135-136, p. 142, p. 144.

Rudolf Kolarsky (Filosoficky ustav AC CR [Philosophical Institute, Academy of Sciences, Czech Republic], Prague) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Sblizovani antropocentrickych a neantropocentrickych koncepci filosofie zivotniho prostredi (Reconciling the Anthropocentric and Non-anthropocentric Concepts of the Environmental Philosophy)," *Filosoficky Casopis* (*Philosophical Journal*) 48(2000):717-729, citations on p. 725, p. 728.

Mark Rowlands (Philosophy, University of Ireland, Cork) cites *Conserving Natural Value*, on the concept of intrinsic value in nature. In *The Environmental Crisis: Understanding the Value of Nature* (Basingstoke, Hampshire: Macmillan Press; New York: St. Martins, 2000), citations on p. 12, p. 33, p. 35, p. 42, p. 44, p. 45, pp. 47-49, pp. 140-141, p. 155, pp. 179-181.

Finn Arler (Philosophy, Arhus University, Denmark) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its taxonomy of values in nature. In "Aspects of Landscape or Nature Quality," *Landscape Ecology* 15(2000):291-302.

David Hulse and Robert Ribe (Landscape Architecture, University of Oregon, Eugene) cite *Conserving Natural Value* as an example of how "providing the theoretical and empirical basis for ... evaluations of ecological worth may require considerable advances in accepted ecological science and philosophy." In "Land Conversion and the Production of Wealth," *Ecological Applications* 10(no. 3, 2000):679-682, citation on p. 680, p. 682.

Peter Landres, Shannon Meyer (both: Aldo Leopold Wilderness Research Institute, Rocky Mountain Research Station, USDA Forest Service, Missoula, MT), and Sue Matthews (Arthur Carhart National Wilderness Training Center, US Fish and Wildlife Service, Missoula, MT) cite *Conserving Natural Value* on wilderness values. In "The Wilderness Act and Fish Stocking: An Overview of Legislation, Judicial Interpretation, and Agency Implementation," *Ecosystems* 4(2002)287-295, citation on p. 288, p. 295.

David Pearce (Economics, University College, London and University of East Anglia) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "The Political Economy of the Global Environment," *Scottish Journal of Political Economy* 44(no. 4, 1997):462-483.

Robert J. Phillips (Business, Georgetown University) and Joel Reichart (Business, Fordham University) cite *Conserving Natural Value* on the values that exist in nature apart from humans. In "The Environment as a Stakeholder? A Fairness-Based Approach," *Journal of Business Ethics* 23(2000):185-197, citation on p. 194, p. 197.

Christopher Southgate (Theology, University of Exeter, UK), Celia Deane-Drummond (Theology, University College, Chester, UK), Paul D. Murray (Theology, Newman College, Birmingham, UK), Michael Robert Negus (Biology, Newman College, Birmingham), Lawrence Osborn (Astronomy, Ridley Hall, Cambridge, UK), Michael Poole (Education, King's College, London), Jacqui Stewart (Theology and Biology, University of Leeds, UK), and Fraser Watts (Theology and the Natural Sciences, University of Cambridge, UK) cite *Conserving Natural Value* on intrinsic value in nature. In *God, Humanity and the Cosmos* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1999, and Harrisburg, PA: Trinity International, 1999), citation on p. 240, p. 425.

Deborah G. Martin (Geography, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its theory of intrinsic value in nature. In "Transcending the Fixity of Jurisdictional Scale," *Political Geography* 18(1999):33-38, citation on p. 36, p. 38.

Christopher J. Preston (Philosophy, University of South Carolina, now University of Montana) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its taxonomy of values in nature. In *Grounding Knowledge: Environmental Philosophy, Epistemology, and Place* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2003), citations on pp. 114-116, p. 144, p. 153.

Richard B. Primack (Biology, Boston University) and Philip J. Cafaro (Philosophy, Colorado State University) cite *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Environmental Ethics," pages 545-55 in Levin, Simon Asher, *Encyclopedia of Biodiversity* (San Diego: Academic Press [Harcourt], 2001).

