

Mary Anglemeyer and Eleanor R. Seagraves, comps. *The Natural Environment: An Annotated Bibliography on Attitudes and Values*. Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1984. 268 pages. \$25, hardcover.

This bibliography is a companion to an initial bibliography published five years earlier and is much more ample than the earlier volume. Since it does not repeat references from its forerunner, both are needed for completeness. The earlier work, Mary Anglemeyer, Eleanor R. Seagraves, and Catherine C. LeMaistres, comps., *The Search for an Environmental Ethics: An Initial Bibliography* (Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1980), has been reprinted and is available. It was reviewed in *Environmental Ethics* 4 (1982): 89-91. The initial bibliography contains 446 entries; this one brings the total to 1303. An essential feature of both is a paragraph annotating each entry so that the reader can tell from the description whether a reference is likely to be worth pursuing.

Entries are organized topically, under major headings such as "Civilization," "Economics," "Philosophy and Religion," "Politics and Government," etc., subdivided respectively into subheadings such as "Life-Styles," "Native Americans," "Business and Industry," "Economic Growth," "Animal Rights," "Citizen Participation," "Economic Development," etc. A combined author and detailed subject index makes access to works cited easier. No attempt is made to be comprehensive in such areas; rather the goal is to select references that bear directly or indirectly on value questions. From more comprehensive or technical works, chapters or sections that address this issue are indicated. The second bibliography makes more effort than did the first to include entries dealing with environmental values in economics business, and government. Although the environmentalist sympathies of the compilers are evident, they make every attempt to include all shades of opinion, and the result is an objective bibliography.

The initial bibliography was criticized rather severely for omissions. It was inadequate in the literature of environmental philosophy, much better by contrast with its attention to religious writers on the environment. The authors have taken that neglect seriously and have consulted several philosophers working in the field (Mark Sagoff, Bryan Norton, and myself, among others) with the result that the new bibliography is greatly improved philosophically. These two bibliographies, taken together, are as good as anything in print as an introductory list of the literature on environmental ethics.

There are still problems. One problem results from the decision to enter certain periodicals by title as single entries, with no effort to detail particular articles that have appeared in them, as for instance with *Environmental Ethics* (#653), the *Journal of Environmental Education* (#510), or *Environmental Conservation* (#216). This sounds reasonable and efficient in a bibliography that already runs over eight hundred entries, until one realizes that such journals contain many of the leading articles in the field. Thus, the 107 articles appearing in volumes 1-5 of

Environmental Ethics all pass invisibly by the reader, hidden behind a single entry. Selected articles were isolated for entry from other periodicals (for example, *The Ecologist*, *Nature Conservancy News*, *Audubon*, *Wilderness*) and, though the zealous reader can find the invisible articles by pursuing such single entries, the less thorough user cannot here find a good representative list of the titles in the field. A result, for instance, is that the name of J. Baird Callicott does not appear in either volume, though he is one of the more influential philosophers on the subject. Another result is that the section on philosophy (pp. 189–204), short of unpacking such compacted references, still leaves one only halfway introduced to the field. A remedy for this is to caution anyone interested in environmental philosophy to use this list only in conjunction with a search through the *Philosopher's Index*.

Another problem results from the timing of the bibliography. Every author faces deadlines; the cutoff point for entries in a work released in September 1984 must have been nine months to a year preceding. The authors do make considerable effort to list works that were forthcoming at the time of compilation. Perhaps it is simply unfortunate that some important volumes were issued about press time. In any case such works as Donald Scherer and Thomas Attig, eds., *Ethics and the Environment* (Prentice-Hall, 1983), or Robert Elliott and Aaran Gare, eds., *Environmental Philosophy* (Pennsylvania State University Press, 1983) or Robin Attfield, *The Ethics of Environmental Concern* (Columbia University Press, 1983) are missing, and these are principal works in the field. On the other hand, Tom Regan, ed., *Earthbound: New Introductory Essays in Environmental Ethics* is included (listed as forthcoming, #650), although it was not released until 1984. The periodical *Environmental Review* is regrettably omitted, as is J. Ronald Engel, *Sacred Sands: The Struggle for Community in the Indiana Dunes* (Wesleyan University Press, 1983).

These problems aside, there is more than enough material referenced here to make every reader humble about what he or she has so far left unread. Environmental philosophers who have not looked through these two bibliographies to see what they have neglected have not yet done all their homework. It will take this reviewer several months to run down and digest references of interest first found here. One thing this bibliography can do for readers of *Environmental Ethics* is to remind them—let philosophers take particular note—how much of the discussion about values in the natural environment goes on outside the province of academic philosophy. What the bibliography provides is not so much a complete current list for philosophers or other professionals, but rather proof of how widespread the interest is. Environmental ethics is quite evidently an interdisciplinary concern. That it is alive and well, both within philosophy and without, is more than amply documented here.

Although sponsored by the Global Tomorrow Coalition, for which we may be grateful, both this work and its predecessor were done with minimal funding. Mary Anglemeyer is a former librarian at the Woodrow Wilson International Center for

Scholars. She and Eleanor Seagraves, also a librarian, earlier worked with Barbara Ward's International Institute for Environment and Development. The senior editor has been retired for a decade and for both editors the work is largely a voluntary labor of love, as well as a commendable professional accomplishment.

Both of these bibliographies belong in every major library.

Holmes Rolston, III*

* Department of Philosophy, Colorado State University, Fort Collins, CO 80523.