Eccy de Jonge cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In *Spinoza and Deep Ecology: Challenging Traditional Approaches to Environmentalism* (Aldershot, Hants., UK: Ashgate, 2004), citations on p. 17, p. 18, p. 31, p. 158.

Millennium Assessment Board, *Ecosystems and Human Well-Being: A Framework for Assessment* (Washington, DC: Island Press, 2003) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its arguments about intrinsic value in nature, citation on p. 143, p. 231. This work is a program launched by the U.N. Secretary-General and co-ordinated by the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP).

Robert Chapman (Philosophy, Pace University) cites *Conserving Natural Value* and complains that Rolston inadequately distinguishes between wilderness and wildness. In "Crowded Solitude: Thoreau on Wildness," *Environmental Philosophy* 1 (no. 1, Spring 2004):58-72, citations on pp. 60-61, p. 67.

Tomislav Markus (Kroatisches Institut für Geschichte, Zagreb, Croatia) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Ekoloska etika -- razvoj, mogućnosti, ograničenja (Environmental Ethics, Development, Possibilities, Limitations)," *Socijalna Ekologija (Journal for Environmental Thought and Sociological Research)* (Zagreb, Croatia) 13 (no. 1, 2004):1-23, citations on p. 7 (in Croatian).

Lisa H. Sideris (School of Environment and Faculty of Religious Studies, McGill University, Montreal) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In *Environmental Ethics, Ecological Theology, and Natural Selection* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003), citations passim.

Workineh Kelbessa (Philosophy, Addis Ababa University, Ethiopia) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Environmental Ethics in Theory and Practical Application," *Ethiopian Journal of the Social Sciences and Humanities* 1 (no. 1, December 2003):63-88, citations passim, esp. p. 87.

David W. Kidner (Humanities, Philosophy, Nottingham Trent University, UK) cites *Conserving Natural Value* on the "sad truth" that human culture must sacrifice some nature. In "Industrialism

and the Fragmentation of Temporal Structure," *Environmental Ethics* 26(2004):135-153, citation on pp. 146-146.

Terre Satterfield (Institute for Resources and Environmental Sustainability, University of British Columbia, Vancouver) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its arguments about anthropocentric versus biocentric morality. In "Emotional Agency and Contentious Practice: Activist Disputes in Old-Growth Forests," *Ethos* (American Anthropological Association) 32 (no. 2, 2004):233-256, citation on p. 248.

Roberto Peverelli cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Un'etica della terra. La riflessione filosofica di Holmes Rolston, III, [The Land Ethic: Philosophical Reflections of Holmes Rolston, III]," *Aut Aut: rivista di filosofia e di cultura*, Issue 316-317, July-October, 2003, pages 116-138, citations on pp. 124-130, and *passim*.

Cathy Driscoll (Management, Sobey School of Business, Saint Mary's University, Halifax, Nova Scotia) and Mark Starik (Strategic Management and Public Policy, George Washington University School of Business and Public Management, Washington) cite *Conserving Natural Value* for its analysis of sustainability. In "The Primordial Stakeholder: Advancing the Conceptual Consideration of Stakeholder Status for the Natural Environment," *Journal of Business Ethics* 49(# 1, 2004):55-73, citation on p. 61, p. 72.

Ben A. Minteer, Elizabeth A. Corley, and Robert E. Manning (Human Dimensions of Biology Faculty, School of Life Sciences, Arizona State University, Tempe) cite *Conserving Natural Value*, disliking Rolston's emphasis on intrinsic value in nature, in favor of a more pragmatic and contextually applied environmental ethics. In "Environmental Ethics Beyond Principle? The Case for a Pragmatic Contextualism," *Journal of Agricultural and Environmental Ethics* 17(2004):131-156, citation on p. 134, p. 156.

Neil E. West (Forest, Range, and Wildlife Sciences, Utah State University, Logan) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Theoretical Underpinnings of Rangeland Monitoring," *Arid Land Research and Management* 17(no. 4, 2003):333-346, citation on p. 336, p. 345.

J. E. Eggleston (Philosophy and Religious Studies, University of Canterbury, Christchurch, New Zealand) and S. S. Rixecker (Environment, Society and Design Division, Lincoln University, Christchurch, NZ) and G. J. Hickling (Fisheries and Wildlife, Michigan State University, East Lansing) cite *Conserving Natural Value* for its philosophical development of Aldo Leopold's land ethic. In "The Role of Ethics in the Management of New Zealand's Wild Mammals," *New Zealand Journal of Zoology* 30(2003):361-376, p. 362, p. 375.

Hilary Tovey (Sociology, Trinity College, Dublin) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Theorising Nature and Society in Sociology: The Invisibility of Animals," *Sociology Ruralis* (European Society for Rural Sociology) 34(no. 3, 2003):196-215, citation on p. 197, p. 215.

John Hart (Theology, Carroll College, Helena, Montana) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. Rolston offers "particularly helpful insights" "in the area of environmental ethics [that] affirm[s] the intrinsic value of all species." In "Salmon and Social Ethics: Relational Consciousness in the Web of Life," *Journal of the Society of Christian Ethics* 22(2002):67-93, citations on p. 83, p. 84, p. 85, p. 86, p. 87.

Michael Ruse (Philosophy, Florida State University) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In

"Stewardship for the Earth: A Review of Some Recent Books on Biology and Values," *BioScience* 53(no. 9, 2003):876-879, citation p. 879.

Tyler Cowen (Political Economy, George Mason University, Fairfax, Va) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its arguments that predation should be judged on ecological, not moral terms. In "Policing Nature," *Environmental Ethics* 25(2003):169-182, citation on p. 180.

J. Claude Evans (Philosophy, Philosophy, Environmental Studies, Washington University, St. Louis) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In *With Respect for Nature: Living as Part of the Natural World* (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2005), citation on p. 269.

David Strong (Philosophy, Rocky Mountain College, Billings, Montana) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Environmental Ethics," in Carl Mitcham, ed., *Encyclopedia of Science, Technology, and Ethics* (Farmington, MA: Macmillan Reference, USA, Thomson/Gale, 2005), vol. 2, pp. 653-661, citations on p. 657, p. 660.

Bryan G. Norton (Philosophy, Public Policy, Georgia Institute of Technology) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In *Searching for Sustainability: Interdisciplinary Essays in the Philosophy of Conservation Biology* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), citations on p. 317, p. 454.

Hanna Siurua (Lancaster University, UK) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Nature above People: Rolston and 'Fortress' Conservation in the South," *Ethics and the Environment* 11(no. 1, 2006):71-96, citations passim.

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, Charleston College, South Carolina) cites *Conserving Natural Value* on the question of wilderness and rural nature. In "Respecting Nature's Autonomy in Relationship with Humanity." Pages 86-98 in Thomas Heyd, ed., *Recognizing the Autonomy of Nature: Theory and Practice* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005), citations on pp. 88-89, p. 98.

Mark Woods (Philosophy, University of San Diego) cites *Conserving Natural Value* in "Ecological Restoration and the Renewal of Wilderness and Freedom." Pages 170-188 in Thomas Heyd, ed., *Recognizing the Autonomy of Nature: Theory and Practice* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005), citations on p. 173, p. 182, p. 184, p. 185, p. 187.

Andrew Light (Applied Philosophy Group, New York University) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Contemporary Environmental Ethics: From Metaethics to Public Philosophy," *Metaphilosophy* 33(no. 3, 2002):426-449, citations on p. 428, p. 432, p. 433, p. 449.

Mikael Stenmark (Theology, University of Uppsala, Sweden) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "The Relevance of Environmental Ethical Theories for Policy Making," *Environmental Ethics* 24(2002):135-148, citations on p. 142, p. 144, p. 145, p. 146.

Theresa Satterfield (Decision Research, Eugene, Oregon) uses the taxonomy of values in nature in *Conserving Natural Value* to build a survey instrument polling for citizens' environmental values. In "In Search of Value Literacy: Suggestions for the Elicitation of Environmental Values," *Environmental Values* 10(2001):331-359, citations on pp. 340-350 passim, p. 358.

Deborah J. Shields (Rocky Mountain Research Station, USDA Forest Service, Fort Collins, CO) and E. T. Bartlett (Rangeland Ecosystem Science, Colorado State University) cite *Conserving Natural Value* for its discussion of types of natural value. In "Applicability of Montreal Process Criterion 6 -

Long-term Socio-economic benefits - to Rangeland Sustainability," *International Journal of Sustainable Development and World Ecology* 9(no. 2, 2002):95-120, citations on p. 104, p. 108, p. 117.

Paul Moriarty (Philosophy, Webster University, St. Louis) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Nature Naturalized: A Darwinian Defense of the Nature/Culture Distinction," *Environmental Ethics* 29(2007):227-246, citation on p. 237.

Marti Kheel (Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley, CA) has a chapter, "The Ecophilosophy of Holmes Rolston III" in *Nature Ethics: An Ecofeminist Perspective* (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 2008), pp. 137-162, including citations of Rolston's *Conserving Natural Value*.

Sung-Hae Kim (Religious Studies, Sogang University and Seton Research Center, Seoul, Korea) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "The Immortal World: The *Telos* of Daoist Environmental Ethics," *Environmental Ethics* 30(2008):133-157. citations on p. 141, p. 155.

Dale Jamieson (Philosophy, New York University) cites *Conserving Natural Value* for its types of value in nature. In "The Rights of Animals and the Demands of Nature," *Environmental Values* 17(2008):181-199, citation on p. 188, p. 199.

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, College of Charleston) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In "Animal Beauty, Ethics, and Environmental Preservation," *Environmental Ethics* 32(2010):115-134, citation on p. 132.

Anna Case-Winters (Theology, McCormick Theological Seminary) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In *Reconstructing a Christian Theology of Nature: Down to Earth*. Aldershot: Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing, 2007. Citation on pp, 59-60..

Ned Hettinger (Philosophy, College of Charleston, South Carolina) cites *Conserving Natural Value* on nature restoration. In "Nature Restoration as a Paradigm for the Human Relationship with Nature," pages 27-46 in Allen Thompson and Jeremy Bendik-Keymer, eds., *Ethical Adaptation to Climate Change: Human Virtues of the Future* (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 2012), citations on p.36, p. 46.

Berry Crawford (Western Washington University, Bellingham, WA) has a section on "Holmes Rolston on Ecosystems," in *Ethics for Environmental Policy: An Integrated, Life-Centered Approach* (San Diego, CA: Cognella Academic Publishing, 2013), pp. 97-97. He cites Rolston 32 times, including *Conserving Natural Value*.

Gary Steiner (Philosophy, Bucknell University) cites and quotes *Conserving Natural Value*, in *Animals and the Moral Community: Mental Life, Moral Status, and Kinship* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2008), citations on pp 127-129, p. 199.

Mark Woods (Philosophy, University of San Diego) cites *Conserving Natural Value*. In *Rethinking Wilderness* (Peterborough, Ontario, Canada and Tonawanda, NY: Broadview Press, 2017), citation on p. 291.

Anders Melin (Ethics, Department of Global Political Studies, Malmö University, Sweden) cites *Conserving Natural Value* on preserving endangered species. In "Protection of Threatened Species in the Anthropocene," pages 253-265 in Celia Deane-Drummond, Sigurd Bergman and Markkus Vogt, eds., *Religion in the Anthropocene* (Eugene Oregon: Cascade Books, Wipf and Stock, 2017),

citation on p. 255.